1	
2	STATE OF NEW YORK PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
3	TODDIC SERVICE CORRIDSION
4	PUBLIC STATEMENT HEARING PROCEEDING ON MOTION OF THE COMMISSION TO EXAMINE
5	REPOWERING ALTERNATIVES TO UTILITY TRANSMISSION REINFORCEMENTS
6	KEINFORCEPIEN 15
7	CASE# 12-E-0577
8	
9	Monday, July 15, 2013 7:00
10	SUNY Fredonia Williams Center Multipurpose Room
11	280 Central Avenue Fredonia, New York
12	
13	A.L.J. KIMBERLY HARRIMAN Administrative Law Judge Three Empire State Plaza
14	Albany, New York 12223-1350
15	COMMISSIONER GREGG SAYRE
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 (The hearing commenced at 7:36
- 3 p.m.)
- 4 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: We're going to
- 5 go on the record now. I'm calling case 12E0577,
- 6 which is a case regarding the repowering
- 7 alternatives to utility transmission reinforcements
- 8 in the villages of Cayuga and Dunkirk.
- 9 Today this public statement
- 10 hearing will address specifically the question of
- 11 the repowering of the Dunkirk plant.
- My name is Kimberly Harriman.
- 13 I'm an administrative law judge with the New York
- 14 State Department of Public Service.
- And with me tonight I have a
- 16 Commissioner Sayre from the Public Service
- 17 Commission. And I'm going to turn it over to
- 18 Commissioner Sayre for a few brief remarks before
- 19 we proceed.
- 20 COMMISSIONER SAYRE: Hi. I'm
- 21 Greg Sayre and I live in Rochester, Monroe County.
- 22 And I'm pleased to be
- 23 representing Western New York on the Public Service
- 24 Commission to the extent that I can.
- Our standard in this case is what

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 is in the public interest and as you've heard, it's
- 3 a very complicated case with a lot of economics,
- 4 very difficult to model. But one of the factors
- 5 that goes into the public interest is what does the
- 6 public think the public interest is. That's what
- 7 I'm here for tonight to hear from you. And, I look
- 8 forward to your remarks.
- 9 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Thank you,
- 10 Commissioner Sayre.
- 11 So that we're clear, the comments
- 12 received tonight are going to be transcribed and
- 13 posted to the Public Service Commission's web site
- 14 under this docket, along with all the other public
- 15 documents that have been filed to date in this
- 16 case.
- 17 That transcript will then be made
- 18 available to the members of the Public Service
- 19 Commission such as Commissioner Sayre for their
- 20 deliberation as they proceed to resolution of this
- 21 case.
- The way we do the transcript
- 23 tonight is through an audio recording. So I'm
- 24 going to ask that each of you please clearly state
- 25 your name and speak slowly into the microphone and

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 loudly, not only for the benefit of the transcript,
- 3 for also the benefit of all of the folks who are up
- 4 at the back of the room, as well upstairs in the
- 5 dias.
- 6 I'm going to call the first five
- 7 names. We have over eighty speakers who have
- 8 signed up to speak tonight. We got a late start.
- 9 And I want every single person to be able to be
- 10 heard, so I'm going to try to ask you to limit your
- 11 comments to two minutes in duration.
- If we get more time, we're all
- 13 here till eleven o'clock tonight or later. We want
- 14 to hear from you. And like Commissioner Sayre, I
- was born and raised in Buffalo and I have family
- 16 out in this region. So I think that's why I got
- 17 nominated to come down here and I'm happy to return
- 18 home for this.
- Okay. I'm going to call the
- 20 first five people just to let you know so you can
- 21 get prepared. We're going to have Senator Cathy
- 22 Young, Assemblyman Andrew Goodell, Anthony J.
- 23 Dolce, Gary Cerne and Ron Johnson.
- Those are the first five and
- 25 we're going to go with Senator Young first.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Senator, if you'd please take the
- 3 podium?
- 4 SENATOR YOUNG: Good evening.
- 5 I'm Senator Cathy -- Catherine Young and I
- 6 represent the Fifty-seventh Senate District, which
- 7 includes this region.
- 8 There are many people to thank
- 9 including SUNY Fredonia president Virginia Horvath
- 10 (phonetic spelling) and her team for their
- 11 hospitality, the university police, state troopers
- 12 and sheriff's deputies for providing security.
- We especially welcome
- 14 Commissioner Sayre. Thank you so much for being
- 15 here to get public interest and public input.
- I also sincerely thank
- 17 Administrative Law Judge, the Honorable Kim
- 18 Harriman for being here and also extend my deepest
- 19 gratitude to the Public Service Commission for its
- 20 responsiveness and concern, for gaining citizen
- 21 input by holding this public hearing.
- You see and you will hear from
- 23 the people most affected by your upcoming decision;
- 24 senior citizens living on fixed incomes who already
- 25 are struggling to buy their groceries and pay their

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 taxes, school children who need and deserve quality
- 3 education, mothers and fathers who need to keep
- 4 their jobs to support their families, police
- 5 officers and firemen who want to be able to
- 6 continue protecting the community, teachers who
- 7 devote their lives to helping students learn, job
- 8 seekers who are looking for the opportunity to work
- 9 on an incredible construction project, leaders of
- 10 industry who need a stable tax base and reliable
- 11 and cost-effective energy so they can continue to
- 12 provide jobs here, small business owners who want
- 13 to grow our economy, even the little league showed
- 14 up.
- These are our families, our
- 16 friends, and our neighbors who are here because
- 17 they love their hometown and they care about our
- 18 future.
- 19 And I'd just like to ask the room
- 20 if you're here tonight in favor of repowering the
- 21 Dunkirk N.R.G. plant, please at least raise your
- 22 hands.
- I want the people here tonight to
- 24 know this is my proudest moment of the time I have
- 25 represented you. From the bottom of my heart I

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 want to thank you for coming together and being
- 3 here tonight. Your community needed your help and
- 4 here you are. It truly is your time to shine.
- 5 The possible loss of the N.R.G.
- 6 plant is devastating. It's a blow from which this
- 7 community would never recover. So much hangs in
- 8 the balance. What will Dunkirk and Chautauqua
- 9 County's future be?
- 10 Massive property tax hikes, the
- 11 annihilation of the school, deep and painful cuts
- in essential city services, such as fire and
- 13 police, private sector job losses, higher
- 14 electricity bills, reliance on out-of-state power.
- 15 Those are the very real consequences of the N.R.G.
- 16 plant closing.
- 17 Or we could have a stable tax
- 18 base, teachers kept on the job and our children
- 19 receiving the education that they need and deserve,
- 20 essential city services protected, existing jobs
- 21 secured and five hundred new construction jobs
- 22 added for three years while the new plant is being
- 23 built, cleaner air to breathe, lower electricity
- 24 bills and the expansion of our economy. Those are
- 25 the incredible outcomes of repowering the N.R.G.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 plant.
- 3 Many months ago I received a
- 4 frantic call from local leaders. The N.R.G. plant
- 5 was going to be mothballed and was in grave danger
- of closing for good. The impact on the community
- 7 was a forty million dollar loss in tax revenue,
- 8 wages and goods and services spent in local
- 9 businesses.
- N.R.G. is by far the largest
- 11 taxpayer in Chautauqua County, Dunkirk City School
- 12 Districts and the city of -- of Dunkirk. The
- 13 elimination of N.R.G.'s annual payment in lieu of
- 14 taxes currently at eight point two million dollars
- 15 per year has serious consequences for every county
- 16 property taxpayer and particularly for those who
- 17 live in Dunkirk.
- Dunkirk's residents are by no
- 19 means wealthy and in fact many people struggle
- 20 financially. According to the 2010 U.S. Census the
- 21 median income for households is thirty-three
- 22 thousand eight hundred and forty-nine dollars while
- 23 our poverty rate is twenty-five point eight
- 24 percent.
- 25 Property taxpayers already are

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 heavily overburdened. According to the tax
- 3 foundation Chautauqua County already pays the
- 4 eighth highest taxes in relation to the value of
- 5 its homes in the entire country.
- 6 Imagine school property taxes
- 7 exploding by another forty-seven percent and city
- 8 property taxes skyrocketing by forty-two percent to
- 9 make up for the loss from N.R.G. Add a countywide
- 10 property tax on top and it is a recipe for
- 11 disaster.
- 12 Our assessor says that the
- 13 average value of a home in Dunkirk is fifty
- 14 thousand dollars. Without the stable tax -- tax
- 15 base provided by N.R.G. taxes on the average value
- 16 home would have to spike by more than one
- 17 hundred -- or I'm sorry, one thousand dollars
- 18 annually to make up for the difference; something
- 19 folks simply cannot afford.
- 20 Recently I was speaking to a
- 21 senior citizen from Dunkirk and she's here tonight
- 22 with her husband. She said her current property
- 23 taxes are five thousand dollars annually. There's
- 24 not enough money left over from her fixed income to
- 25 buy groceries, so she is forced to go to the food

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 pantry to survive.
- 3 Her husband is having a hard time
- 4 dealing with what he calls taking handouts. As she
- 5 talked to me she began to sob, her shoulders
- 6 shaking in despair as she told me she did not know
- 7 what to do or where to turn.
- 8 Our residential taxpayers are not
- 9 the only ones concerned. Our economy has suffered
- in western New York, job losses, companies closing.
- 11 Dunkirk has seen it all. Enormous tax hikes -- tax
- 12 hikes threaten the viability of the manufacturers
- 13 and small businesses that we have left.
- We could lose many more jobs and
- 15 our economy will get even further behind. If taxes
- 16 are not raised to make up the loss tax base from
- 17 N.R.G., the school would be forced to lay off
- 18 fifty-eight teachers. That decimates the school.
- 19 Don't our children need and
- 20 deserve to have a quality education? The city of
- 21 Dunkirk would have to make deep cuts in essential
- 22 services. Fire employees may have to be
- 23 eliminated. Don't our people deserve to have
- 24 public protection?
- 25 Chautauqua County would have to

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 look at cutting non-mandated programs for the aging
- 3 and our veterans. Let me ask you don't our seniors
- 4 and those who made so many sacrifices to safeguard
- 5 our freedoms as Americans deserve to keep their
- 6 services?
- 7 All of the current jobs at the
- 8 power plant would be wiped out, taking away
- 9 families' livelihoods. We would lose our ability
- 10 to be energy independent by generating our own
- 11 power right here in western New York, which would
- 12 kneecap future job growth especially through
- 13 manufacturing.
- We would depend on dirty coal
- 15 power generated in another state, Pennsylvania, and
- 16 I'll get to that in a minute, exporting our jobs
- 17 and tax base.
- The solution, and in fact the
- 19 salvation, is to repower N.R.G. to a clean natural
- 20 gas plant. Repowering the Dunkirk station will
- 21 stabilize our tax base, save existing jobs, and put
- 22 five hundred New Yorkers to work for three years
- 23 while they build the plant, give us much cleaner
- 24 air to breathe, reduce energy costs for consumers
- 25 and ensure that our electrical system is safe and

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 reliable.
- 3 This year's final state budget
- 4 language agreed upon by Governor Cuomo, the senate
- 5 and the assembly, established certain requirements
- 6 when evaluating power generation including a
- 7 ratepayer cost, the environment, the economy
- 8 including temporary and permanent jobs, economic
- 9 development and tax revenue and electric market
- 10 competitiveness.
- The governor has shown great
- 12 leadership through his New York State Energy
- 13 Highway blueprint to upgrade the in-state
- 14 transmission super highway in order to move power
- from upstate plants like Dunkirk to meet growing
- 16 power needs downstate.
- 17 If we don't promote the continued
- 18 development of generation in the region, the energy
- 19 highway could be a bridge to nowhere. No one wants
- 20 to see this. And a repowered Dunkirk, together
- 21 with its ability to work in unison with wind in
- 22 western New York is a perfect match for the energy
- 23 highway.
- The N.R.G. project meets the
- 25 governor's energy highway goals to assure long-term

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 reliability as the electricity service system is
- 3 maintained, contribute to an environmentally
- 4 sustainable future for New York, encourage the
- 5 development of utility scale renewable generation,
- 6 create jobs for New Yorkers and provide projects
- 7 that connect western New York power to projects
- 8 downstate.
- 9 We are here tonight because it
- 10 has been determined that there is an energy
- 11 reliability need in western New York. There are
- 12 competing projects as we heard through N.R.G. and
- 13 National Grid. And as you know, the Public Service
- 14 Commission wild decide between the two.
- I have listened to National
- 16 Grid's presentation and I have to disagree with
- 17 much of what they said.
- In 2000 National Grid, a
- 19 foreign -- a foreign owned company from the United
- 20 Kingdom, bought out Niagara Mohawk, which was a
- 21 U.S. company which used to be one of our state and
- 22 region's top employers.
- 23 Since that time National Grid's
- 24 management has eliminated the jobs of hundreds of
- 25 New Yorkers and moved its U.S. headquarters out of

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 New York State to Massachusetts. Because it is not
- 3 deregulated National Grid is a monopoly for
- 4 transmission and distribution and the ratepayers
- 5 are held hostage.
- 6 Unfortunately National Grid's
- 7 proposal to the Public Service Commission regarding
- 8 the future of the Dunkirk plant would place
- 9 hardship on our economy, ratepayers and taxpayers.
- 10 It begs the question why would a
- 11 company that makes its decisions out of the United
- 12 Kingdom be dictating our future in western New
- 13 York.
- I have compiled guite a bit of
- 15 material that leads to several compelling
- 16 questions. I ask that the Public Service
- 17 Commission answer these questions in a formal
- 18 response, not tonight, but later, and take this
- 19 information into -- into serious consideration
- 20 through its decision-making process.
- 21 As stated in their report,
- 22 National Grid's confidence in its solution to fully
- 23 meet reliability needs is limited to the year 2021.
- 24 And this is a key point to make. It's a period of
- 25 only six years.

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20132. Unlike the Dunkirk repower 3 initiative, the National Grid option falls short of 4 the Public Service Commission's stated minimum 5 requirement for long-term solutions of at least ten 6 years. 7 So here are some questions. Why 8 shouldn't National Grid's proposal be rejected 9 outright because they did not follow the Public 10 Service Commission's requirement of showing 11 reliability for ten years or greater? If National 12 Grid still is considered, what upgrades need to be 13 added to meet the full ten-year period? 14 Governor Cuomo's energy highway 15 blueprint calls for upgrading aged New York State 16 transmission systems and moving at least one 17 thousand megawatts of power stranded in western New 18 York down to the New York City area. 19 Ouestion: Doesn't the Dunkirk 20 proposal match up ideally with the transmission 21 construction upgrades to -- to move more power from 22 upstate to downstate? 23 According to the reports from 24 both Grid and N.R.G. ratepayer benefits from the

Dunkirk project go far beyond just western New York

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 or National Grid's service area.
- 3 Questions: How does the P.S.C.
- 4 divine which ratepayer benefits -- which ratepayers
- 5 benefit from the project? How does the P.S.C.
- 6 propose to allocate the costs of the project if
- 7 there are benefits that extend across the state?
- National Grid advertises the
- 9 up-front cost of its transmission upgrades as being
- 10 about sixty-six million dollars, but says in its
- 11 report filed in this proceeding that the cost could
- 12 be higher, as much as one hundred and fifty-six
- 13 million dollars with a total cost over twenty years
- of nearly five hundred million dollars.
- This seems like a bait and switch
- 16 since National Grid maintains the option to recover
- its costs, no matter how much they are, from the
- 18 ratepayers.
- N.R.G. says it will commit to its
- 20 bid up-front while National Grid will not. The
- 21 real comparison of the transmission option should
- 22 be up to the five hundred million dollar price tag.
- 23 National Grid stands to make
- 24 enormous profits at the consumers' expense. Its
- 25 most recent rate case before the P.S.C. allows for

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 a nine point three percent return on equity for
- 3 capital improvements, that would last for thirty
- 4 plus years.
- 5 By contrast the N.R.G. plant is
- 6 the most cost effective for ratepayers with
- 7 millions of dollars in private investment and
- 8 ratepayer benefits exceeding costs by three hundred
- 9 million dollars a year.
- 10 Repowering Dunkirk will provide
- 11 clean, reliable local energy at a guaranteed price,
- 12 all the while benefiting our -- our local economy
- and putting our energy -- energy future in our own
- 14 hands. That is the right choice for New York.
- 15 Question: National Grid's
- transmission will not produce any power, only
- 17 transport it. Where will that power come from, how
- 18 much will it actually cost and will it meet New
- 19 York standards for the environment? Can National
- 20 Grid guarantee that if their expenses exceed
- 21 sixty-six million dollars that the ratepayers will
- 22 not have to pay one more dime?
- In the Powerpoint presentation
- 24 given to the New York State Independent System
- Operator, New York I.S.O., dated October 24th,

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 2012, and this is it, I have it with me, National
- 3 Grid outlined projects including reconductering of
- 4 the Five Mile Road/Homer Hill, one one five K V
- 5 lines for eight miles and reconductering of the
- 6 Faulkner/Warren number one seven one one five K
- 7 V line for six miles in New York State and eleven
- 8 and a half miles in Pennsylvania.
- 9 On page thirteen of the report
- 10 National Grid states and I quote "Completion of the
- 11 work described should eliminate dependence of the
- 12 transmission system on Dunkirk's generation."
- This -- these lines tie directly
- 14 into Pennsylvania. These projects were not
- 15 included in National Grid's alternative to
- 16 repowering Dunkirk, yet there clearly is a linkage
- 17 between the timing and the cost of these additional
- 18 projects.
- 19 This information is a
- 20 demonstration of evidence that National Grid's
- 21 estimation of actual cost is grossly underestimated
- 22 and should be reworked to include all expenditures
- 23 because of the huge negative impact on the
- 24 ratepayers.
- So Question: These proposed line

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 upgrades and the building of a substation in
- 3 Humphrey will cost hundreds of millions of dollars.
- 4 If these additional costs are
- 5 needed to eliminate power produced at the Dunkirk
- 6 plant, why are they not listed in National Grid's
- 7 submission to the Public Service Commission? Why
- 8 isn't National Grid required to revise its analysis
- 9 to include these additional costs? What is the
- 10 true impact on the ratepayers?
- 11 National Grid's Five Mile
- 12 Road/Homer Hill line and Faulkner/Warren line as
- 13 outlined to the New York State I.S.O., would
- 14 directly connect to the P.J.M. transmission system
- out of Pennsylvania and Ohio, which has a large
- share of its power generated by dirty coal plants
- 17 that generate high amounts of pollution in sharp
- 18 contrast to the clean and efficient natural gas
- 19 repowering in Dunkirk.
- P.J.M. has the highest CO2
- 21 densities in the entire nation. Therefore
- 22 importing power from P.J.M. will dramatically raise
- overall CO2 emissions when compared to Dunkirk.
- 24 National Grid claims in its
- 25 report the emission reductions, both water and air,

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 described in N.R.G.'s proposal are compared to the
- 3 historic baseline of existing facility operating on
- 4 coal.
- 5 However, if the existing facility
- 6 is retired as planned, future emissions would be
- 7 zero. And they said that tonight again. This
- 8 statement by National Grid is misleading and
- 9 entirely the wrong benchmark. In reality power
- 10 transmitted from the P.J.M. system would double
- 11 emissions, not have zero emissions.
- 12 On the other hand the Dunkirk
- 13 repowering proposal clearly identifies dramatic and
- 14 significant environmental benefits, reducing all
- 15 major emissions including mercury by one hundred
- 16 percent, sulfur dioxide by ninety-nine percent,
- 17 nitrogen oxides by ninety-eight percent,
- 18 particulates by eighty-three percent and greenhouse
- 19 gases by seventy-three percent while greatly
- 20 benefiting our local economy and putting our energy
- 21 future in our own hands.
- 22 Repowering Dunkirk -- repowering
- 23 Dunkirk will provide support for other renewable
- 24 generating aspects, especially wind and solar power
- 25 in western New York.

Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20131 2. The intermittent nature of wind 3 resources can be a challenge for the western New 4 York grid and the repowered Dunkirk plant will help 5 balance the variability of the wind resources for grid operators because the combined cycle units can 6 7 ramp up quickly and load follow as demand rises and falls on the system. 8 9 So question: National Grid's 10 plan as outlined to the New York State I.S.O. 11 connects to P.J.M. Why isn't National Grid 12 required to include actual data in their proposal 13 about power produced in the P.J.M. system including CO2 emissions in addition to the other coal 14 15 generated pollutants, including mercury, sulfur 16 dioxide, nitrogen oxides, particulates and 17 greenhouse gases? 18 Another serious environmental 19 flaw with National Grid's submission is that by 20 importing power from out of state this power is not 21 subject to the regional greenhouse gas initiative 22 carbon tax. So the question is doesn't this fact 23 defeat the purpose of the New York State RGGI 24 system? Doesn't imported Pennsylvania energy

create an unfair advantage?

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Some environmentalists will try
- 3 to make repowering energy an issue related to
- 4 allowing high volume hydraulic fracturing for
- 5 natural gas in New York State, which is currently
- 6 under consideration by the Department of
- 7 Environmental Conservation.
- 8 This argument is a red herring
- 9 because repowering Dunkirk would use existing
- 10 supplies of natural gas and does not propose using
- 11 gas produced from New York's Marcellus Shale.
- 12 Whether or not to hydrofrack in
- 13 New York simply has no bearing on repowering
- 14 N.R.G.. It is surprising that Sierra Club favors
- 15 National Grid's plan to tie into the dirty P.J.M.
- 16 system that has such high CO2 emissions and does
- 17 not pay RGGI fees.
- 18 Sierra -- Sierra Club's record
- 19 shows that they have opposed every major form of
- 20 energy production in some form or another, even
- 21 renewable energy projects. However, in January and
- 22 February of 2013, and this is key, the Sierra Club
- 23 signed-on in support of agreements with A.E.P. and
- 24 Mid-American Energy to convert a number of existing
- 25 coal units to natural gas. This is noteworthy as

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 their opposition to repowering the Dunkirk facility
- 3 here in New York appears inconsistent with their
- 4 most recent actions in cases.
- 5 In addition to the environmental
- 6 concerns raised by National -- National Grid
- 7 linking to the P.J.M. system, another glaring flaw
- 8 with National Grid's plan is that it increases our
- 9 reliance on external markets while effectively
- 10 transferring our own jobs and tax benefits out of
- 11 the state.
- 12 It is risky to depend on power
- 13 from other states as we unfortunately found out in
- 14 2003 during a major blackout that left fifty
- 15 million people in eight states in the dark. And I
- 16 happened to be in New York City at that time with
- 17 my daughter.
- The economic and government costs
- 19 were staggering, estimated to be up to eight point
- 20 two billion dollars. The problem began when power
- 21 lines in Ohio sagged into trees that had not been
- 22 properly trimmed causing fires and forcing lines
- 23 out of service, something that was out of New York
- 24 State's jurisdiction.
- Now National Grid's plan to

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20132 connect to Pennsylvania transmission throws the ability to control our own destiny out of our hands 3 4 once again. The aging condition of Pennsylvania's 5 lines is unknown and not under the authority of New York State. 6 7 Ouestion: If National Grid ties 8 into the P.J.M. system what jurisdiction and 9 recourse does the Public Service Commission have over Pennsylvania transmission to ensure that the 10 11 reliability needs of New York State are met? 12 If our electrical grid is 13 connected to Pennsylvania and the out-of-state 14 system fails, what impact would that situation have 15 on our economy and especially in western New York? 16 In summary, National Grid fails 17 to provide the complete impact analysis on 18 transmission upgrades that was required by the 19 Public Service Commission's order and more 20 specifically ignores the long-term impacts on the 21 community, future economic viability of the region 22 and does not consider certain factors that are sure 23 to affect market projections. N.R.G.'s repowering 24 meets and exceeds all of the P.S.C.'s requirements.

25

You see the overwhelming majority

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 where we have hundreds and hundreds of local
- 3 residents who are directly here. They are impacted
- 4 and they are here in support of repowering Dunkirk.
- 5 You see that most of the naysayers have traveled
- 6 from outside our community. Those who are most --
- 7 those who are most against repowering have no
- 8 personal stake in this issue. Repowering Dunkirk
- 9 will bring hope, opportunity and prosperity to our
- 10 region. Our future depends on it. As a state
- 11 senator I am responsible for fighting for my
- 12 district. On behalf of my people I ask you, we all
- 13 ask you, we urge you to choose repowering N.R.G.
- 14 Thank you, very much.
- 15 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Thank you,
- 16 Senator Young.
- We now have Assemblyman Andrew
- 18 Goodell.
- 19 ASSEMBLYMAN GOODELL: Thank you
- 20 very --.
- 21 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: If we can have
- 22 some quiet, please, in the audience so the
- 23 Assemblyman's comments can be recorded for the
- 24 transcript? Thank you.
- ASSEMBLYMAN GOODELL: Thank you

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 very much for giving me the opportunity to testify
- 3 before you.
- 4 Commissioner Sayre, thank you
- 5 very much for coming to Chautauqua County. As you
- 6 know, it's the best county in the state.
- 7 And Chairman, I can see that
- 8 you're conferring with the Commissioner and
- 9 confirming what I said. Welcome home.
- I have to be honest, when the
- 11 lights went out in the earlier presentation I was
- 12 thinking to myself we need to repower now. And
- indeed there's no time for delay.
- 14 As you know, during the
- 15 legislative session that just ended the New York
- 16 State Senate and the New York State Assembly
- 17 overwhelmingly enacted statutory provisions
- 18 relating to the Public Service Commission's
- 19 evaluation of this very issue.
- In fact, the statutory language
- 21 that Senator Young was so critical in getting into
- 22 law and that was signed by Governor Cuomo,
- 23 specifically mentions this rate hearing by number.
- And so we have a very clear
- 25 unequivocal statement of legislative intent as it

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 relates to this repowering case.
- 3 And the state legislature by an
- 4 overwhelming margin enacted a provision that
- 5 states, and I quote, "It is in the public interest
- 6 to develop clean power generation, near energy
- 7 demand to meet the needs of ratepayers, to support
- 8 local and state tax revenue stability, to promote
- 9 economic opportunity, and to enhance the state's
- 10 environment.
- 11 That is the statutory parameters
- 12 on which this case should be evaluated.
- 13 I'm extraordinarily proud of the
- 14 fact that we have an estimated twenty-five hundred
- 15 residents who have come out in support of the
- 16 N.R.G. project here tonight.
- 17 In addition to those who are on
- 18 the first floor and the standing-room-only audience
- on the second floor, there's also many people in an
- 20 overflow room listening to us electronically.
- These people have come out
- 22 because this project is critical to the future of
- 23 Dunkirk, northern Chautauqua County and our entire
- 24 county.
- 25 If the Public Service Commission

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 approves the N.R.G. project, N.R.G. will invest
- 3 about a half a billion dollars in Dunkirk. There
- 4 will be an estimated five hundred construction
- 5 workers for a three-year period. We will save a
- 6 number of high-paying permanent jobs and we will
- 7 stabilize and increase the tax basis in the city of
- 8 Dunkirk, the school system and the county. Those
- 9 are tremendous positive advantages.
- 10 On the other hand, if the Public
- 11 Service Commission does not approve the project,
- 12 N.R.G. will be forced to shut the plant down and
- 13 that one plant accounts for forty-two percent of
- 14 the tax revenue for the city of Dunkirk.
- 15 It's equivalent to the entire
- 16 budget of the entire police and fire department
- 17 combined. Now a few years ago N.R.G. invested over
- 18 two hundred million in putting in pollution control
- 19 equipment at this plant. And at that time they
- 20 negotiated in good faith for a PILOT agreement,
- 21 payment in lieu of tax agreement. The payments are
- 22 based on production. So if there's no production,
- 23 there's no payments. And it would bring the city
- 24 of Dunkirk and the Dunkirk school system to
- 25 bankruptcy or near bankruptcy. That is the issue

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 that we're addressing.
- Now, as I mentioned, through the
- 4 efforts of Senator Young and I wanted to point out
- 5 also Assemblyman Joe Giglio who drove over here.
- 6 This used to be part of his district. It's no
- 7 longer, but he feels so strongly about Chautauqua
- 8 County he came here. Assemblyman Giglio supported
- 9 it on the floor of the Assembly as I did. That
- 10 statute sets forth a number of provisions that must
- 11 be considered by the Public Service Commission.
- I have a nine-page analysis and
- 13 you'll be pleased to know I'm not going to read it.
- 14 And apparently a number of people in this room are
- 15 also pleased. But let me just hit the highlights.
- The first issue, clean power
- 17 generation. Even the Sierra Club and everyone who
- 18 submitted comments acknowledges that this plant
- 19 will be one of the cleanest plants ever built in
- 20 the state of New York. We know that. And what's
- 21 the alternative? The alternative is that we import
- 22 power from P.J.M. or elsewhere. P.J.M. has half of
- 23 its power produced by coal. The comparison is a
- 24 state-of-the-art extremely efficient natural gas
- 25 facility with a brand -- and the best -- brand new

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 and the best environmental controls versus
- 3 importing our power from Homer City or somewhere
- 4 else with a horrific environmental record. And by
- 5 the way, those plants, they're upwind from us.
- 6 That's right.
- 7 National Grid wants you to shut
- 8 down a local plant that will be a state-of-the-art
- 9 facility so that we can import power from
- 10 Pennsylvania and Ohio and breathe the soot that
- 11 they produce to provide us with higher cost power.
- 12 That's not a good option.
- 13 As was reflected earlier. Both
- 14 N.R.G. and National Grid's consultant, P.A.
- 15 Consultants Group, gave a determination that the
- 16 N.R.G. project would result in tremendous savings
- 17 to ratepayers, both locally and across the state.
- The only issue is how much will
- 19 we save with the N.R.G. project. And I urge you to
- 20 read both the P.A. Consultants report commissioned
- 21 by National Grid as well as N.R.G.'s report. We
- 22 shouldn't be here fighting over how much savings,
- 23 we should be fighting over how fast we can get
- 24 those savings online.
- There's absolutely no doubt that

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 moving forward with the N.R.G. project will have a
- 3 tremendous positive impact on not only the economy
- 4 of Dunkirk and Fredonia and western New York, but
- 5 the economy all across New York State. That is
- 6 because this power will be the most cost-effective
- 7 power produced from the newest, most efficient
- 8 plant in the state of New York.
- 9 And we know if we're serious
- 10 about economic development we need to be serious
- 11 about having the most modern, efficient,
- 12 cost-effective facilities online and that's the
- 13 N.R.G. project.
- 14 The choice for the Public Service
- 15 Commission, we believe, is clear. We can move
- 16 forward with a private investment of about a half a
- 17 billion dollars here in Chautauqua County in
- 18 developing the state's most efficient, cleanest
- 19 natural gas plant or we can move in a different
- 20 direction and build transmission lines to import
- 21 power from other states that do not meet our
- 22 environmental standards.
- 23 As you know, both Pennsylvania
- 24 and Ohio are not members of the Regional Greenhouse
- 25 Gas Initiative. They're not part of RGGI. They do

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 not meet our environmental standards. We breathe
- 3 their air the next day, but they don't meet our
- 4 standards.
- 5 It is important that we take a
- 6 thoughtful, long-term approach. And as you know,
- 7 most businesses enter into long-term contracts when
- 8 the source of the material they're buying is the
- 9 most efficient and cost-effective they can buy.
- 10 National Grid wants you to
- 11 believe that a long-term contract is bad for the
- 12 ratepayers. That's not true. A long-term contract
- 13 with an inefficient producer that has to be
- 14 subsidized is bad for the ratepayers. But, a
- 15 long-term contract with the most efficient plant in
- 16 the state of New York is good for the ratepayers
- 17 because it provides long-term stability and
- 18 predictability and that's what we need for economic
- 19 development in New York State.
- 20 We know that when the State
- 21 decoupled electrical generation with transmission
- 22 that there were some unintended consequences. And
- 23 the unintended consequence is that companies that
- 24 are engaged in transmission want to transport
- 25 electricity as far as possible and charge you the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 most to do so. Whereas before they had to look at
- 3 the overall combined cost. National Grid doesn't
- 4 buy electricity, it transports electricity. We
- 5 shouldn't be asking National Grid what's in the
- 6 best interest of ratepayers anymore than we'd ask a
- 7 trucking company whether we should buy the T.V.
- 8 that's made next door or one from across the
- 9 country. We want the locally-produced power.
- I am very mindful that I have
- 11 about twenty-five hundred people and that over
- 12 eighty have signed up to speak and so I want to
- 13 thank you from the bottom of my heart for coming
- 14 here to Chautaugua County and agreeing to hear
- 15 testimony until eleven p.m. tomorrow.
- And if you come to the same
- 17 conclusion that I have that National Grid's
- 18 proposal is not as good as N.R.G.'s and that N.R.G.
- is the best proposal for the ratepayers and for the
- 20 state of New York, then let us know and just raise
- 21 your hand and we can end sooner. Thank you so
- 22 much.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Next we have
- 24 the mayor of the city of Dunkirk, Anthony Dolce --
- 25 Dolce. All right. He's making coffee right now.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Sorry about that. I think I've given you a new
- 3 nickname. I'm sorry about that.
- 4 MR. DOLCE: It's okay. I've been
- 5 called worse.
- 6 Honorable Judge Harriman, I'm
- 7 A.J. Dolce, proud mayor of the city of Dunkirk
- 8 which just so happens to be the proud home of
- 9 N.R.G. powered facility.
- 10 On behalf of the residents and
- 11 the taxpayers of the city I would first like to
- 12 thank Chairman Brown and the Commission not only
- 13 for providing an opportunity for the public to
- 14 comment, but for recognizing the need to provide
- 15 this forum in a location that is convenient for
- 16 those who will be most directly affected by the
- 17 decisions that the Commission will make.
- I believe convening here in
- 19 northern Chautauqua County demonstrates the strong
- 20 desire on the Commission's part to provide area
- 21 residents and businesses with a reasonable
- 22 opportunity to hear the facts surrounding the
- 23 alternatives being considered for the N.R.G.
- 24 facility in Dunkirk. It is an opportunity we
- 25 greatly appreciate.

- Case 12-E-0577 7-15-20131 2. Tonight I urge the Commission to 3 support the N.R.G. conversion proposal, commonly referred to as the repowering. The N.R.G. facility 4 5 is a critical component of the Dunkirk and Chautauqua County landscape. Its presence has been 6 7 and under repowering will be a significant 8 contributor to the local and regional economy. 9 The Commission has certainly received and reviewed volumes of technical data 10 11 regarding repowering and transmission upgrades and 12 non-transmission alternatives. I would just like 13 to take a moment to reinforce the real life impact 14 of the decision that is to be made by the 15 Commission. 16 With repowering comes short- and 17 long-term economic vibrancy, immediate construction 18 jobs and their direct and ancillary spin-offs, as
- Very rarely do we hear in New

well as long-term facility employment.

- 21 York State of a company ready, willing and able to
- 22 invest five hundred million dollars. The benefits
- 23 of such an investment are too clear to ignore.
- 24 Mothballing the facility will
- 25 cause a countywide economic collapse, the loss of

19

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 employees and the elimination of vendors spending,
- 3 and the local economy will be immediately
- 4 devastating to so many men, women and their
- 5 families.
- 6 The loss of in lieu of tax
- 7 payments will have an immediate and escalating
- 8 negative impact on the city as well as the school
- 9 district and county.
- 10 Furthermore, taxes will
- 11 undoubtedly rise, rates likely will as well, and
- 12 city services will face significant cuts. This all
- 13 leads to a possible crippling effect on most, if
- 14 not all, operations of city government.
- 15 Additionally, losing N.R.G.'s
- 16 very positive community involvement will further
- 17 negatively impact the region. The fiscal impact on
- 18 the city cannot be overstated. The facility is an
- 19 enormous economic engine with N.R.G. contributing
- 20 fully eighteen point two percent of the city's
- 21 entire general fund revenue stream.
- The disruption of that income
- 23 will create a huge void and will produce a
- 24 multitude of negative impacts upon city services.
- 25 Importantly, a decision by the Commission to

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 authorize repowering is not only in the near- and
- 3 long-term economic benefit to Dunkirk, but such a
- 4 repowering is in line with the Commission's goal to
- 5 ensure safe, secure and reliable access to electric
- 6 services for the state's residential and business
- 7 consumers at just and reasonable rates.
- 8 As you can see from the
- 9 significant attendance here this evening, this is
- 10 an issue that is critical to all stakeholders in
- 11 the community. And the widespread and bipartisan
- 12 support that has been present throughout the
- 13 process and will continue here tonight is further
- 14 testament to the necessity of maintaining the
- 15 energy facility as a functioning component of the
- 16 state's energy plan.
- 17 Simply put, the city of Dunkirk,
- 18 our school district and the entire county need the
- 19 repowering of N.R.G. We need the stability it will
- 20 provide now and the positive possibilities it
- 21 brings for our future. Again, on behalf of the
- 22 residents and taxpayers of the city of Dunkirk I
- 23 urge your support for the N.R.G. repowering
- 24 proposal. And I thank you for your kind attention
- 25 in providing this much appreciated forum.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013 2. Thank you. 3 MR. CERNE: Good evening. 4 name is Gary Cerne, I'm the superintendent of 5 schools for Dunkirk City School District. And, I stand before you tonight to represent our Board of 6 7 Education. 8 You've heard a lot of numbers 9 tonight and we even heard one of our speakers 10 mention boy, I wish somebody would bring these 11 numbers down into real terms. Well, I'm going to 12 bring these numbers down to real terms for you. 13 And I want you to know right now that the school board of the Dunkirk City School District, its 14 15 teachers, its children, its staff urge you to 16 support the repowering of the Dunkirk N.R.G. plant, 17 please. 18 Now, the real numbers that
- 19 everybody has been looking for. The payment in
- 20 lieu of taxes given to the Dunkirk City School
- 21 District by N.R.G. represents ten percent of our
- 22 operating revenue. How do I make up ten percent in
- 23 lost revenue?
- 24 Here's a way. I could raise
- 25 taxes forty-two point two percent. And let's put

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 that into real terms. That would cost an average
- 3 person with a fifty thousand dollar home in the
- 4 city of Dunkirk an additional four hundred and
- 5 eighty-six dollars, some are in the town of
- 6 Dunkirk, five hundred and forty-three dollars, the
- 7 town of Sheridan, five hundred and seventy dollars.
- 8 I cannot do that to the citizens
- 9 of our community.
- There's a second alternative. I
- 11 could eliminate fifty-eight teaching positions.
- 12 Could you imagine a school district eliminating
- 13 fifty-eight positions, especially a district our
- 14 size? I can't do that to our teachers. We got
- 15 high quality teachers that care about kids and they
- 16 deserve to have jobs working with our children.
- Now let's consider this. I
- 18 mentioned we're looking at losing four million
- 19 dollars should the PILOT payment go away. As a
- 20 former social studies teacher let me give you a
- 21 quick history lesson from the past four or five
- 22 years.
- Our district's already lost a
- 24 million dollars because the PILOT payment has
- 25 decreased. We've also lost a half a million

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- dollars in state operating aid. As you know, New
- 3 York State is famous for its unfunded mandates.
- As you know, T.R.S. continues to
- 5 go up, E.R.S. goes up, health insurance goes up.
- 6 So, revenues are declining and costs continue to
- 7 escalate. Over the past four or five years we've
- 8 already had to cut thirty-eight teachers,
- 9 thirty-two members of our C.S.E.A. force and three
- 10 administrators. We cannot afford to cut anyone
- 11 else.
- Now, let me share some
- 13 additional -- please let me share some additional
- 14 financial burden that we've learned in the last six
- 15 weeks. We've recently lost Twenty-first Century
- 16 funding of five hundred and seventeen thousand
- dollars annually that goes to our elementary
- 18 children.
- This money is used for
- 20 after-school programs, enrichment programs, much
- 21 needed programs for our children. Hundreds of our
- 22 elementary kids stay after school because of this
- 23 funding. It's gone.
- 24 We've also lost almost three
- 25 hundred thousand dollars of Twenty-first Century

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 funding for our high school kids. That money was
- 3 used for homework help, Regents review, things like
- 4 that.
- 5 Last week I found out that our
- 6 Title I funding is going down by another
- 7 sixty-seven thousand dollars and we expect the rest
- 8 of our federal funds, due to the situation there,
- 9 to decrease another five to seven percent. So when
- 10 you add that all up we've already lost two point
- 11 five million dollars in revenue the last four
- 12 years. How can we afford to lose another four
- million dollars of PILOT payments from N.R.G.?
- We're a community that faces high
- 15 levels of poverty. Sixty-five percent of my
- 16 students are on free and reduced lunch. We have
- 17 children that come to us that don't speak English.
- 18 Our special -- our special education population is
- 19 very large. We struggle daily to meet educational,
- 20 emotional, nutritional and health needs of our
- 21 students. If we lose the four million in revenue
- from N.R.G. it will be impossible for us to provide
- 23 the needs of our students.
- 24 As superintendent, please know
- 25 that I'm here representing the children of our

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 community. Please, I beg you, support the
- 3 repowering of the Dunkirk N.R.G. plant, so that our
- 4 kids have a chance for a bright future. Thank you.
- 5 MR. JOHNSON: Good evening. My
- 6 name is Ron Johnson and I live in Fredonia, New
- 7 York. I'm a Chautauqua County businessman. I'm
- 8 the owner and operator of Johnson Adult Homes. As
- 9 a matter of full disclosure, I'm also the 2013
- 10 democratic and independent candidate for county
- 11 executive.
- 12 As a Chautaugua County
- 13 businessman I fully support the plan put forward by
- 14 N.R.G. to repower its electric generation station
- in Dunkirk. The cost and benefit of repowering has
- 16 been carefully calculated by N.R.G.
- 17 As a taxpayer and a private
- 18 sector businessman I urge that we simply get out of
- 19 the way and let N.R.G. do their business of selling
- 20 power. Get out of the way so we can allow
- 21 Chautauqua County a permanent, stable and clean
- 22 supply of electrical -- electrical energy.
- The delivery system is designed
- 24 for base-load generation in Dunkirk and the
- 25 elimination of the Dunkirk plant makes reliable

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 power in this region suspect. We must not create a
- 3 situation in which our community, our region, our
- 4 state is dependent on power generated in
- 5 Pennsylvania, Ontario and other areas not subject
- 6 to our strict environmental protections.
- 7 Chautaugua County will need power
- 8 from N.R.G. plant in the years to come. I do not
- 9 accept that a weak economy is our fate. Chautauqua
- 10 County's economy can grow. Our existing industries
- 11 can expand and new industries can be attracted to
- 12 Chautauqua County. Industrial growth will mean a
- demand for more electricity in the N.R.G. plant in
- 14 Dunkirk.
- There is no reason that the
- 16 population growth realized across our state will
- 17 not come to pass in Chautauqua County.
- 18 Let's not assume decline and
- 19 stagnation as the future of Chautauqua County and
- 20 western New York. Let's assume instead growth and
- 21 prosperity and all of the future of our community.
- 22 Without N.R.G. power right here
- in our county we cannot achieve our potential. You
- on the P.S.C. play an important role as New York's
- 25 watchdog, protector and regulators of our

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 utilities. I personally thank you for your
- 3 service.
- 4 But today I ask for your support
- 5 in this very important Chautauqua County and New
- 6 York State business proposal. It is absolutely in
- 7 the best interest of the economies of New York and
- 8 Chautauqua County and of its people.
- 9 Thank you very much.
- 10 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Thank you. The
- 11 next five speakers are going to be as follows;
- 12 David Wilkinson,
- Joe Sempolinski,
- 14 Diane Ciurczak,
- James Miller and
- John Alff.
- 17 So we'll start first with David
- 18 Wilkinson.
- MR. WILKINSON: Good evening.
- 20 I'm not quite as eloquent as the rest of the people
- 21 that spoke before me. But I'll -- I'll keep to the
- 22 two minutes.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Thanks for
- 24 writing that down.
- MR. WILKINSON: My name is David

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Wilkinson and I reside at 7499 Putnam Road,
- 3 Cassadaga.
- I'm speaking this evening as a
- 5 resident of the county regarding P.S.C. case number
- 6 12-E-0577.
- 7 I have grave concerns regarding
- 8 the impact of this hearing specific to the
- 9 economics of my community. Dunkirk generation
- 10 facility provides a stable tax base which is vital
- 11 to our community, but it is more than taxes.
- N.R.G. Dunkirk provides
- opportunities for our community to grow and to be
- 14 self-sufficient. I believe a loss of the
- 15 generation facility will have a negative impact
- 16 upon our local economy. It will begin with a loss
- of tax revenue to the county followed by loss of
- 18 good jobs at the N.R.G. facility, loss of control
- 19 of New York energy resources, loss of ability to
- 20 sustain life services, such as police and fire,
- loss of property values, loss of small business
- 22 opportunities, loss of public education, loss of
- 23 large business, loss of population, loss of the
- 24 city of Dunkirk, loss of New York jobs period.
- The national lobbyist group in

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 attendance this evening would have you believe they
- 3 have alternative ideas when in fact the plan they
- 4 support allows the purchase of fossil fuel
- 5 generation.
- 6 Let's make no mistake, they do
- 7 not have a plan except to continue their use of
- 8 electricity, national gas and carbon emitting
- 9 vehicles.
- The repower of the Dunkirk
- 11 facility is an opportunity to lead the development
- of cleaner energy source here in western New York
- 13 and it's the right choice to make. I have heard
- 14 the statement and I quote "New York is for New
- 15 York." I often wonder when that statement will
- 16 mean western New York.
- I ask your Honor and members of
- 18 the P.S.C. to allow the residents of this community
- 19 to decide its future and disregard the lobbyist
- 20 bloggers and their scripted statements from
- 21 Anywhere U.S.A. Thank you.
- MR. SEMPOLINSKI: Thank you. My
- 23 name is Joseph Sempolinski and I'm the district
- 24 director for United States Congressman Tom Reed.
- 25 Congressman Reed couldn't be here

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 tonight, but he wanted to make it unequivocal his
- 3 support for the repowering of the Dunkirk N.R.G.
- 4 facility.
- 5 To that end and to this point,
- 6 the congressman has been in direct personal contact
- 7 with the chairman of the Commission, Mr. Brown. He
- 8 has written a statement regarding the repowering of
- 9 Dunkirk and the facility in Lansing that has been
- 10 submitted for the record to the P.S.C.
- 11 And on Friday he personally stood
- 12 at the shore of Lake Erie in the shadow of the
- 13 N.R.G. facility and held a press conference to make
- 14 perfectly clear his support for the repowering.
- 15 At that press conference was
- 16 President -- a coalition of the people that will be
- 17 most directly affected by this particular decision
- 18 that is going to be made. We had representatives
- 19 of the federal government, the state government,
- 20 the county government and the local government. We
- 21 had representatives of the business community, of
- the labor community, of the education community,
- 23 both secondary and post secondary.
- We had democrats, republicans,
- 25 members of the conservative party, members of the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 working families party, all standing together made
- 3 with a single voice calling for the repowering of
- 4 this facility.
- 5 As we all know, getting those
- 6 particular list of groups to agree on any one
- 7 particular thing in this day and age can be
- 8 difficult. However, you see it before you here in
- 9 Dunkirk and Chautauqua County. Why is that so?
- 10 Because every one of those groups
- 11 and every citizen of Dunkirk and every citizen of
- 12 Chautaugua County is directly affected.
- The local people of Dunkirk will
- 14 be affected by the jobs. They'll be foregone if
- 15 the repowering doesn't happen. They will be
- 16 affected for the jobs will be lost if the facility
- 17 closes.
- The taxpayers of Dunkirk, of the
- 19 Dunkirk School District and of Chautauqua County
- 20 will be impacted by increased payments that they
- 21 will have to make on their tax bill.
- But it goes even broader than
- 23 that. The people of the state of New York will be
- 24 deprived, increased infrastructure to power their
- own businesses, to power their own manufacturing,

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 to power their own homes, to have the
- 3 infrastructure to put in place a future where New
- 4 York State can control its own energy destiny.
- 5 The people of the United States
- 6 of America will also be deprived of that
- 7 infrastructure, they will be deprived of a step
- 8 toward energy independence, deprived a step towards
- 9 saying to the rest of the world that we can take
- 10 care of our own energy needs. How can we who have
- 11 made a goal as a country to be energy independent
- 12 be serious about that, if we shut down existing
- infrastructures and refuse to put in place the best
- 14 and newest technology?
- The Public Service Commission
- 16 rightfully will make this decision based on what is
- in the public interest. The energy -- the energy
- 18 independence of the United States of America is in
- 19 the public interest. The green energy security of
- 20 New York State is in the public interest.
- The payments that will have to be
- 22 made by the taxpayers of Dunkirk, the Dunkirk
- 23 School District and the county of Chautauqua are in
- 24 the public interest. And the workers, the loss of
- 25 jobs, the foregoing of new jobs, those concerns for

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 the workers of Dunkirk are in the public interest.
- 3 On behalf of the seven hundred and
- 4 eighteen thousand constituents of New York's 23rd
- 5 Congressional District and United States
- 6 Congressman Tom Reed I urge the Public Service
- 7 Commission to allow the repowering of the N.R.G.
- 8 Dunkirk facility.
- 9 MS. CIURCZAK: Good evening. My
- 10 name is Diane Ciurczak and I'm the energy chair of
- 11 the Niagara Group of the Sierra Club. Niagara
- 12 Group represents Chautaugua County as well as many
- 13 other counties in western New York.
- On behalf of the Niagara Group's
- 15 Sierra Club I'm here to testify in support of
- 16 National Grid's proposal for transmission system
- 17 upgrades.
- We also support investments in
- 19 efficiency and clean, renewable energy. Renewables
- 20 are doable now. Wind turbines are generating
- 21 electricity across the state from Lackawanna to Tug
- 22 Hill. And a very successful solar energy feed in
- 23 tariff program run by LIPA in Long Island just
- 24 announced a second expansion.
- 25 Effective renewable energy

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 programs have led to millions of dollars in
- 3 investments in New York and around the world. The
- 4 Sierra Club Niagara Group has been advocating for
- 5 the adoption of a feed-in tariff program known as
- 6 FIT in Western New York. Places that have adopted
- 7 the FIT have effectively jump-started investment in
- 8 renewable energy and created thousands of jobs in
- 9 the process.
- 10 The feed-in tariff also makes it
- 11 possible for schools, farmers, homeowners and
- 12 community organization -- organizations to generate
- income by producing renewable energy that is sold
- 14 to consumers through long-term contracts.
- 15 Moreover, the FIT has proven to be the most
- 16 cost-effective way to get renewable energy.
- 17 The feed-in tariff program in
- 18 Ontario, Canada, that was adopted in 2009 generated
- 19 twenty billion dollars in new investments and more
- than twenty thousand new jobs in two years.
- 21 One in six farmers in Canada are
- 22 receiving income by generating electricity. In
- 23 Germany over three hundred sixty-seven thousand
- 24 stable, high-wage jobs were created in twelve years
- 25 by adopting this kind of a financing mechanism

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 to -- to promote renewable energy and we can do it
- 3 here.
- 4 The Public Service Commission
- 5 should reject converting any coal plants from
- 6 risky, dirty fuel -- from one risky, dirty fuel to
- 7 another. New gas plants will require new pipelines
- 8 and increase the demand for dangerous fracking,
- 9 contributing to worsening climate disruption.
- 10 Climate disruption puts working
- 11 families at-risk from costly and dangerous extreme
- 12 weather events like flooding, heat waves, wind
- 13 storms and draughts that threaten public health,
- 14 local farms and the economy.
- The loss of an important tax --
- 16 tax base is an important concern. Short-term
- 17 programs exist to provide payment in lieu of taxes
- 18 and funding should come from a variety of sources
- 19 to assist Chautauqua County, including regional
- 20 economic development agencies, workforce training
- 21 grants and the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.
- 22 A renewable energy economy will
- 23 spur investment in high-paying, local jobs,
- 24 increase union career opportunities, and facilitate
- 25 new regional manufacturing. Local economies will

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 benefit because renewable energy is installed by
- 3 local workers who maintain it during its lifetime.
- 4 Energy efficiency benefits
- 5 families and community businesses by reducing costs
- 6 and creating jobs through green jobs, green New
- 7 York programs.
- 8 Combined with smart investments
- 9 in the way we transmit our energy, these local
- 10 investments will increase home-grown jobs and put
- 11 critical cash directly back into local economies.
- 12 In closing we are presented with
- 13 a clear choice between last year's energy and the
- 14 Twenty-first Century solutions that will lead to
- 15 greater prosperity and security. We can do it now.
- 16 We don't need transition gas-fired power plants.
- We urge New York State to create
- 18 healthy, local economies by simultaneously
- 19 investing in workers, communities and environmental
- 20 security. Thank you.
- I curtailed my comments. I'd
- 22 like to hand the full statement in.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Sure. James
- 24 Miller?
- MR. MILLER: Thank you. Yes, I

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 am James known more as Sam Miller. I am for the
- 3 record a member of the Sierra Club, but I'm not
- 4 speaking for the Sierra Club. I am not. I'm going
- 5 to disregard my comments as an electrical engineer
- 6 well degreed and not submit the testimony in favor
- 7 of National Grid's proposal unless -- unless New
- 8 York State who will benefit overall from the
- 9 closing in the future -- near future of coal plants
- 10 and nuclear plants that local residents such as
- 11 residents of Chautauqua County and Dunkirk right
- 12 here, are not made sacrificial lambs for their
- 13 economy.
- 14 There should be a way that since
- 15 the benefits of converting from fossil fuels to
- 16 clean green energy is going to be shared statewide
- 17 by all the residents that the overall budget for
- 18 New York State should include in some way of
- 19 replacing the lost tax revenues in these local
- 20 communities that are affected.
- So I'm going to just turn in my
- 22 technical remarks for your consideration. Thank
- 23 you.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Thank you.
- John Alff?

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013 2. MR. ALFF: My name is John Alff. I live at 19 Lemming Street in Dunkirk, New York. 3 And I want to address the Public 4 5 Service Commission in regards to my personal feelings as far as closing the plant. Anybody 6 pre-organizing to have a plant closed, thus losing 7 jobs, and our taxes to be raised for all the 8 9 citizens and the residents in the city of Dunkirk and Chautauqua County, I think anyone proposing or 10 11 screaming to cause that action should be tried in 12 court of law. 13 I thank you. 14 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: The next five 15 speakers will be: 16 Phil Julian, 17 James Christy, 18 Diane Hofner and 19 Kevin Morabito, and sorry, 20 Robert Donado -- Dando. 21 MR. JULIAN: Good evening. My 22 name is Phil Julian. I'm a lifelong resident of 23 Dunkirk. That's over thirty-nine years now -- well 24 over thirty-nine years.

I think it's obvious that N.R.G.

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 has a lot of support here this evening. As a
- 3 lifelong resident of the city, I've seen the
- 4 closing of schools and churches.
- 5 We -- our population has dropped
- 6 just in my lifetime from twenty thousand down to
- 7 thirteen thousand. The very last thing we need is
- 8 to lose one more industry. N.R.G. should remain in
- 9 Dunkirk.
- 10 You know, Governor Cuomo and
- 11 state leaders have been very vocal in their pursuit
- 12 of bringing new industry to the state. Shouldn't
- 13 we be doing everything possible to preserve the
- 14 jobs and industry that we already have? Doesn't
- 15 that make sense? It makes sense to me.
- 16 Am I allowed to ask you a
- 17 question, ma'am? Okay. To the officials from
- 18 N.R.G., we know that the PILOT program is expiring
- 19 and up for renewal in 2014. What do you see as the
- 20 future of the PILOT program? Should the city
- 21 school and county expect the same level of
- 22 contributions from N.R.G. should you be able to
- 23 repower?
- N.R.G. REPRESENTATIVE: Yes, the
- 25 PILOT program actually does not expire. It

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 continues in force. So one of the things that
- 3 we've talked about with the Chautauqua County
- 4 I.D.A. in principal is to be able to extend the
- 5 same level of payments. And so in the economics
- 6 that we've presented to National Grid and the
- 7 P.S.C. we have property tax payments in the same
- 8 level that we have today to be able to sustain the
- 9 property tax levels.
- 10 MR. JULIAN: That's what I wanted
- 11 to know. Thank you for being with us this evening.
- 12 We appreciate your help and your attention. Thank
- 13 you.
- MR. CHRISTY: Good evening. My
- 15 name's James Christy. I have been an employee of
- 16 N.R.G., National Grid slash Niagara Mohawk.
- I started my career with this
- 18 wonderful company close to thirty-five years ago
- 19 and I've been retired for eleven. So it -- it was
- 20 a wonderful career. And I have a solution to all
- 21 your problems. It's all in the size of the
- 22 conductor. Electricity is transmitted by the
- 23 diameter of the conductor. In other words the size
- 24 of the conductor. I put National Grid on -- on --
- on the podium the last time I was up here because

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 back in 1990 or 1986 or 7, Niagara Mohawk at that
- 3 time was in generation and in distribution.
- 4 And they requested a rate
- 5 increase which the Public Service Commission
- 6 granted and instead of putting that one sixty-one
- 7 and one sixty-two line and the one forty-one and
- 8 one forty-two line, instead of putting the money
- 9 into reconductering at that time, they put it into
- 10 capacitors, exactly what National Grid's answer is
- 11 today. And I had the opportunity to build the big
- 12 capacitor bank over on New Road.
- Now National Grid has N.R.G. in
- 14 their clutches because they can make it, but they
- 15 can't distribute it.
- I urge the Public Service
- 17 Commission to think about the size of the conductor
- 18 because it will -- the larger the conductor, the
- 19 more power N.R.G. can create. If they create a lot
- 20 of power and they build their plant, the tax base
- 21 goes up for the city of Dunkirk, the wheeling costs
- for National Grid, they push a lot more power
- 23 because their conductors are bigger, they invest,
- 24 the tax base goes up for National Grid, the tax
- 25 base goes up for N.R.G., we're making it in New

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 York.
- We can make it in New York, we
- 4 can transport it in New York and we can sell it to
- 5 Pennsylvania and Ohio and create jobs. That is the
- 6 solution to this whole problem.
- 7 We have to not put capacitors on
- 8 the line. We have to rebuild those lines. They're
- 9 inadequate, they've been inadequate for years. The
- 10 man on Putnam Road, if he looks out the back window
- 11 on a -- on a foggy night in the spring those
- 12 insulators are leaking. There's a glow all through
- 13 Kabob Swamp because I've been out there and put the
- 14 wires up after they burned down. I made a lot of
- 15 money doing it, but that's the story.
- Thank you very much for your
- 17 time. And when you go back and have your Public
- 18 Service Commission think about reconductering the
- 19 transmission network in New York State and then our
- 20 utilities can increase their -- their transmission,
- 21 they can increase their production, everything --
- 22 we'd all get more jobs, everybody gets good paying
- jobs, that is the answer to the question.
- MS. HOFNER: Good evening. My
- 25 name is Diane Hofner. And before I begin my

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 abbreviated comments, again I would ask that my
- 3 full five-minute preparation be entered into the
- 4 record and docket.
- 5 As co-founder of Cropplus and as
- 6 a Chautauqua County resident I would like to voice
- 7 my support for the cost-effective transmission
- 8 proposal by National Grid. I am also advocating
- 9 for efficient and renewable energy investments.
- I cannot support our community's
- 11 continued reliance on expensive and harmful fossil
- 12 fuels. Scientific studies show that the life cycle
- of natural gas from extraction to transportation,
- 14 consumption and getting rid of the waste is just as
- 15 damaging as coal. Given the choice between natural
- 16 gas extraction and renewable energy development in
- our backyards, the safe and profitable choice is
- 18 clean renewable energy.
- N.R.G. has already aggressively
- 20 invested in renewable energy projects across the
- 21 country. It's time to bring them here to western
- 22 New York.
- On July 11th, 2013, Senator Dean
- 24 Skelos communicated quote, "You will be pleased to
- 25 know that the New York State Senate unanimously

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 passed legislation creating a solar incentive plan
- 3 that would continue the New York Sun Program
- 4 through 2023.
- 5 The Republican Senate Conference
- 6 understands that we must take steps to help
- 7 businesses in New York through incentive programs
- 8 that would make this state a leader in the solar
- 9 industry through a cleaner delivery system," end
- 10 quote.
- 11 Thank you, Senator Young, for the
- 12 unanimous vote for solar incentives.
- 13 Like everyone here, I am
- 14 concerned about the availability of stable,
- 15 good-paying jobs in our community. The jobs
- 16 created by wind, solar and energy efficiency
- 17 projects dwarf the potential of natural gas. A
- 18 million dollars invested in wind can create
- 19 thirteen jobs, but that same million dollars
- 20 invested in natural gas produces only five.
- It's time to build a renewable
- 22 energy economy in New York State. Chautaugua
- 23 County has been powering New York State since the
- 24 1950s and it's time for New York State to return
- 25 the favor by offering their many programs for

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 making our community and workers whole, while we
- 3 embrace our new role in energy transmission and
- 4 production.
- 5 Thank you.
- 6 MR. MORABITO: My name is Kevin
- 7 Morabito. I'm a lifelong resident of Chautauqua
- 8 County and I also am an employee for N.R.G.
- 9 On behalf of the other employees
- 10 I'd like to thank Senator Young for being so
- instrumental in making this happen tonight.
- 12 You guys say that you -- you
- 13 employ ten thousand people in New York State. I
- 14 can bet my bottom dollar if you were to give them a
- 15 choice between a three percent increase in their
- 16 bill or a forty-seven percent increase in their
- 17 taxes, I can guarantee they'll let their bill go up
- 18 three percent.
- 19 Thank you.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Robert Dando?
- 21 MR. DANDO: I'm Robert Dando. I
- 22 am a member of the Working Family's Party and a
- 23 logger. I live on Fredonia/Stockton Road in the
- 24 town of Mumford. I've been a member of labor for
- 25 over forty years now.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 And I am for this repowering
- 3 project. I remember coming to this facility --
- 4 coming to this area back in '67, when I first
- 5 attended Fredonia State back before this
- 6 magnificent building was even here.
- 7 I think it was a field of grass
- 8 back then or a sea of mud, one of the two. I've
- 9 found that over the years I've enjoyed being in
- 10 this area. I met a local girl, we were married for
- 11 thirty-seven years before she passed away. I have
- 12 four children that still live in this area. I have
- 13 six grandchildren that live in this area. I want
- 14 them to stay in this area.
- But if we don't repower Dunkirk
- 16 and keep the jobs and keep that plant in this
- 17 county and in the city of Dunkirk what is going to
- 18 be left? Nothing.
- 19 All the businesses that are
- 20 presently, you know, in Dunkirk, are they going to
- 21 take this forty percent tax increase and keep their
- 22 business here? Not likely.
- I worked at Carriage House for
- 24 all those years and I mean we just slowed down our
- 25 plant in Dunkirk.

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20132. Fortunately our new owners aren't 3 doing too much towards, you know, getting rid of jobs as much as they could have. And in fact we 4 5 still have hopes that maybe they'll regenerate the work at our other plant in Dunkirk. But if the 6 7 taxes go up, what incentive do they have? They 8 don't. 9 They're going to look and move 10 those jobs down to Kentucky where they have moved 11 some of the jobs already. The taxes go up in this 12 county, that business is probably going to move 13 down to Kentucky and we're going to have four 14 hundred and some people out on the streets looking 15 for work and there's no work going to be here. 16 I already had a couple of my kids 17 say that things are getting really expensive in New 18 York State. If their taxes keep going up on their 19 houses and everything they're going to move to 20 Pennsylvania or other places. And this is why --21 you know, I'd like to keep my family here. So I'm 22 hoping that the Commission in their wisdom will 23 side with repowering Dunkirk and keep out these 24 possible fumes from Ohio and Pennsylvania.

25

This slight of hand that National

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Grid is trying to throw at us, it should be
- 3 ignored. And quite -- all it's going to do is
- 4 bring in this power that's already being made by
- 5 coal.
- 6 Personally I happen to pay my
- 7 dues every year to Sierra Club, but I have to look
- 8 at the reality of the situation. Yes, the people
- 9 have come forth and said, yeah we should be pushing
- 10 more for New York State to do all those things, but
- 11 that's some time in the future. It's not now.
- 12 We have to realize that we have
- 13 to deal with the present and work for the future.
- 14 And, yes, I really hope that someday we will have
- 15 renewable energy as the main source of our power in
- 16 the state. We have to look at our reality of what
- 17 it is now. We need to keep this plant going for
- 18 our community and hopefully for the rest of the
- 19 state. Thank you.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: I'm just going
- 21 to remind folks while we're here till -- we
- 22 promised to be here till eleven tonight, we are
- 23 about fifteen speakers through eighty.
- So please try to keep your
- 25 comments to two minutes. Any comments that you

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 have written out I'm more than happy to take back
- 3 and I will ensure that they're inserted in the
- 4 record and you will see them on the web.
- 5 The next five speakers are Gus
- 6 Potkovich. You told me that.
- 7 Raphael Muller,
- 8 Ellen DiTonto,
- 9 Dan Kavanaugh and
- Jeff Bulger.
- 11 Sorry, Gus.
- MR. POTKOVICH: Oh, no problem.
- 13 It happens all the time. First of all, I'd like to
- 14 welcome the Public Service Commission to Chautauqua
- 15 County, Dunkirk/Fredonia. Thank you.
- I don't want to take up the time
- thanking everybody individually because I probably
- 18 know half of them in here. But I'd like to thank
- 19 Dunkirk/Fredonia and Chautauqua County for what --
- 20 everybody here today, you guys really rock. You
- 21 really do.
- 22 My name is Gus Potkovich. I'm a
- 23 union rep at N.R.G. I've been there thirty-three
- 24 years. I've lived in Fredonia, Chautauqua County,
- 25 for thirty-eight years.

1	Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013
2	It's hard to believe that not
3	long ago Niagara Mohawk owned the Dunkirk plant and
4	had the obligation before deregulation to ensure
5	that it maintained adequate New York State based
6	power generation for reliability in a spinning
7	reverse, both for potential new customers and days
8	of high electric demand like we'll probably
9	experience this week.
10	Deregulation told Niagara Mohawk
11	that generating power was no longer any of its
12	business, but it is the business of New York State
13	Public Service Commission to ensure we have an
14	adequate supply of New York State home-grown power
15	for energy independence and that a competitive
16	power market for New York generation is strictly
17	adhered to.
18	How is it fair then for power
19	generators that believe they could do business in
20	New York on a level playing field to be subject to
21	RGGI costs while transmission owners have no
22	restrictions on importing power from the non-RGGI
23	states like Pennsylvania?
24	What happens if imports
25	necessarily replaced Dunkirk become unavailable or

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 power lines in other states in New York will be
- 3 newly dependent, unfair? What recourse does the
- 4 New York State Public Service Commission have over
- 5 neglected transmission lines from other states that
- 6 cause power outages for New Yorkers?
- 7 The current Dunkirk plant is
- 8 struggling in part due to natural gas prices. But,
- 9 is -- but it is also struggling because of the
- 10 state-imposed costs such as RGGI and a long
- 11 neglected downstate transmission bottleneck which
- 12 the governor has addressed, but the work has yet to
- 13 begin.
- 14 If the P.S.C. wants to allow
- 15 investment in transmission it should expedite the
- transmission work identified by the governor's
- 17 energy highway blueprint, so more upstate power can
- 18 access the downstate demand areas, not -- not --
- 19 not transmission plants that threaten New York
- 20 power generators by importing power from non-RGGI
- 21 states.
- 22 Ouestion: Is New York State
- 23 calculating the payment schedule to reimburse our
- 24 region for lost jobs and taxes, should they deny
- 25 the Dunkirk repowering. Are these costs part of

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 what you are considering?
- 3 If New York State contributed to
- 4 putting this plant out of business New York State
- 5 should be held liable for the staggering hard costs
- 6 to this region. Real simple, repower Dunkirk now.
- 7 Thank you.
- 8 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Mr. Muller?
- 9 MR. MULLER: My name is Raphael
- 10 Muller, Jr. and I'm a recent graduate from Dunkirk
- 11 High School. I'll be attending the University at
- 12 Buffalo majoring in engineering.
- This issue was brought up to me
- 14 during an interview -- interview to become a boy
- 15 state delegate a year ago.
- Posing such a question to me that
- 17 I was not completely aware of made me ponder on the
- 18 topic. N.R.G. is a vital, essential and a
- 19 necessity in our community. Without it our city
- 20 will suffer more than it has already. I believe
- 21 the city, the county and western New York need to
- 22 believe in repowering N.R.G. and it will be the
- 23 start of Dunkirk's and the county's regrowth and
- 24 comeback.
- I still believe in this city and

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 the county I grew up in. And I want to one day
- 3 come back and help make it prosper once again.
- 4 That's why we need to repower
- 5 N.R.G.
- 6 Thank you.
- 7 MS. DITONTO: Good evening, Judge
- 8 Harriman, Commissioner. Thank you for the time
- 9 tonight.
- 10 My name is Ellen DiTonto. I
- 11 reside in Jamestown, New York. I'm representing my
- 12 employer tonight, D.F.T. Communications, 40 Temple
- 13 Street, Fredonia.
- D.F.T. Communications is a
- 15 regional technology services provider based here in
- 16 Fredonia. Our company has evolved over a hundred
- 17 and fifteen years from a traditional telephone
- 18 company, Dunkirk and Fredonia Telephone, to a
- 19 multi-faceted services small business.
- D.F.T. Communications provides
- 21 jobs for like eighty local residents and pays
- 22 considerable state and county taxes as well as
- 23 village of Fredonia and city of Jamestown taxes.
- Our remarks here tonight center
- on the economic stability of Chautauqua County if

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 the repowering project at the Dunkirk generating --
- 3 at the Dunkirk generating station is not approved.
- A review of statistics for our
- 5 region paint a less than optimistic picture. We
- 6 have suffered from continuous population decline,
- 7 high levels of exporting our young people including
- 8 my children to more prosperous growing areas of the
- 9 country, closed businesses and reduced
- 10 opportunities for residents seeking a living wage,
- 11 high unemployment rates and the lack of new
- development in both the business and housing
- 13 sectors.
- 14 What these statistics do not tell
- 15 you is the resilience that is part of the culture
- 16 here in Chautauqua County.
- We have high performing students,
- 18 high performing schools. We have two exceptional
- 19 higher education institutions in Jamestown
- 20 Community College and the State University of New
- 21 York at Fredonia. We are home to the world renown
- 22 Chautaugua Institution.
- We have a diversified economy
- 24 with agriculture, manufacturing, tourism and
- 25 services. We are encouraging entrepreneurship as a

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 way of building new opportunities for our youth and
- 3 reinvigorating the mature talent that has emerged
- 4 from the recession.
- 5 Chautauqua County is on the verge
- 6 of coming out of a long and debilitating recession.
- 7 The repowering of the Dunkirk generating plant will
- 8 act as a catalyst for the economic stability here.
- 9 Most importantly, the continued operation of this
- 10 plant will ensure a stable tax base for the county.
- 11 The importance of this should not be overlooked.
- 12 The Dunkirk generating plant is
- one of the largest taxpayers in Chautauqua County
- 14 as well as the largest taxpayer in the city of
- 15 Dunkirk and the Dunkirk School District.
- As a small business in Chautauqua
- 17 County, D.F.T. Communications would not be able to
- 18 sustain a double digit tax increase in local taxes
- 19 if the Dunkirk generating plant is mothballed.
- D.F.T. has invested heavily in
- 21 Chautauqua County in the last five years, for
- 22 example, posted ten million dollars in capital
- 23 infrastructure improvement. Our annual payroll
- 24 injects four million dollars to the local economy.
- 25 We pay more than our fair share of taxes.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 If the repowering project is not
- 3 approved Chautauqua County will lose one of its
- 4 largest taxpayers. We will lose much-needed
- 5 revenue to provide services to our residents. We
- 6 will lose more jobs and more people. Our future
- 7 will forever be tainted by a decision that will be
- 8 made not by the people who have to live with the
- 9 consequences, but by people who lack an
- 10 understanding of the critical nature of the Dunkirk
- 11 generating station to our region.
- The repowering project will mean
- 13 the continuation of a reliable power source, the
- 14 conversion of gas and the change to a combined
- 15 cycle plant will help reduce emissions and improve
- 16 air quality.
- By supporting the repowering
- 18 option the P.S.C. will be supporting the viability
- 19 of Chautauqua County. Repowering equals
- 20 revitalization and gives Chautauqua County a
- 21 fighting chance to survive against incredible odds.
- Do what is right for Chautaugua
- 23 County, vote at the P.S.C. to accept the repowering
- 24 project and keep Chautauqua County on the path
- 25 toward revitalization and growth.

```
1
                 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013
 2.
                       Thank you.
 3
                       A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Dan Kavanaugh?
 4
                       Jeff Bulger?
 5
                       MR. BULGER: Hello. My name's
     Jeff Bulger. I'm a lifelong resident of this
 6
 7
     county and an employee for N.R.G.
 8
                       First of all, I want to thank you
 9
     all for coming and letting us speak. I would -- or
10
     I'd ask you to please go for the repower of Dunkirk
11
     not only for the benefit of my family and
12
     everything, the local community. And I would also
13
     prefer to support New York State businesses rather
14
     than Pennsylvania and Canada. Thank you.
15
                       A.L.J. HARRIMAN: The next five
16
     speakers will be:
17
                       Chris Reynolds,
18
                       Michael McCoy,
19
                       Carson Leikam,
20
                       Robert Benjamin and
21
                       Bill Daly.
22
                       MR. REYNOLDS: Thank you. My
23
     name is Chris Reynolds. I live in Cassadaga, New
24
     York.
25
                       I moved to this county seven
```

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 years ago. I moved in, took a job with N.R.G. and
- 3 I thought what a great community, you know. We got
- 4 a community that's backed -- the company that I
- 5 work for, which is N.R.G., supports the community
- 6 and the county. They go way out of their way to do
- 7 better things at Camp Gross which resides up here
- 8 in Cassadaga, we do a lot of day caring work. So I
- 9 can only hope that we go for the repowering project
- 10 at Dunkirk.
- 11 Thank you.
- 12 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Michael McCoy?
- MR. McCOY: My name is Michael
- 14 McCoy. I'm a resident of Mayville.
- My wife and I own a beautiful
- 16 home there. We both work in Chautauqua County. My
- 17 concern is with National -- with National Grid's
- 18 position deals with the concern of reliability of
- 19 service. A few years ago I considered the
- 20 possibility of relocating to another area and as
- 21 part of the consideration did some checking online
- 22 for homes for sale in that area.
- I remember that I was surprised
- 24 and impressed that the first home I looked at
- 25 online came equipped with an automatic electrical

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 generator that came on automatically if the power
- 3 went off.
- I remember thinking wow, that's
- 5 really cool. Those are really rare in this area
- 6 and only a few people have them and wouldn't it be
- 7 nice to have one of those.
- 8 However, when the second house I
- 9 checked into and the third and several others also
- 10 all had automatic generators that came on when the
- 11 power went off it hit me, they surely must have
- 12 them for a reason and the reason must be that they
- 13 get hit with frequent power outages.
- Not very many residential homes
- in Chautauqua County have automatic backup power
- 16 generators that come on when the power goes off.
- 17 And we don't want to start having a reason to need
- 18 to have them.
- 19 With the N.R.G. generating
- 20 station in Dunkirk the supply of electrical power
- 21 has historically been very reliable in this region
- 22 of the state and outages that have occurred have
- 23 mostly been related to transmission system failures
- 24 such as heavy snow, windstorm and tornado-related
- 25 causes of downed wires, poles or transformer

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 failures.
- 3 Therefore my request is that the
- 4 members of the Public Service Commission strongly
- 5 consider the question of reliability of service
- 6 when evaluating National Grid's assertion that they
- 7 can provide for the power needs of our region
- 8 simply by delivering power from far away through
- 9 upgrades of transmission lines.
- Thank you.
- MR. LEIKAM: Good evening. My
- 12 name is Carson Leikam and you can remember that as
- 13 some do, some don't. All right?
- I'm a longtime resident of the
- 15 county and I'm also an employee of N.R.G. And more
- 16 specifically, I'm the general manager for New York
- and New England and both the Huntley and Dunkirk
- 18 stations are as such that I'm responsible for. And
- 19 I (applause) -- thank you. I'd like to start out
- 20 just asking a question.
- 21 Wouldn't it be wonderful if we
- 22 could do anything with nothing forever? But that's
- 23 not very realistic. And what I'm talking about
- 24 here is renewables and sustainability. It's a big
- 25 part of N.R.G.'s look into the future and to being

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 the Twenty-first century energy company. That's --
- 3 that's our vision. And renewables and
- 4 sustainability is certainly a part of that.
- 5 And what I would say to the
- 6 Sierra Club and the Business Council of the state
- 7 of New York, there are some lines being drawn that
- 8 don't need to be drawn. Having a fast-start gas
- 9 facility and having renewables are not mutually
- 10 exclusive.
- 11 As a matter of fact they're
- 12 dependent on one another to provide a quality
- 13 product that if we do both of those things in
- 14 Western New York and we follow through with the
- 15 energy highway it will actually allow an increase
- in the amount of wind power that can be developed
- 17 and then sent downstate and make some money and
- 18 bring that home to Western New York. All right?
- 19 They're not exclusive.
- 20 And lastly, because others that
- 21 have gone before have been so thorough, the last
- 22 thing I'd like to say is that if National Grid
- doesn't know where the next megawatt is coming
- 24 from, but -- by their admission it would be the
- 25 next most efficient megawatt, let's build the most

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 efficient plant in the state right here at Dunkirk.
- 3 Then we'll know where the next most efficient
- 4 megawatt is going to come from.
- 5 MR. BENJAMIN: Your Honor,
- 6 Chairman Brown, Department of Public Service, thank
- 7 you for coming down here today. We really
- 8 appreciate it because what's happening is very
- 9 important not just to Chautauqua County, but to New
- 10 York State.
- 11 My name is Robert Benjamin and I
- 12 come before you not as a politician, not as a
- 13 businessman, but as a father. If you want to see
- 14 the future of New York State it's right over there.
- 15 I brought my children today. They're here for a
- 16 reason because if we are going to grow as an
- 17 economy that is what we need to think about is our
- 18 future and their future. And if we are going to
- 19 grow as an economy in Chautauqua County N.R.G. is
- 20 critical to our growth because businesses are not
- 21 going to come here unless we can provide them with
- 22 reliable low-cost power. They're not going to come
- 23 here because we can pipe energy in from some other
- 24 state.
- They're going to come here

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 because we have the resources they need. They're
- 3 going to come here because we can provide them an
- 4 environment that is going to be friendly to
- 5 business and to industry and N.R.G. is the answer
- 6 to that. Thank you.
- 7 MR. DALY: Good evening. Welcome
- 8 again to Chautauqua County. It's nice that we have
- 9 some western New York folks here, you understand.
- I'm director of the Chautauqua
- 11 County I.D.A., director of Planning and Economic
- 12 Development for the county. My name is Bill Daly.
- Probably the greatest mantra in
- 14 economic development, which is one of your missions
- 15 by statute now to consider is business retention
- 16 and expansion.
- In fact if you go to get a degree
- in economic development or a certification that is
- 19 a must-take course. Can you imagine a developer's
- 20 dream when an existing business comes to you and
- 21 says hey, we want to stay and we're going to put
- 22 five hundred and fifty million dollars into our
- 23 plant?
- Thank you, Lee Davis.
- But it's not the first time. We

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 work with them extensively. We've had hundreds of
- 3 hours of conversations to keep them in the city of
- 4 Dunkirk. What they did back in the 2000s, they got
- 5 low sulfur coal from Wyoming. They spent more
- 6 money for the coal and for the transportation and
- 7 it generates less heat. That's what turns the
- 8 turbines. But they did that. People forget that.
- 9 Then several years ago they spent
- 10 two hundred and six million dollars because we did
- 11 the PILOT and they had to certify that to us. So
- 12 think about this. They went low sulfur coal and
- 13 then they put a two hundred and six million dollar
- 14 investment on that in Lake Shore with a hundred and
- 15 sixty-five of the highest paid employer --
- 16 employees in Chautauqua County.
- So my hat's off to N.R.G. because
- 18 they've stayed and they're fighting the good fight
- 19 to stay here even longer.
- One of the things you hear about
- 21 locally, certainly I did because I'm involved in a
- 22 lot of the regional economic development councils
- 23 the governor has now. You're all familiar with
- 24 them I'm sure.
- In the first go-around for the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 whole state two years go was a billion dollars.
- 3 They're offering five hundred and fifty million
- 4 right now. The second year it was less money
- 5 statewide, but the Governor came up with the
- 6 Buffalo billion.
- 7 You have the opportunity, Public
- 8 Service Commission, to create and make sure the
- 9 Dunkirk half billion happens.
- 10 I'd like to thank everybody who
- 11 has spoken tonight from their hearts. But I really
- 12 have to thank the folks at N.R.G., great effort.
- 13 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: I'm going to
- 14 read the next five names, but before I do that I
- 15 just want to remind folks that if you feel that
- 16 you -- you have to leave for personal reasons,
- family commitments or getting up tomorrow for work,
- 18 go ahead and leave. The fax sheet that Scott Dean
- 19 has has a variety of ways you can provide your
- 20 comment for the record including telephone, hard
- 21 mail and email. But we'll continue on.
- 22 Next five names:
- Sean Murphy,
- Nancy Baker,
- 25 Greg Krouza,

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Tom Phillips.
- 3 And this is going to be a tough
- 4 one, Reva Byczynski.
- 5 I did it? All right.
- MR. MURPHY: Good evening. My
- 7 name is Sean Murphy. I live here in the village of
- 8 Fredonia. A quick thank you to those who made this
- 9 public hearing possible tonight.
- 10 As an employee of N.R.G., a
- 11 member of I.B.D.W., Local 97, a lifelong resident
- 12 and a thirty-year property taxpayer here in
- 13 Chautauqua County, I would like to enter the record
- 14 in absolute full support of the N.R.G. repowering
- 15 proposal as presented here tonight.
- This option not only preserves
- 17 employment at the plant, but provides for the
- 18 hundreds of other jobs tied to the large tax base
- 19 this facility provides here in the county. The
- 20 repowering option is the most sensible, reliable
- 21 and physically responsible decision that can be
- 22 made after the facts are analyzed and digested
- 23 properly.
- I strongly encourage the P.S.C.
- 25 to make a sound conclusion, based on all these

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 facts, and find in N.R.G.'s favor. I simply
- 3 request that the honorable members of the P.S.C.
- 4 let their conscious be their guide and truly serve
- 5 the public interest that's been shown here tonight.
- Thank you for your time.
- 7 MS. BAKER: My name's Nancy Baker
- 8 and it has been my honor to represent the teachers
- 9 in Dunkirk as the Dunkirk Teachers' Association
- 10 president for the past year.
- 11 My goal this evening -- my goal
- 12 this evening is to shed light on the effect that
- 13 closing N.R.G. will have on the children, the
- 14 parents, the community and the teachers in Dunkirk.
- The loss of over four million
- 16 dollars in revenue that N.R.G. provides to the
- 17 Dunkirk City School System would be devastating.
- The loss of revenue equates to
- 19 fifty-eight teaching positions that may be cut in a
- 20 district that already struggles with economic
- 21 issues, transiency, and low student performance.
- 22 Cuts in teaching staff would
- 23 increase students for classrooms and cut important
- 24 program that help our students close the gap
- 25 between themselves and their peers in other

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 higher-performing school districts. When I think
- 3 of what programs may have to be cut if fifty-eight
- 4 positions are in danger it is staggering.
- 5 We are not talking about fluff.
- 6 Dunkirk does not have any fluff. These are all
- 7 courses and programs that are vital to our
- 8 students' success. I envision not only cuts to
- 9 core departments, like English, math, social
- 10 studies and science but also cuts to art, music,
- 11 foreign language, technology, English as a second
- 12 language, remedial reading, remedial math, academic
- 13 intervention services.
- 14 Unfortunately I could go on and
- on. These are all courses and programs that allow
- our students the chance to close the gap, to
- 17 compete for college acceptance and prepare for the
- 18 world of work.
- Not only will students suffer but
- 20 families in the community as well will suffer.
- 21 Cuts in teaching staff and programs make a
- 22 community less attractive to potential homebuyers
- 23 and businesses that may be looking to locate in our
- 24 area. Cuts of fifty-eight teachers will lead to
- one less wage-earner in each of those households,

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 less money added to the area economy, less
- 3 opportunity for children in those families.
- 4 This morning I read an article in
- 5 the Buffalo News in which a member of the Citizen's
- 6 Campaign for the Environment asked if we are
- 7 keeping a few jobs to continue to pollute our air
- 8 and our drinking water with dangerous fossil fuels.
- 9 Look around, these are some of
- 10 those few jobs. These are some of those
- 11 fifty-eight teaching positions that may be lost.
- 12 That is not a few jobs. Seventy
- 13 N.R.G. employees is not a few jobs. Five hundred
- jobs that could be created over a three-year period
- is not a few jobs. In addition repowering N.R.G.
- 16 will create the cleanest and most efficient power
- 17 plant in New York State.
- 18 The Dunkirk Teachers' Association
- 19 strongly urges the Public Service Commission to
- 20 protect the future of the students, the families,
- 21 the teachers and the community in Dunkirk and the
- 22 surrounding area for the decision to repower N.R.G.
- Thank you.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Thank you.
- 25 Next we have Greg Krouza.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 MR. KROUZA: Close enough. Thank
- 3 you. Thank you for listening to our concerns and
- 4 for the opportunity to speak.
- 5 As a lifelong resident, property
- 6 owner, director of development for the Chautauqua
- 7 County chamber, as a past one of those guys,
- 8 teacher, history teacher and a past mayor of the
- 9 city, it's important for me to point out that this
- 10 could be the single biggest decision made for
- 11 Dunkirk in the last hundred and fifty years.
- The last one didn't go so well.
- 13 When they moved the western terminus of the New
- 14 York and Erie Railroad from Dunkirk to Buffalo and
- 15 along with it the -- the -- the workshop that went
- 16 with it. Well, thank God we had Horatio Brooks.
- 17 He invested in Dunkirk. He started the Brooks
- 18 Locomotive Works and that drove Dunkirk's economic
- 19 engine for the next hundred years.
- When that plant closed in 1962 it
- 21 was quickly followed by the exodus of the steel
- 22 industry, plant and retail closings, urban renewal
- 23 that left us unfulfilled, but through that all we
- 24 persevered and now just as we see positive activity
- 25 this ruling jeopardizes that progress.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- N.R.G.'s recent investment of
- 3 private dollars to address environmental needs as
- 4 well as their desire to invest another half a
- 5 billion dollars is a significant part of that
- 6 progress. This -- your ruling is key component to
- 7 the continuation of this progress.
- 8 Please allow N.R.G. to be this
- 9 era's Brooks Locomotive Works that drives Dunkirk's
- 10 economic engine for the next hundred years.
- 11 At the chamber we continuously
- 12 promote buy local. That can only happen when local
- 13 companies commit to invest in themselves in the
- 14 area and produce a quality product. That's what we
- 15 are asking you to allow to happen. Let the good
- 16 work and commitment N.R.G. has made in our
- 17 community, our county and our state be recognized.
- 18 Allow N.R.G. to invest in itself
- in our long-term needs and give New York residents
- 20 and businesses the opportunity to buy local. Thank
- 21 you.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Tom Phillips?
- 23 It's all been -- okay. Reva -- oh, I'm going to
- 24 kill this, Byczynski. I said it right the first
- 25 time; right?

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- MS. BYCZYNSKI: Yes, you did.
- 3 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: All right.
- 4 MS. BYCZYNSKI: Good evening and
- 5 thank you for letting me speak.
- 6 My name is Reva Byczynski. I
- 7 live at 616 Brigham Road in Dunkirk, New York. I'm
- 8 a taxpayer and a homeowner.
- 9 I am urging the P.S.C. to vote
- 10 yes on the repowering of our N.R.G. plant in
- 11 Dunkirk. I have lived in Dunkirk all my life and
- 12 have been a part of and seen the decline of over a
- dozen factories through the years.
- I currently work for the Health
- 15 and Human Services Department in the Employment
- 16 Unit. If we have anymore job losses the welfare
- 17 office will not be able to handle the increased
- 18 need of services in the community such as SNAP
- 19 benefits, cash assistance and Medicaid.
- The poverty level will certainly
- 21 increase above the twenty-eight point five percent.
- 22 The quality of life as we know it will drastically
- 23 change if we lose the taxes from N.R.G. and from
- 24 the fallout of our many -- of our working citizens
- 25 who may have to relocate due to the tremendous

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20132. increase in our taxes. 3 I'm looking forward to retiring 4 I will not be able to maintain my home and 5 my standard of living if N.R.G. is allowed to close. I am urging this Commission to hook up 6 7 clean gas. With the changes in our climate the 8 Great Lakes region will be the go-to place for industries. The citizens of Dunkirk and Chautauqua 9 10 County must be able to maintain and better their 11 quality of life by attracting jobs, maintaining our 12 school system for future generations. 13 Governor Cuomo is promoting his 14 job initiative. Without the continuation of N.R.G. 15 in this county his promises are worthless. 16 Thank you for your time. 17 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: The next five 18 speakers: 19 Frank Pagano, 20 Sheila Miller, 21 Bob Banikowski, 22 Susie Coniglio and 2.3 Paul Cyburt. 2.4 MR. PAGANO: Thank you very much

forgiving me the opportunity to speak tonight. A

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 lot of the speakers before me have been more
- 3 eloquent and have stated the facts even better.
- I thank Cathy Young, our senator
- 5 for representing us so well and Andrew Goodell, our
- 6 assemblyman. I think they said it better than most
- 7 people. Actually that teacher said it the best for
- 8 everybody.
- 9 But I would like to tell you I'm
- 10 the former mayor of the village of Fredonia. I'm
- 11 also the former I.D.A. chairman of Chautauqua
- 12 County. And I'm currently the chairman of the
- 13 College Council here on the campus. And thank you
- 14 very much for coming, all of you.
- What I'd like to say is last
- 16 Wednesday I had the opportunity to listen to
- 17 Governor Cuomo speak at the J.C.C. campus in
- 18 Jamestown. And at that time he said and I -- I
- 19 think I can quote him pretty accurately, he said
- 20 Chautauqua County and western New York and
- 21 especially Chautauqua County have suffered through
- 22 forty years of recession. This is the area of the
- 23 state that's been forgotten.
- And he's pledged to us here in
- 25 Chautauqua County that he's going to work to turn

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 this around. And part of that, as you know, is the
- 3 new Start Up New York Initiative.
- 4 We can't continue to ask our
- 5 industry to come if we're going to have increases
- 6 in taxes of forty-two percent. It's just not
- 7 logical.
- I think N.R.G.'s energy plan is a
- 9 wonderful plan, state-of-the-art plant that can
- 10 serve us for years to come. When I was the
- 11 chairman of the I.D.A. we at that time extended
- 12 N.R.G.'s PILOT program. And the residents of
- 13 Chautauqua County and especially the residents of
- 14 the city of Dunkirk took a hit on their taxes.
- They sacrificed so that N.R.G.
- 16 could stay here. We took quite a beating over that
- 17 decision at the time, but we thought it was the
- 18 best decision in order to keep N.R.G. and the --
- 19 the jobs that they created here in Chautauqua
- 20 County.
- Once again N.R.G. needs help. I
- think that the best way to do it is to allow them
- 23 to re-tool. Actually I feel sorry for the young
- 24 man from National Grid you're not in a very popular
- 25 position here tonight. And -- and you're quite a

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 guy for sticking around.
- But anyway, I think you skirted
- 4 around a lot of the questions and answers tonight
- 5 without really giving some really good answers.
- 6 And my grandfather used to
- 7 have -- my grandfather used to have an old saying.
- 8 He said you can put lipstick on a pig, but it's
- 9 still a pig.
- So with that, thank you very much
- 11 for having me here tonight and good luck N.R.G.
- 12 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Sheila Miller?
- Bob Banikowski -- Banikowski --
- 14 Banikowski? Okay. He's gone?
- 15 Susie Coniglio?
- 16 All right. Paul Cyburt --
- 17 Cyburt? Is he here? No?
- 18 Melissa Rodriguez?
- MS. RODRIGUEZ: Hello. My name
- 20 is Melissa Rodriguez. I'm a student representative
- 21 from Dunkirk High School.
- I want to speak about the issue
- 23 at hand. I believe N.R.G. should remain here in
- 24 Dunkirk and proceed on the repowering of the plant
- 25 because without the financial support of N.R.G. the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 citizens of Dunkirk are going to suffer.
- 3 The citizens of Dunkirk will be
- 4 in a state of panic if we lose N.R.G. because
- 5 N.R.G. plays a big role in our community. If
- 6 N.R.G. does not continue to be a financial provider
- 7 for the city of Dunkirk teachers will lose their
- 8 jobs electives and some of our athletics may be cut
- 9 and taxes will be raised.
- Being a senior at Dunkirk High
- 11 School I have already been affected by the cuts
- 12 made to the decrease in our budget. As I was
- 13 making my class schedule for the upcoming school
- 14 year I realized that many of our electives were
- 15 cut.
- For me the biggest disappointment
- 17 was mythology because I was planning to take it
- 18 during my senior year. Now that I am old enough to
- 19 work I know how irritating it is to get money taken
- 20 away for taxes.
- 21 And if N.R.G. decides to not
- 22 build the natural gas plant taxes will have to be
- 23 raised forty-two percent to make up for the loss of
- 24 revenue or fifty-eight teachers will be cut --
- 25 fifty-eight.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 And we cannot afford to raise
- 3 taxes and we care too much about the people in our
- 4 community to allow fifty-eight people to lose their
- 5 jobs.
- If N.R.G. does repower the plant
- 7 it will be an incredible impact on the economy here
- 8 in Chautauqua County. Workers will have to be
- 9 hired on the plant which means less people will be
- 10 unemployed and can start a domino effect in our
- 11 economy.
- So as a voice of the students at
- 13 Dunkirk High School I'd ask that N.R.G. repower in
- 14 Dunkirk.
- Thank you.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Doug Champ?
- MR. CHAMP: This process I've
- 18 been through before.
- I'm a former utility manager. I
- 20 also was chairman of Chautauqua County Energy
- 21 Conference and Expo. I know N.R.G. I know
- 22 National Grid. We can't work without the process
- 23 of generation and transmission.
- I'm not going to go into tonight
- 25 and explain the dynamics of power generation, but

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 there is one ingredient here that you will forfeit.
- 3 It's a possibility that development of a thermal
- 4 loop arising out of the maintaining National Grid's
- 5 assets.
- The thermal loop which exists
- 7 provides thermal heating for a community. That is
- 8 a distinct possibility. I've built and developed
- 9 one in Jamestown, New York.
- The principle of utilities are
- 11 key to our communities. I've seen when utilities
- 12 have been dismantled in other parts of the country.
- 13 I've given speeches around the country about
- 14 energy -- energy education.
- The renewable processes are not
- 16 here yet. They're not here because they cannot be
- integrated on the grids that we have in our
- 18 country. We have three grids. They're all in
- 19 disrepair.
- 20 National Grid has been trying to
- 21 reassess how they're going to reinvest in their
- 22 grid. Whether or not N.R.G. is the position they
- 23 have to reinvest in their grid because low volt is
- 24 just a critical issue throughout the state of New
- 25 York.

Page 97

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 And how that's transferred is
- 3 extremely important, but utility workers that I
- 4 have managed are key to the community, which they
- 5 live in. They volunteer. They provide earnings
- 6 and income for their families.
- 7 And this asset, if it's
- 8 dismantled will crumble Dunkirk. There's no
- 9 question in my mind because I've been in other
- 10 areas and I've seen where utilities have been
- 11 driven out of business, some for the right reasons,
- 12 but not this time.
- So in mind of this, in terms of
- 14 engineering and asset development and use, which
- 15 the utility they have in place now for you
- 16 dismantle this utility the five hundred megawatts
- 17 will have to be made up.
- Now five hundred megawatts in the
- 19 whole spectrum of things is not a lot of megawatts,
- 20 but in Dunkirk, New York, it means a lot more than
- 21 a megawatt in terms of a job that's going to be
- lost, in terms of people who depend on these people
- 23 with a trickle down effect. Energy jobs in every
- 24 community have a tremendous value associated with
- 25 what happens in that community and the surrounding

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 area.
- 3 So I'm here from the southern
- 4 county of New York which has to be one of our
- 5 poorest counties, not to the hard effects of people
- 6 wanting to live here and work here. Its dynamics
- 7 have been lost due to out-migration. I have three
- 8 daughters. Most of them live in other places
- 9 because they don't have a job.
- 10 So, you want to remove a
- 11 facility, remove an asset that offers job
- 12 potential, job creation, because remember utilities
- 13 are classrooms of teaching, education, not only for
- 14 their employees, but they will have new ideas.
- N.R.G. and National Grid are fine
- 16 companies, but they create things. They move
- 17 things. But we can not just look at dissolving a
- 18 utility because of transmission difficulties which
- 19 National Grid has anyway.
- So I'm here to support this
- 21 project of repowering N.R.G. They are a quality
- 22 industry as is National Grid, but you're going to
- lose a lot more if you allow this to take place, I
- 24 guarantee you that.
- Thank you.

Page 99

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: John, I'm going
- 3 to spell the last name, S-E-D-Y-S-C-Y-V. There was
- 4 no way I was pronouncing that one.
- 5 I'll listen and see.
- 6 MR. SEDYSCYV: My name is John
- 7 Sedyscyv. I worked for N.R.G. for thirty years. I
- 8 had the honor to represent the workers. I was a
- 9 union rep, two hundred and thirteen at one time.
- 10 And as I go past my time as a
- 11 union rep, things come across my mind tonight like
- 12 my first day on the job. I was taken down to the
- 13 second floor by the plant superintendent and he
- 14 showed me this bulletin board. And, he says now
- 15 that you're the union rep you need to see this.
- 16 And basically what it said was this plant is a
- 17 national security plant. It's put here for a
- 18 reason. It was put here for a reason. And
- 19 basically he was telling me that we're going to
- 20 keep working if we have problems and we'll settle
- 21 them later, which that plant has done for the last
- 22 thirty years that I know of.
- In 1999 I sat in and heard that
- 24 we can no longer make it and sell it. So the
- 25 Public Service Commission divided us, but now you

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 have the power -- and you have the power to give
- 3 National Grid the right to distribute it and decide
- 4 who's going to make it. They have that power,
- 5 that -- National Grid can close the doors at
- 6 Dunkirk by just saying we're not going to use their
- 7 power. What can Dunkirk do? You have the power to
- 8 change that.
- 9 The -- the plant has done well.
- 10 The power is always there, but yet you're letting
- one company decide our community, everything.
- 12 Because if National Grid today
- 13 says we're okay with N.R.G., we're fine, but if
- 14 they say no, we're not.
- 15 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: I'm going to
- 16 call the next five names:
- 17 Keith Aulstrom,
- 18 George Borrello,
- 19 Kathy Tampio,
- John Hollins and
- 21 Todd Tranum.
- 22 First up is Keith Aulstrom.
- MR. AULSTROM: Thank you. Mr.
- 24 Commissioner, and the rest of the Public Service
- 25 Commission, I speak tonight as a lifelong resident

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- of Dunkirk. And for those of you that weren't able
- 3 to be here tonight I think it's important for you
- 4 to realize the group of people and the cross
- 5 representation of this community that has taken the
- 6 time on a hot summer night to spend way too many
- 7 hours doing something that they feel is very
- 8 important because we have had tonight probably
- 9 every community leader from this end of our county
- 10 including our state representatives.
- We have had union leaders, both
- 12 private and public, we have had school teachers,
- 13 firefighters, policemen, sheriffs, deputy sheriffs,
- 14 state police.
- We have had representatives from
- 16 private industries here tonight. We have had
- 17 democrats, republicans, conservatives, liberals,
- independents, and for the most part other than a
- 19 couple of the environmental groups that you heard
- 20 here tonight and that I am sure that you will hear
- 21 no matter where you go on this issue, all of them
- 22 are in favor of the repower in Dunkirk.
- 23 And that's important that you
- look and you see and that as commissioners you hear
- 25 how vital this is.

Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20131 2. Those of us that have lived here all our lives as numerous speakers have said, we 3 have already gone through tough times. We have 4 5 lost industries that thirty years ago employed seventeen hundred in one steel plant, four and five 6 7 hundred in another area. But we had over probably 8 three thousand steelworkers working, that are no 9 longer here. They are no longer a part of our tax 10 base and they are never again going to be a part of 11 it. 12 We have to a certain extent been 13 able to reinvent ourselves into an area that is 14 very proud of our three major food processing plants in this area. But they are industries that 15 16 rely on a number of things and one of them is 17 reliable and inexpensive electricity. 18 This program is going to deliver 19 it to them in more than one way because not only 20 does it deliver to them because we will have better 21 reliability if we have the ability for N.R.G. to be 22 here. We're also going to have the stability that 23 comes with it with having the ability to know what 24 our future is going to be. We thought that we had

that here in this community a number of times in

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 regard to the steam station.
- Going back to when -- the first
- 4 PILOT agreement when it was previously owned by
- 5 Niagara Mohawk, every time that we signed an
- 6 agreement with -- with a company we felt that well,
- 7 here we are, now we have the stability that we
- 8 need. Now we have the base that our other
- 9 industries can see, we have a future.
- The last PILOT agreement which
- 11 was signed I believe three or four years ago went
- 12 out fourteen, fifteen years quaranteeing us a
- 13 future. But now here we are after a two hundred
- 14 million dollar investment to clean up what
- 15 everybody would admit going back thirty years ago
- 16 was not a pretty plant.
- I happened to have the pleasure
- 18 of living about a thousand feet from the plant.
- 19 I've lived through the days when I first moved into
- 20 my house in 1977 where I was foolish to go as the
- 21 first new car that we bought, bought a white car,
- and didn't keep that long in that neighborhood,
- 23 next to a coal burning plant. But we've lived
- 24 through those days and we've worked with Niagara
- 25 Mohawk and we've worked with N.R.G.

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20132. We are down to a point where 3 there aren't many chances left. And this is something that from the youth that were here 4 5 earlier from the Little League Program to I don't know if you realize it, but senior citizens that 6 7 were bused from Dunkirk to come up here because they felt it important enough to come, but didn't 8 9 want to have the responsibility of driving up here. 10 So buses were arranged for them to get here. Every 11 segment of our community was represented here 12 tonight. 13 In closing I would just like to 14 ask the Public Service Commission as a resident of 15 Dunkirk, as the fire chief in the city of Dunkirk, 16 as a county legislator for years I've been involved 17 in government. And I've had discussions with state 18 senators and assemblymen and congressmen and 19 governors, do you know that western New York even 20 goes past Buffalo? 21 Do you realize that there are 22 counties like Chautauqua and Cattarauqus and 23 Allegany? We need your help to the Commissioners. 2.4 And yes, this is an issue that

goes beyond the economics and the feelings of the

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 people and there are a lot of feelings on all
- 3 sides. We need your help.
- 4 We need somebody in New York
- 5 State government to say there are people that live
- 6 in western New York, they deserve our help, they
- 7 deserve the ability to do something for themselves
- 8 and to be involved with a company like N.R.G. that
- 9 had shown that they are a good partner in our
- 10 community.
- 11 Thank you.
- MR. BORRELLO: Hi everybody. I'm
- 13 George Borrello. I'm a Chautaugua County legislator
- 14 and also a member of the Planning and Economic
- 15 Development Committee. Thank you for coming here
- 16 tonight.
- 17 During the cold war Joseph Stalin
- 18 referred to American Communist sympathizers, he had
- 19 a term for them, he called them useful idiots
- 20 because they had no idea what they were actually
- 21 supporting was his totalitarian police state.
- While have watched this process
- 23 as the Sierra Club and the Business Council of New
- 24 York have become National Grid's useful idiots.
- 25 That is the problem. They have sacrificed their

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 principles and their core beliefs for something
- 3 that is snake oil.
- 4 As far as Mr. -- the gentleman
- 5 from National Grid's presentation goes, it was --
- 6 I'm being kind when I say this, disingenuous, he
- 7 wanted to talk to us about how repowering the
- 8 Dunkirk plant was going to add cost to delivery.
- 9 Yet -- and his words were part of the criteria used
- 10 to determine whether or not they were going to
- 11 support the transmission line or the plant was in
- 12 his words, and I'm quoting here, "minimum impact on
- 13 competitive markets." That's an important term.
- 14 Minimum impact on competitive markets.
- So what you're saying, sir, is
- 16 you want to make sure the price of electricity
- 17 stays up. That's what you're saying, at the
- 18 sacrifice of the -- of the people that are paying
- 19 the bill and also at the sacrifice of the people
- 20 that work and will work -- continue to work at the
- 21 plant in Dunkirk.
- That, sir, is disingenuous.
- On top of that we also have to
- 24 worry about the idea of green energy. And I
- 25 understand that green energy is a huge buzz word

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 here and we've had people come to our county
- 3 talking about wind and solar and so forth. But
- 4 ladies and gentlemen of the Commission, the only
- 5 green involved in wind energy is money. The people
- 6 that build wind power plants -- windmills,
- 7 industrial wind turbines do so only with taxpayer
- 8 money.
- 9 The electricity that they
- 10 generate is only competitive with huge subsidies
- 11 from the taxpayers. These people are not in the
- 12 green energy business. They're in the government
- 13 subsidy business. Let's not forget that.
- 14 Natural gas is clean and
- 15 abundant. And despite what the -- what they've
- 16 currently called dirty natural gas, it comes from
- 17 the nearly four thousand gas wells that we have
- 18 here in Chautaugua County, none of which have been
- 19 dug with high volume hydraulic fracturing.
- This is the future for our county
- 21 and for our nation. This is the future of
- 22 America's energy independence, clean, abundant
- 23 natural gas.
- Thank you.
- MS. TAMPIO: Good evening. My

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 name is Kathy Tampio. I live in Silver Creek just
- 3 up the road.
- 4 As executive director of the
- 5 Chadwick Bay Regional Development Corporation I am
- 6 expressing our nine municipal members -- I'm
- 7 representing our nine municipal members in the
- 8 northern Chautauqua County region, which also
- 9 includes the city of Dunkirk.
- 10 Our organization's mission is to
- 11 develop, promote and support economic development
- 12 projects of regional significance.
- 13 As you can see, what happens in
- 14 Dunkirk does not stay in Dunkirk. What happens in
- 15 Dunkirk happens in the Chadwick Bay region. What
- 16 happens in Dunkirk happens in Chautauqua County.
- 17 And what happens in Dunkirk happens in western New
- 18 York.
- This region continues to face
- 20 severe economic challenges that have resulted in
- job loss, population loss and an ever-increasing
- 22 tax burden on our residents and our businesses.
- 23 Please don't add to that burden
- 24 by allowing the N.R.G. plant to close, an action
- 25 that will eliminate many families sustaining jobs

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 and remove a critical tax contributor to the
- 3 functioning of our local governments, the provision
- 4 of their services and the city of Dunkirk School
- 5 District.
- 6 Please support the repowering of
- 7 the N.R.G. plant, a truly regional project that is
- 8 critical to the economy of this region.
- 9 In my closing comment I have a
- 10 very important question: If the decision is made
- 11 to close down the N.R.G. plant what is Governor
- 12 Cuomo's plan to replace these jobs and this lost
- 13 revenue? I would consider it a completely
- 14 irresponsible act if the N.R.G. plant is closed
- down and the local economy is severely damaged as a
- 16 result. Please repower N.R.G.
- 17 Thank you.
- 18 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: John Hollins?
- 19 Todd Tranum?
- I think we have John.
- 21 MR. HOLLINS: Yes. Hi. My name
- 22 is John Hollins. I'm the unit president for
- 23 C.S.E.A. for the Dunkirk School System. We
- 24 represent approximately about a hundred and fifteen
- 25 people that are affected just like our teachers.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 But I'm not going to stand up
- 3 here and talk to you about all the things you've
- 4 heard all night, but I am going to say something
- 5 that means a lot to me at the heart level is when I
- 6 watched all our elders walk around you here and
- 7 hobble around here in them chairs and we had one
- 8 come up and say I worry, I don't understand.
- 9 And I got one of them that's a
- 10 good friend of mine says if that plant closes, we
- 11 don't repower he's moving in with me. I don't know
- 12 if I'm going to like that or not, but I'll accept
- 13 it.
- But we -- we really support the
- 15 repowering. We have to do something. There's got
- 16 to be a decision made. Sure, there's a lot of
- 17 areas that should be covered, but the most thing is
- 18 when we look at our elders that stuck around here
- 19 to get us where we are now, and we look at the
- 20 children that come up that want to stick around and
- 21 have an education, we're killing them. Don't stall
- 22 out for the sake of the kids or the elders. Keep
- 23 us going and I'll let you go home.
- MR. TRANUM: Your Honor, members
- of the Public Service Commission, good evening.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 My name is Todd Tranum. I'm
- 3 president and C.E.O. of the Chautauqua County
- 4 Chamber of Commerce and I also serve as executive
- 5 director of the Manufacturer's Association of the
- 6 southern tier.
- 7 On behalf of our board of
- 8 directors we welcome you to -- to Chautauqua
- 9 County.
- 10 Our organization represents one
- 11 thousand one hundred businesses and we
- 12 unequivocally support the manufacturing of electric
- 13 power here in New York State and the repowering of
- 14 the N.R.G. Dunkirk facility.
- We -- we view the decision
- 16 regarding the powering of the N.R.G. Dunkirk as a
- 17 statement about the future of energy production in
- 18 New York State. This project is a clear, defining
- 19 point in terms of New York State's energy policy.
- 20 Will New York State continue to produce energy or
- 21 subject itself to rapidly-changing markets outside
- 22 of the state's control?
- 23 The closure of N.R.G. Dunkirk
- 24 will result in New York importing power from states
- 25 such as Ohio and Pennsylvania. This power will be

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 imported from facilities that burn coal at a time
- 3 when coal-fired plants are closing.
- 4 Due to increasing regulatory
- 5 pressures from the Environmental Protection Agency
- 6 many of the Ohio and Pennsylvania facilities are
- 7 scheduling to close down.
- 8 In recent weeks President Obama
- 9 announced new initiatives that will place even more
- 10 pressure on coal-burning facilities to close their
- 11 operations.
- Now, notably, the president
- 13 simultaneously has supported the conversion from
- 14 coal to natural gas. The supply and demand
- 15 economics of the situation are simple. Significant
- decreases in supply, while demand for electricity
- 17 increases leads to dramatic costs increases for
- 18 ratepayers.
- 19 It is estimated that thirty-four
- 20 gigawatts of power is scheduled to go offline in
- 21 response to E.P.A. rulings. Some of that power is
- 22 being decommissioned right now as we speak. If the
- 23 N.R.G. Dunkirk facility is forced to close, New
- 24 York will be subjected to volatile changing
- 25 economics of the market and skyrocketing energy

```
Page 113
 1
                 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013
 2.
     prices.
 3
                       High energy prices undermine
 4
     private-sector growth and New York jobs.
 5
     keep New York State in the business of
     manufacturing energy.
 6
 7
                       Let's invest in clean, state-of-
 8
     the-art technology, let's maintain reliable energy.
 9
     Let's support private investment, let's create
     jobs, let's repower the N.R.G. Dunkirk facility.
10
11
                       Ladies and gentlemen, we ask for
12
     your support and thank you very much.
13
                       A.L.J. HARRIMAN: The next five
14
     speakers are:
15
                       Susan Dietzen,
16
                       Rock Vallone,
17
                       Brian Smith,
18
                       Daniel Reininga,
19
                       Charley Bowman.
20
                       Okay. Suzanne?
21
                       MS. DIETZAN: Hi. My name is
22
     Suzanne Dietzen. I'm a retired teacher aide from
23
     the city of Dunkirk School System.
2.4
                       The Dunkirk repowering project
```

proposed by N.R.G. is very important to the future

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- of the city of Dunkirk, Chautauqua County and New
- 3 York State.
- N.R.G. is the largest taxpayer in
- 5 the city of Dunkirk and Chautauqua County. Our
- 6 schools and city receive an enormous share of their
- 7 budgets from the N.R.G. PILOT program. If the
- 8 N.R.G. plant is closed we will lose jobs, our tax
- 9 base for the school, county and city taxes will be
- 10 raised to the point that taxpayers will not be able
- 11 to afford to live in Dunkirk anymore.
- Besides massive tax increases, we
- 13 will have devastating job layoffs at the schools,
- 14 city and county level. We cannot afford to lose
- 15 any more jobs from this area or have our school and
- 16 property taxes raised so high that we cannot afford
- 17 to pay them.
- People on fixed incomes cannot
- 19 afford to pay higher taxes. There will be no
- 20 Dunkirk left if this plant is closed.
- 21 Please save Dunkirk and
- 22 Chautauqua County or we'll all have to move
- 23 somewhere else and lose everything that we've
- 24 worked for all our lives. Thank you.
- MR. VALLONE: Hello. My name is

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Rock Vallone. I live on New Road in Dunkirk. I am
- 3 principal of Dunkirk Middle School. I am also
- 4 president of the Dunkirk Administrators
- 5 Association.
- 6 And as we have all heard tonight,
- 7 the change in N.R.G. and the loss of revenue will
- 8 be devastating to the District.
- 9 I especially have concern at
- 10 Dunkirk Middle School. At the middle school we
- 11 have approximately just under seventy percent
- 12 poverty rate. We have a fourteen percent English
- 13 language learning population, L.E.P. population.
- We have not made adequate yearly
- 15 progress, which means we are a focused school. A
- 16 focused school means our state scores have not met
- 17 the standard that New York State has set for us.
- 18 We all know that New York State
- 19 has added many, many mandates, most of which are
- 20 unfunded.
- 21 Superintendent Cerne and others
- 22 from the district have already spoken to you about
- 23 the cuts the district has gone through over the --
- 24 over time.
- In my building alone we have lost

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 fifteen teachers in the last five years and that is
- 3 twenty-eight percent of my teaching force.
- 4 As we start planning for this
- 5 upcoming year and the years down the road, I find
- 6 it more and more difficult to come up with ways to
- 7 make any kind of cuts so that we do not add more
- 8 money to the taxpayers burden.
- 9 I urge you strongly to please
- 10 support the N.R.G. repowering of that plant. The
- 11 school district desperately needs your assistance
- 12 and we need it right now.
- Thank you.
- MR. SMITH: Good evening. My
- 15 name is Brian Smith and I'm the program and
- 16 communications director for Citizens Campaign for
- 17 the Environment or C.C.E.
- I'm here today on behalf of
- 19 C.C.E.'s eighty thousand members to voice our
- 20 support for transmission upgrades that will benefit
- 21 energy efficiency and renewable energy development
- 22 as more cost effective and cleaner alternative to
- 23 repowering. I also want to say that we recognize
- 24 that closing a -- a power plant will have an impact
- on the community and we do support New York State

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 providing leadership and providing assistance to
- 3 communities to transition to a clean energy
- 4 economy.
- I want to thank you for the
- 6 opportunity to provide comments today. Today we
- 7 stand at an energy crossroads in Dunkirk and across
- 8 New York State. We can go backwards and once again
- 9 shackle ourselves to decades more of fossil fuel
- 10 addiction which comes with price volatility,
- 11 pollution and fails to diversify our state's energy
- 12 portfolio, or we can meet our energy needs more
- 13 cheaply by upgrading transmission and paving the
- 14 way for the energy of the future, renewables such
- 15 as wind and solar, which will create jobs and clean
- 16 energy.
- Despite everything that N.R.G. is
- 18 proposing as a state-of-the-art facility, the fact
- 19 remains this power plant is not necessary.
- The ratepayers should not have to
- 21 foot the bill for an unnecessary power plant when
- 22 we can meet energy needs in a way that is cheaper,
- 23 benefits ratepayers, protects public health and our
- 24 shared environment. A preferred alternative is
- 25 transmission upgrades which due to our aging

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 transmission system is necessary anyway.
- 3 Transmission upgrades are less
- 4 expensive, increase efficiency and support
- 5 renewable energy development. Western New York has
- 6 tremendous potential for renewable energy
- 7 development with both -- both on shore and off
- 8 shore wind as well as small scale and large scale
- 9 solar projects.
- 10 Compared to gas, renewables
- 11 provide cleaner energy, more jobs and greater price
- 12 stability. Of course renewables do not require
- 13 dirty and harmful fuel extraction while gas
- 14 extracted by processes that bears unacceptable risk
- 15 to our environment and -- and health, which of
- 16 course is fracking, whether that happens here in
- 17 New York State or neighboring states.
- 18 Lastly I want to address the
- 19 claim that choosing the transmission alternative
- 20 will result in dirty power coming from
- 21 Pennsylvania.
- The truth is the same market
- 23 forces that are closing Dunkirk as well as
- 24 Somerset, Cayuga and other power -- coal-fired
- 25 power plants, those market forces are in effect in

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 other states like Pennsylvania and the transition
- 3 is happening there as well. The coal plants are
- 4 closing.
- 5 This transition will only be
- 6 hastened by federal regulations addressing mercury
- 7 and greenhouse gases. In fact by the time the CO2
- 8 regs are implemented on the federal level the New
- 9 York independent system operator analysis shows
- 10 that power flows actually reverse and New York
- 11 State will become a net exporter to Pennsylvania
- 12 without repowering Dunkirk.
- So I want to close by saying
- 14 we -- we strongly support transmission as a
- 15 cleaner, cheaper and more sustainable option.
- Thank you.
- MR. REININGA: Good evening. My
- 18 name is Dan Reininga. I'm president and C.E.O. of
- 19 Lake Shore Savings Bank. We are a community-based
- 20 bank here located in Dunkirk, New York. We have
- 21 eleven branches throughout western New York, five
- in Chautaugua County and six in Erie County.
- And I'll be brief because it's
- 24 way past my bedtime. So, I just wanted to share a
- 25 few statistics with you about our customers.

Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20131 2. In Dunkirk we have three hundred 3 and thirty-five mortgage customers. The average 4 balance on a home in Dunkirk, borrowed balance 5 right now is four -- forty-four thousand dollars -excuse me, forty-four thousand dollars. The 6 average value of those homes, somewhere in the 7 neighborhood of fifty-eight thousand dollars. So 8 9 we're dealing with our public in Dunkirk. 10 Imagine those three hundred and 11 thirty-five customers having to shell out an extra 12 thousand dollars a year plus in real estate taxes. 13 That has a tremendous impact on buying power for 14 those customers. 15 Throughout Chautauqua County we 16 have approximately a hundred and twenty-five 17 million dollars lent on various properties. And 18 that's approximately a hundred and -- or excuse me, 19 a thousand six hundred borrowers. So there's some 20 substantial impact there as well. 21 We, as a board of directors, 22 endorse the repower effort. We look forward to the 23 sustained tax base that N.R.G. brings to Chautauqua

County in the form of their tax payments and their

community service. They have above the line

24

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 dividends similar to what Lake Shore believes in
- 3 giving back to the community. So we wholeheartedly
- 4 endorse the effort to repower.
- 5 On another side I'm also chairman
- 6 of the board of a hopefully soon sixth generation
- 7 family business.
- 8 My daughter's expecting a
- 9 grandchild, so that will be six generations working
- in Chautauqua County, born, raised here since 1905.
- We have approximately thirty-five
- 12 million dollars worth of investment in Chautaugua
- 13 County and that does not play well if one of the
- 14 major taxpayers leaves Chautauqua County.
- We do a lot of housing for
- 16 elderly, disabled folks, et cetera, that otherwise
- 17 might not be able to find a reasonable place to
- 18 live. And we surely would like to see a broad tax
- 19 base to continue to support that activity of giving
- 20 back to our community through that business as
- 21 well.
- 22 So thank you for the air time. I
- 23 appreciate the repower effort and I think it's the
- 24 right decision and I look forward to what the
- 25 outcome is because of that.

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20132. Thank you. MR. BOWMAN: Charley Bowman. 3 I'm the interim director of the 4 5 Western New York Peace Center in Buffalo, New York. I'd like to propose that the 6 7 debate be expanded to a thorough analysis for 8 renewable energy. Renewable energy is a gold mine. 9 Now why do I say that? 10 N.Y.P.A., New York Power Authority, has roughly two 11 point eight billion in the bank and their annual 12 income is around two hundred million and a lot of 13 that is generated from hydro power. 14 So, the second thing is that 15 Canada is going renewable -- Ontario is going --16 the province of Ontario is going renewable big 17 time. They have created a FIT program, a feed-in 18 tariff that was mentioned by Diane earlier, and 19 that attracted five billion dollars of investment 20 from Samsung. 21 And they are building -- they have built plants that hire expensive Canadian 22 23 labor to build wind generation and solar panels. 2.4 Now, everybody on this panel 25 should be asking why didn't Samsung invest that in

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Upstate New York? Why? Because Upstate New York
- 3 or New York entirely doesn't have a feed-in
- 4 program.
- 5 So Samsung took their five
- 6 billion dollars and they dumped it on Ontario.
- 7 They didn't dump it in China, where labor is cheap.
- 8 They dumped it in Ontario where labor is expensive.
- 9 It's just as expensive as New York State. Okay?
- So we should really get this
- 11 feed-in tariff going. New York State does not have
- 12 a solar project in the pipeline over one megawatt.
- Every other municipality around
- 14 New York State is going gangbusters on it whether
- or not they have a feed-in tariff. Ohio has
- 16 sixty-eight megawatts under development or
- 17 planning. Pennsylvania has thirty. New Jersey has
- 18 a hundred and twenty-nine. Massachusetts has
- 19 forty-two megawatts. Tiny little Vermont has
- 20 seven.
- 21 Ontario has seventy-one
- 22 individual projects larger than one megawatt in the
- 23 planning or development stages. New York State has
- 24 zero. Why does New York State hate solar energy?
- The Jacobson Paper, as I

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 indicated earlier, and which I gave the Public
- 3 Service Commission a copy of, they outline a plan
- 4 over seventeen years where New York State can
- 5 generate its entire electrical needs from renewable
- 6 energy.
- 7 And for the solar aspect of that
- 8 they could build eight hundred and twenty-eight
- 9 fifty megawatt solar farms, five million rooftop
- 10 solar panels -- individual five kilowatt solar
- 11 panels, five hundred thousand solar panels on
- 12 commercial farms -- commercial -- on commercial
- 13 establishments.
- 14 All this would reduce the deaths
- in New York State from air pollution by four
- 16 thousand. And the medical costs associated with
- 17 the four thousand deaths would more than pay for
- 18 this expensive prospect of transferring all our
- 19 energy, removing ourselves from dependency on
- 20 fossil fuels.
- 21 And everybody is yelling about
- 22 reliability. Everybody is yelling about the
- 23 sensitivity of transmission lines. Well, the
- 24 sensitivity of transmission line problem goes away
- 25 when we all generate our electrical power locally

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 like this building. The parking lot where I parked
- 3 my car is hotter than hell. Why? Because there's
- 4 no solar panels overhead generating electricity.
- 5 So why isn't SUNY Fredonia using its parking lot to
- 6 generate solar energy?
- 7 The sixty-three acres out there
- 8 on the -- on the waterfront which is where the
- 9 Dunkirk -- Dunkirk coal plant is could be
- 10 generating thirteen megawatts of solar energy and
- 11 they could be making that into a public park and
- 12 downtown Dunkirk would have a beautiful view of the
- 13 sunset over Lake Erie.
- 14 It lessens the loads on -- on
- 15 power lines if we generate locally throughout the
- 16 state. The jobs -- let me tell you about --
- 17 everybody's worried about jobs.
- 18 If New York State is generating
- 19 all its electricity from solar -- or from renewable
- 20 energy there will be fifty-eight thousand jobs
- 21 in -- in the utility industry.
- 22 Right now New York State has
- thirty-seven thousand one hundred people working in
- 24 the utility industry. They have five thousand
- 25 seven hundred jobs working in mining. If you add

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 those up, they got then forty-two thousand jobs
- 3 working in the utility industry.
- 4 If we go renewables we'll
- 5 increase that by fifteen thousand jobs. If we
- 6 build solar farms around Dunkirk and Fredonia to
- 7 produce four hundred megawatts we'll have a hundred
- 8 and twenty jobs in Dunkirk and Fredonia. And I'll
- 9 tell you those jobs will never, never, never go
- 10 away. They will be there as long as the sun shines
- 11 for millions of years.
- 12 They will be -- the solar energy
- is independent of market forces. We don't have to
- 14 worry about the world price of photons. We don't
- 15 have to worry about the world price of wind
- 16 energy -- of wind that will be out there to turn
- 17 the blades. The solar energy will be impinging on
- 18 the solar farms and those hundred and twenty people
- 19 employed around Dunkirk/Fredonia will be there
- 20 forever.
- Thank you.
- 22 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: The next five
- 23 speakers:
- 24 Mark Gruber,
- 25 Sandra Tapasto,

1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013 2. Valerie Pawlak, 3 Ang Bennice and 4 Don Stegar. 5 Anyone of those five can come up and just remember to state your name for the 6 7 record. 8 MR. GRUBER: Good evening. My 9 name is Mark Gruber. I'm a nine-and-a-half year veteran police officer of the city of Dunkirk 10 11 Police Department. I've also had the honor of 12 representing the Dunkirk P.D.A. as their president. 13 I don't envy the position that 14 you're in. Hard decisions have to be made that 15 will impact the citizens of Dunkirk, Chautauqua 16 County and western New York now and for years to 17 come. 18 I don't believe there's anyone in 19 this room that would enjoy seeing any employee lose 20 their job. The idea of not only an N.R.G. 21 employee, but an American at work is one that we 22 all hold dear. 2.3 In a perfect world everyone 24 wanting a job would be employed, live in their

dream home, drive their dream car and be able to

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 provide for their families in every way.
- 3 Unfortunately, we are not in a
- 4 perfect world. Jobs are at a premium. The
- 5 able-bodied workforce in the country has to fight
- 6 for jobs just to make work -- make ends meet. The
- 7 economy struggles both locally and nationally and
- 8 financial nest eggs that can be left to the next
- 9 generation are becoming a thing of the past.
- To state the obvious, this is not
- 11 the time to be talking about layoffs and closures.
- 12 The results of such an event would be catastrophic
- 13 to the region and its people. If you can picture
- 14 the results.
- N.R.G. closes and many lose their
- 16 jobs. They're forced to leave the area to find
- 17 employment. Some will leave New York State
- 18 altogether.
- We're not talking about
- twenty-one-year-old single men and women who would
- 21 have an easier time rearranging their lives. Men
- 22 and women with families and homes would be
- affected, forced to find jobs to pay bills or pick
- 24 up roots and start over.
- Then there's the local economy.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 The loss of the area's major taxpayer would
- 3 devastate the region. The local government would
- 4 be forced to raise taxes by an unbelievable amount
- 5 simply to stay in operation. The building would
- 6 sit idle, becoming a haven for transients and
- 7 rodents or perhaps it would be demolished. An
- 8 empty lot would then decorate the lakefront.
- 9 As more are unemployed and taxes
- 10 increase the inevitable would then happen, crime
- 11 will increase. There will be less police officers,
- 12 firefighters, teachers, and E.M.S. personnel in the
- 13 city because simply the city cannot afford to pay
- 14 them.
- 15 If you think that this nightmare
- 16 scenario cannot happen, it already did. A short
- drive up Route 5 and you come to the city of
- 18 Lackawanna, New York and south Buffalo. Bethlehem
- 19 Steel and Republic Steel were icons in a time where
- 20 steel was king. In the early 1980s as a result of
- 21 foreign competition both were forced to close their
- 22 doors. Thousands were laid off, my father, Steve
- 23 Gruber among them.
- 24 In October of 1982 Bethlehem
- 25 Steel closed for good, laying off six thousand

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 people. The city of Lackawanna's population
- 3 dwindled. The citizens faced extreme large tax
- 4 increases just to keep their basic services in
- 5 operation. The amount of taxes paid to Lackawanna
- 6 by the steel giants fell from sixty-six percent of
- 7 the city's revenue to eight percent.
- 8 Lackawanna and western New York
- 9 were crushed and still struggle to recover to this
- 10 day. Please don't let this happen in Dunkirk. You
- 11 can stop history from repeating itself. Don't
- 12 allow Dunkirk to become another notch on the rust
- 13 belt and repower N.R.G. Thank you.
- MS. TOPASTO: Welcome -- welcome
- 15 the Public Service Commission and your Honorable
- 16 Kim Harriman and guests and distinguished
- 17 legislators.
- I came tonight not knowing what
- 19 to expect. I thought I'd be for National Grid,
- 20 until I heard the whole story. And now I seem
- 21 to -- I'm convinced that we must repower Dunkirk.
- 22 And we -- and I appreciate the -- the money you'll
- 23 help to save our city and our Western New York
- 24 which consists of so many beautiful families and
- 25 our land is one of great agriculture and our lake

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 and it's just a beautiful area, as you know.
- 3 And I do thank National Grid for
- 4 all the help they have done for over the years.
- 5 I've been a resident here for seventy years. I'm a
- 6 taxpayer of Dunkirk.
- 7 And my main concern was the word
- 8 fracking. I was so upset about the word fracking
- 9 that until I came tonight I never realized that
- 10 there were four hundred wells.
- 11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Four
- 12 thousand.
- MS. TOPASTO: Four thousand?
- 14 Four thousand wells and they
- 15 wouldn't have to do fracking and that's what
- 16 changed my mind. But I was thinking -- but I was
- 17 thinking as we got more richer with the global
- 18 energy units it would be selling, exporting our
- 19 energy out to other places. I thought well, maybe
- 20 the people would be tempted to do fracking to -- to
- 21 give them more -- more natural gas. But I did have
- 22 a word of caution. I am worried about the quality
- 23 of water, which would be a tradeoff if -- if this
- 24 wasn't done right. And I -- I was also worried --
- 25 you know, at -- at first I wondered how that you

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 would get the gas and I realize it's already there.
- 3 And another concern I had was who
- 4 will control the fracking industry. Who will
- 5 better regulate it? I worry about -- being a nurse
- 6 I know about nuclear fallout and I'm concerned
- 7 about West Valley.
- 8 It's thirty miles from here and
- 9 who's to say where they can drill? Who's to say --
- 10 who's to tell them how far you can go to West
- 11 Valley to drill for gas?
- 12 I know in 1972 they closed West
- 13 Valley because there was a leaching of nuclear
- 14 material in the groundwater, which left a six
- 15 hundred thousand gallon tank of highly radioactive
- 16 material and leached into the ground to Buttermilk
- 17 Creek, the Cattaraugus Creek and Lake Erie.
- 18 And I know western New York has
- 19 taken a great hit with the high cancer deaths. And
- 20 I also know that western New York is on an
- 21 earthquake fault along Route 20, Zoar Valley and
- 22 Attica.
- I guess that's all I have to say.
- I just wanted just to give a word
- of caution that as we go ahead that we're

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 careful -- that we're careful and we do the right
- 3 thing everyday. And I'm so proud of this
- 4 community. I just love everyone for coming to
- 5 speak. I never saw so many -- so many people in
- 6 one gathering like this with such animation to save
- 7 their community and I thank them all for coming and
- 8 I thank you for coming. And I thank you --.
- 9 MS. POWLAK: Hi. I'm Valerie
- 10 Powlak, a Dunkirk resident, but I'd like to say
- 11 thank you for being patient with us and listening
- 12 to every one of us. And I will have questions for
- 13 N.R.G. and one for National Grid.
- 14 But I must read -- and to begin
- 15 with N.R.G. plant is not going anywhere. It's an
- icon on the Dunkirk harbor, isn't that true?
- 17 And I'm older than that plant to
- 18 begin with. And my dad even built the smokestacks
- 19 on that plant. So I have been following it. But I
- 20 have questions environmentally. But I must read
- 21 this first and then I will ask them. And thank
- 22 you -- and thank you for coming, Cathy, for all
- 23 your work.
- 24 As a member of the Federal Great
- 25 Lakes Council our concern for what happens to the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 N.R.G. plant is most important, not only as a tax
- 3 helper for our city of Dunkirk, but also Chautauqua
- 4 County and our New York State.
- 5 N.R.G. must not close and they
- 6 won't. They will stay one way or another.
- 7 Let's see. Okay. I lost my
- 8 train of thought. N.R.G.'s -- okay. N.R.G. must
- 9 not close. Over the years N.R.G. has spent a lot
- 10 of money to upgrade their plant when even it was --
- 11 whenever it was needed especially environmentally,
- 12 true?
- The Federal E.P.A. always sat
- 14 down the rules and they have abided by them. Why?
- 15 The reason being our Dunkirk drinking water filter
- 16 plant sits right next to the N.R.G. plant. Water
- 17 from our Lake Erie must be safe for consumption.
- This is most important if Dunkirk
- 19 gets to become the regional supplier of good safe
- 20 water throughout the county. Now this is our only
- 21 business and industry right now. We need to make
- 22 money for our city to survive.
- This is why we must be very
- 24 cautious of what happens to our N.R.G. plant
- 25 environmentally. Also what effect does it have on

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 our lake water -- Lake Erie waters -- waters
- 3 especially our waste treatment plant, which we know
- 4 some of the waste has to go there.
- 5 Our question to N.R.G., if you
- 6 repower with -- with gas what effect will there be
- 7 on our Lake Erie environmentally? What are the
- 8 waste?
- 9 MR. DOLCE: Right now the plant
- 10 uses Lake Erie water for cooling.
- MS. POWLAK: Right.
- MR. DOLCE: And if we repower the
- 13 units, then you would substantially reduce the
- 14 amount of water that you would use for cooling.
- 15 And I don't remember the number
- off the top of my head, but I think it's in the
- 17 magnitude of like eighty or ninety percent. It's
- 18 a -- it's a very large reduction in the amount of
- 19 water that you would use.
- MS. POWLAK: Well, like now with
- 21 National Grid and -- and with you, we have waste
- 22 going to the waste treatment plant and you treat --
- 23 we have it treated. We know what it is.
- We don't know what the gas will
- 25 be because there is no smell, there is no odor,

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 there is no taste. What do they do?
- And besides, you've got to have
- 4 something that's going to the waste treatment plant
- 5 from your water. What would it be or how would you
- 6 treat it? How would you know?
- 7 MR. DOLCE: Yeah. I -- I think
- 8 one of the issues that's -- that's raised in -- in
- 9 some popular movies that are out right now is
- 10 about, you know, the -- with -- with fracking
- 11 and -- and whether gas is escaping into water
- 12 that's being used --
- MS. POWLAK: Right.
- MR. DOLCE: -- for drinking
- 15 water. What we're proposing at Dunkirk is not to
- 16 drill any wells.
- MS. POWLAK: Right.
- MR. DOLCE: What we're proposing
- 19 is to connect a pipeline to an existing pipeline
- 20 that's been in service for decades, long before
- 21 fracking has become popular in states like
- 22 Pennsylvania.
- MS. POWLAK: Okay.
- MR. DOLCE: So we would actually
- 25 not be drilling any wells in the Dunkirk area.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013 2. MS. POWLAK: No? 3 MR. DOLCE: We would just be 4 supplied from that pipeline that already exists. 5 MS. POWLAK: You know, but there still has to be some kind of waste because like I 6 7 said, with -- with -- now you have the sulfur and you have the mercury, you have everything. 8 9 We're -- we watch you, the Great Lakes because Lake Erie is international waters. 10 11 We watch it very closely for security, as you know, 12 and for pollution. 13 MR. DOLCE: Yes, ma'am. 14 MS. PAWLAK: And you have been 15 abiding by the laws with E.P.A. 16 MR. DOLCE: Well --. 17 MS. PAWLAK: This is so true. 18 MR. DOLCE: Yes. 19 MS. PAWLAK: Okay. For -- for 20 N.R.G. -- wasn't there a program that we were told
- 22 the coast of New York State starting from our
- 23 plant, going up to Oswego and to all of them and

that N.R.G. would run the lines all the way along

- 24 this would generate the new energy? We were told
- 25 that before.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 MR. DOLCE: I'm not familiar with
- 3 the plan you're referring to.
- 4 MS. PAWLAK: But wouldn't that
- 5 make sense? We would have our own -- own energy,
- 6 we wouldn't have to worry about anybody else along
- 7 the coast of New York State. And this would be
- 8 starting with our plant.
- 9 But like I said, whatever is
- 10 going to be here, you know, it will, but you've got
- 11 to be very concerned what is going in our water --
- 12 in our Lake Erie water.
- Thank you. Thank you.
- 14 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Next five
- 15 speakers:
- M. Jakulric, J-A-K-U-L-R-I-C,
- 17 Randolph Kinner,
- 18 Zachary Torain,
- 19 Ken Shearer?
- MR. SHEARER: Good evening. My
- 21 name is Ken Shearer. I'm the chairman of the
- 22 Chautaugua County Chamber of Commerce.
- But first I'd like to say
- 24 something to you on a personal note. I was born
- 25 and raised in Chautauqua County. My wife was born

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 and raised in Chautauqua County. Twenty-three
- 3 years ago we got married, bought the business that
- 4 we worked for. We still own that business, I still
- 5 work there everyday. I have four kids here in
- 6 Chautauqua County. People say how's it going, Ken,
- 7 and I say hey, I'm living the dream. And my hope
- 8 is that when you go back to your board choose the
- 9 repower Dunkirk and let my four kids and the rest
- 10 of the kids here in Chautauqua County continue to
- 11 chase their dream right here at home.
- 12 On the other side, as chairman, I
- want to represent the county chamber board of
- 14 directors. I want to welcome you. Thank you for
- 15 coming to Chautaugua County to hear us on this
- 16 important issue.
- 17 The repowering of Dunkirk N.R.G.
- 18 facility is critically important to the business
- 19 community and the region as a whole. Reliable,
- 20 affordable power is essential to the business
- 21 community if we are to retain current employment
- 22 levels and grow in the future. Unfortunately some
- 23 organizations have written off the western New York
- 24 economy and believe there's no need for the power
- 25 generated by the N.R.G. plant. Other organizations

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 seem to suggest that there is a magic switch that
- 3 can be pulled to generate one hundred percent
- 4 renewable energy overnight.
- 5 We believe that western New York
- 6 has a strong economic future and we believe that
- 7 there is demand for power generated in Western New
- 8 York. We also believe there's a vibrant future
- 9 ahead for the renewable energy.
- However to get a future state of
- 11 a strong economy and a region that boasts renewable
- 12 energy assets we must repower the energy facility.
- We need the power to grow our
- 14 businesses. We need state-of-the-art natural gas
- 15 technology to bridge us to a future that also
- 16 includes renewable energy sources.
- Failure to repower the N.R.G.
- 18 facility will undermine our regional economy and
- 19 hurt our businesses. The tax impact of losing
- 20 N.R.G. will be devastating to the city of Dunkirk
- 21 School District, the city of Dunkirk and Chautauqua
- 22 County as a whole.
- There will undoubtedly be
- 24 significant tax increases that will unfortunately
- 25 drive businesses out of business or out of the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 state, delay hiring decisions and postpone
- 3 investments. We ask for you to approve repowering
- 4 the N.R.G. Dunkirk facility to help our businesses,
- 5 help our communities and bring hope to the economic
- 6 future of Chautauqua County, our region and all of
- 7 New York State. Thank you.
- 8 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Vince Horrigan?
- 9 MR. HORRIGAN: Good evening.
- 10 Vince Horrigan. I'm a Chautauqua County
- 11 legislator. In full disclosure, the gentleman that
- 12 was next to me, I'm running against him for
- 13 Chautauqua County executive and I'll tell you we
- 14 may have debate in the future, but not tonight.
- Tonight there's clearly one
- 16 winning strategy and that's to repower N.R.G.
- 17 I want to tell you a story that happened to me four
- 18 years ago. It was about two-thirty in the morning.
- 19 I received a call. We have a major disaster in
- 20 Chautauqua County.
- The phone rang a second time. We
- 22 have two major disasters, flooding hit Silver Creek
- 23 and Gowanda, level three disaster. We mobilized
- 24 every possible resource we had along with county
- 25 government, firefighters, police. Fifty homes were

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 destroyed. Two hundred and fifty people needed
- 3 immediate financial assistance. We opened
- 4 shelters.
- 5 At the time I was the director of
- 6 the American Red Cross of southwestern New York.
- 7 And on the way there I thought to myself My God,
- 8 how are we going to handle this. It's three in the
- 9 morning, two disasters, how are we going to do
- 10 this?
- But you know what, there is a
- 12 company that put their arms around this community.
- 13 N.R.G. for the last nearly decade has supported
- 14 disaster relief and training in this community
- above of what we're talking about and they are a
- 16 company that clearly puts their arms around and
- 17 cares about their community. Thank you, N.R.G.
- 18 I'd like to thank members of the
- 19 Commission, your Honor, I'd like to thank N.R.G.
- For twenty-eight years I was in
- 21 the Air Force. I had to approve combat pay. You
- 22 deserve combat pay tonight, sir. So I thank you
- 23 for doing that. We -- some of us wondered, you
- 24 know, how will this information be brought back to
- 25 the Commission and you have a lot of

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 responsibility. But one thing that this did,
- 3 thanks to the leadership of Senator Young and
- 4 Assemblyman Goodell, our county executive, Greg
- 5 Edwards, Tom Reed, our Congressman, you've been
- 6 able to see the faces and hear the voices.
- 7 And what I would say to you,
- 8 please when you go back and enter your
- 9 deliberations on this, please tell the stories of
- 10 the faces and the voices that are going to be so
- 11 directly impacted by your decision. It's a big
- 12 responsibility. We hear about ratepayers, we hear
- 13 about customers. But ladies and gentlemen, the
- 14 citizens of Chautaugua County are here tonight
- imploring and asking you for your support to
- 16 repower N.R.G.
- 17 Thank you.
- 18 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Richard Makach,
- $19 \quad M-A-K-A-C-H$?
- You have horrible writing.
- 21 M-A -- that's a U?
- 22 MR. MAKUCH: I wrote this so many
- 23 times. When I wrote it -- I can't even read this
- 24 now because I'm waiting here so long. But God
- 25 bless Cathy Young, Andy Goodell and N.R.G. Power.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 My name is Richard Makuch. I'm a
- 3 New York State taxpayer and resident of the city of
- 4 Dunkirk and I'm also a past member of the Dunkirk
- 5 City Council.
- 6 For those who oppose this, pay
- 7 our taxes or get out of here because my concern is
- 8 not only the closing of the Niagara Mohawk Power
- 9 Plant and the jobs that will be lost. But also the
- 10 tax burden on this community and the elderly on a
- 11 fixed income. You've heard this before.
- 12 The Niagara Mohawk Plant has
- 13 cooperated with the state of New York and the
- 14 Public Service Commission by changing over to gas
- 15 for cleaner fuel. They will invest their own money
- 16 to transfer an upgrade to gas. So my question is:
- 17 What's the problem? What -- what is the problem
- 18 for this?
- This plant is a Public Service
- 20 Commission -- exactly what it means, public. We
- 21 are the public who pays taxes, which I am sure the
- 22 P.S.C. exists on.
- 23 My question is: Why don't these
- 24 people who object to pollution go to Pennsylvania
- 25 where there's no regulation on pollution and leave

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 us alone. Because if the National Grid and P.S.C.
- 3 want to take the responsibility of jobs loss,
- 4 people losing their homes, seniors on a fixed --
- 5 fixed income starving or worse, no health care, do
- 6 they care? And those who object to this plant, do
- 7 they want that on their conscious for the rest of
- 8 their life?
- 9 Environment issues is on
- 10 everyone's mind, including those who object to this
- 11 plant. But the corrections are in the future for
- 12 this plant. That is showing a responsibility to
- 13 the citizens of this city and this county.
- 14 The governor said on T.V. that he
- is business friendly and I think he should show it
- 16 for this area of New York State. It's time we were
- 17 recognized. And last, but not least, this college
- 18 should support this community. After all they work
- 19 here and receive taxpayers money. And why do we as
- 20 a community have to defend ourselves when everyone
- 21 here knows we as a community will be destroyed if
- 22 this doesn't go through. So why are we not
- 23 protected by the state of New York that says they
- 24 are business friendly?
- Thank you for your time.

Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013 1 2. A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Jim Enser? 3 MR. ENSER: Thank you ladies and 4 gentlemen for the opportunity to speak. 5 My name is Jim Enser. My wife 6 and I live here in the city of Dunkirk. We met in this building in 1975. We were married, decided to 7 make our home in the city of Dunkirk. We can 8 9 almost see the plant from where we live. 10 I am the current board president 11 of the Boys and Girls Club of Northern Chautauqua 12 County. I have been for about five years. 13 And N.R.G. has been a great, tremendous community partner. I want to thank you 14 15 for all the support you gentlemen and the -- and 16 the -- and the community action team has provided 17 us over the past many years and I hope it 18 continues. You've supported us not only 19 20 financially, but with a lot of volunteer help as 21 well through the community action team. 22 couple of weeks we will have our annual golf 23 tournament, August 2nd. The N.R.G. has been the title 24

sponsor for that golf tournament for many years and

25

Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20131 2. not only through their financial support, but by leveraging support from their vendors and others. 3 4 It generates fully twenty-five 5 percent of our annual operating budget. On the other hand, gentlemen, National Grid hasn't ever 6 7 supported us. 8 I appeal to the Public Service 9 Commission to decide in favor of the N.R.G. 10 proposal. Just as the Boys and Girls Club of 11 Northern Chautauqua County is the positive place 12 for kids, please make the city of Dunkirk the 13 positive place for N.R.G. 14 Thank you. 15 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Jay Warren? 16 Larry Barmore? 17 Joanne Haase? 18 Gerald Haase? 19 Glenn Wahl? 20 MR. WAHL: Good evening. Tonight 21 I'm representing one of our local environmental 22 groups, Cattaraugus Chautaugua For Clean Water. 23 I usually add source citations to 24 anything I write, but I didn't take the time this

time. But if you're interested in seeing any of

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 the original sources for the information, I'd be
- 3 glad to email you the links.
- 4 Repowering the Dunkirk Power
- 5 Plant with natural gas seems like a great idea.
- 6 After all, we hear from the industry that natural
- 7 gas is clean, cheap and safe. They state that the
- 8 U.S. has over a hundred-year supply.
- 9 The extraction method used to get
- 10 that gas is high volume hydro-fracturing, also
- 11 deemed safe and reliable by the gas industry, with
- 12 no contamination of ground or surface water ever
- 13 being caused.
- So yes, if one used those
- 15 statements to form an opinion, converting the
- 16 Dunkirk plant to natural gas is a wonderful idea.
- 17 However, every one of those statements I just gave
- 18 about natural gas, which are commonly stated by the
- 19 industry and by those who support it, are either
- 20 partially or wholly false. So the opinion that it
- 21 would be a good idea to convert to natural gas
- 22 follows to be invalid.
- I would like to take my few
- 24 minutes to elaborate on this a bit and to offer a
- 25 better suggestion to Dunkirk and the region because

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 apparently this wasn't given consideration. And if
- 3 you don't ask the right questions how do you get
- 4 the right answers? Your choice between repowering
- 5 with natural gas or not repowering at all, I think
- 6 is a false choice.
- 7 I think there are a lot of other
- 8 choices that you could be looking at, anywhere from
- 9 a hundred percent renewable to different
- 10 combinations of renewables and natural gas. To get
- 11 the natural gas increasingly it's obtained by
- 12 fracking, even if you start out with local wells,
- 13 conventional wells that have been fracked, but not
- 14 the new way, eventually over the next few years,
- decades, whatever, you will be ending up using
- 16 fracked gas.
- 17 And for Cathy Young to say that
- 18 speaking of fracking as a red herring tonight, I
- 19 think is not quite on the mark because of what I
- 20 just mentioned. I think in fact it's a
- 21 foundational question to ask and to talk about.
- 22 So fracking has various negative
- 23 impacts in virtually every stage of the process,
- 24 from the industrialization of our rural countryside
- 25 to extremely high volumes of water used per well

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 along with sand, which has developed its own set of
- 3 health and environmental problems in the Wisconsin
- 4 area, and along with one to four hundred tons, not
- 5 pounds, but tons of chemicals used per well, many
- 6 of which are toxic to humans and other life; from
- 7 high well casing failure rates, which have been
- 8 getting worse over the past few years rather than
- 9 better, to hundreds of cases of water supply
- 10 contamination, both by methane and heavy metals and
- 11 other materials from the frack fluid and from the
- 12 shell formations below; from two million gallons of
- 13 toxic waste left in each well even though studies
- 14 have shown this can over time migrate to near
- 15 surface aquifers, to other fracking waste, often
- 16 radioactive as well as chemically toxic that have
- 17 been poorly treated and dumped in our rivers or
- 18 landfills as if they were household garbage instead
- of the hazardous waste they are; from the gas
- 20 industry being exempt from seven major
- 21 environmental laws including the Clean Water Act,
- 22 which is why those waste aren't treated as
- 23 hazardous, to methods used by the gas industry to
- 24 squelch information about their dark side,
- 25 nondisclosure statements signed by homeowners whose

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 water has been contaminated, gag orders on doctors
- 3 who cannot communicate to their patients or even
- 4 other doctors about fracking-related illness; from
- 5 high levels of methane leaks at many stages in the
- 6 extraction, refining and distribution of natural
- 7 gas, giving it the dubious honor of being the
- 8 dirtiest fossil fuel in terms of global climate
- 9 destabilization, to hundreds of cases of human
- 10 health impacts and other negative societal and
- 11 economic impacts; from accidents, spills and
- 12 explosions to intentional legal and illegal dumping
- 13 of toxic fracking waste on our roads and throughout
- 14 our region even though high volume hydro-fracturing
- 15 is still illegal in New York.
- For these and many other reasons
- 17 millions of people all over the world are working
- 18 to keep fracking out of their country, out of their
- 19 state or out of their town.
- 20 Many countries have banned it as
- 21 have two states in the U.S. and over one hundred
- 22 and sixty towns and villages in New York State. So
- it makes sense if we don't allow a dangerous
- 24 extraction method to be used in our state, that we
- 25 also work to reduce consumption of the product of

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 that extraction. Repowering the Dunkirk plant with
- 3 natural gas would go counter to that.
- I should also say something about
- 5 the price and supply of natural gas. It is
- 6 incredibly inexpensive now due to over-production
- 7 by the industry.
- 8 Some think that was accidental,
- 9 but I think it was intentional. They over-produced
- 10 it because they knew the price of natural gas would
- 11 plummet and when that happened municipal power
- 12 plants such as the Dunkirk plant started converting
- 13 to natural gas.
- 14 Municipal and private vehicle
- 15 fleets have also converted along with many home
- 16 heating systems. The result is that demand for
- 17 natural gas is increasing, which will by itself
- 18 tend to increase the price. Add in the exporting
- 19 of twenty to forty percent of U.S. reserves of
- 20 natural gas overseas, which will likely start in
- just a year or so, and our rock bottom gas prices
- 22 will start climbing.
- When the rest of the world pays
- 24 two to six times what we do, we can't expect our
- 25 prices to stay even close to the same once our

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 natural gas is sold as a world commodity.
- 3 The third thing that will cause
- 4 an increase in our prices will be much lower
- 5 domestic supply than the industry has claimed.
- 6 Well depletion rates from
- 7 conventional gas are high and getting higher. Many
- 8 of the sweet spots have been used and so each new
- 9 well produces less gas than the earlier wells did.
- More wells have to be drilled
- 11 just to keep production level and the input versus
- 12 output ratios for both energy used and cost are
- 13 greatly increasing.
- We keep having to put more energy
- 15 and money in, but we're getting less energy and
- 16 value out. While we won't technically run out of
- 17 natural gas for many centuries, many analysts show
- 18 that it will likely be just a few decades before
- 19 natural gas prices are out of reach for the average
- 20 consumer.
- 21 And while natural gas costs will
- 22 be climbing in the not-so-distant future, renewable
- 23 energy sources see their prices continue to drop.
- 24 Even though things like solar have historically
- 25 been far less expensive than fossil fuels over the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 long-term it is the initial investment that has
- 3 kept many businesses, municipalities and homeowners
- 4 from investing in solar. But that's changing.
- 5 The price of solar has dropped
- 6 fifty percent in the last five years and is now
- 7 competitive with natural gas, even at the low
- 8 natural gas prices we've seen. That's why people
- 9 like me have installed solar panels and we pay zero
- 10 electric bills. We know that our panels won't just
- 11 pay for themselves over their useful life, but will
- 12 actually make money.
- No fossil fuel including natural
- 14 gas can say anything like that. While fossil fuel
- 15 prices climb, renewable fuel prices remain at zero.
- 16 The fuel is free.
- 17 The state of Georgia just
- 18 announced that it will retire many of its coal
- 19 plants and add seven hundred and thirty megawatts
- 20 of solar.
- Closer to home, it was recently
- 22 announced just in the last few days that the
- 23 Cummings plant in Jamestown will soon install two
- 24 megawatts in solar panels and Wegmans in Lakewood
- 25 will add a five hundred and thirty-six kilowatt

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 system to its roof, which is about a hundred times
- 3 the size of mine.
- 4 And despite solar and wind too
- 5 becoming not only competitive, but soon cheaper
- 6 than fossil fuels, I heard that renewables weren't
- 7 even considered in the discussions about the
- 8 Dunkirk plant.
- 9 I hope the person who told me
- 10 that was incorrect, but if it's true I wouldn't be
- 11 surprised given the amount of money the gas
- 12 corporations have given our local state and
- 13 national representatives.
- 14 So while I haven't had the time
- 15 to fully expand on all these ideas, I hope I've
- 16 presented enough information to help convince you
- 17 that if you repower the Dunkirk plant with natural
- 18 gas you'll likely be facing continually rising fuel
- 19 prices and all the associated health and
- 20 environmental issues associated with that energy
- 21 source.
- 22 If you instead examine what
- 23 efficiency and renewables could bring to the table
- 24 and how in the long-term that would be a much less
- 25 expensive choice, not just in money, but in all the

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 other environmental health costs as well, the
- 3 decision on this plant should be very different
- 4 from the one the gas industry might be pushing.
- 5 I'd like to close in the wise
- 6 words of Glinda, the -- the witch from the north,
- 7 who told Dorothy you had the power all along.
- 8 The people in this room not only
- 9 have the power to help decide suitable public
- 10 policy through your board, but we each have the
- 11 power literally falling on our yards and on our
- 12 rooftops and it's high time we take advantage of
- 13 that, not in the future, but now.
- 14 Thank you very much.
- 15 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Gregory
- 16 Edwards?
- MR. EDWARDS: Greg Edwards,
- 18 current county executive.
- I have the distinct pleasure of
- 20 representing all hundred and thirty thousand people
- 21 who call this place their home. And I share all
- the remarks made earlier about what a pleasure it
- 23 has been having you here this evening.
- 24 Since much has already been said
- 25 about the importance of your decision this evening,

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 but I'd -- I'd like to provide for you just some
- 3 context.
- 4 I've had the opportunity to
- 5 appear at any number of events across New York
- 6 State from Nassau County to Warren County, to St.
- 7 Lawrence County and around. In context I think for
- 8 you as particularly important this evening.
- 9 I was born here. I grew up here.
- 10 I've had the pleasure of working here. Never in my
- 11 life have I ever seen, been at or even heard about
- 12 an event that has drawn this many people with this
- 13 much passion who have stayed this long to try and
- 14 convey a very important thought, a very important
- issue to people who they know have the power to
- 16 make those decisions.
- 17 You tonight -- you tonight have
- 18 experienced something very unique. You have heard
- 19 directly from the voice of virtually everyone
- 20 represented here tonight, representing all of our
- 21 groups of citizens in Chautauqua County. I
- 22 couldn't help but keep track of those who spoke in
- favor and not-so-in-favor of repowering the N.R.G.
- 24 project in Dunkirk.
- The math is overwhelming. You've

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 heard from the largest group ever assembled for an
- 3 event like this and the message has been
- 4 overwhelming.
- 5 What I'm particularly pleased
- 6 about is I've had the pleasure of working with all
- 7 the gentlemen up here that spoke on both these
- 8 issues and I know this is not an either/or question
- 9 because any number of times Dennis has called me in
- 10 the middle of the night representing National Grid
- 11 not only pledging their support, but showing their
- 12 support for the people of Chautaugua County by
- 13 assembling their resources to respond to that call
- 14 and also investing their resources as they have
- 15 repeatedly over the decades in Chautauqua County.
- That is not going to stop. I
- 17 know Dennis won't. I know his -- his company will
- 18 not end their investment in Chautauqua County.
- I was pleased to work with Lee
- 20 over many months in the negotiation of their
- 21 twenty-year PILOT with Chautauqua County, the city
- 22 of Dunkirk and the City School District.
- It was an open, honest and
- 24 aggressive negotiation and in the end we all
- 25 benefited from their investment of over two hundred

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 and fifty million dollars in Dunkirk. What you
- 3 have the opportunity to decide and return this
- 4 information back to the rest of your team is what
- 5 Lee and his company propose is the largest private
- 6 investment to ever occur in Chautauqua County with
- 7 the proposed five hundred million dollar investment
- 8 in N.R.G. in Dunkirk, not just a big one, not just
- 9 an important one, but the largest single investment
- 10 ever in Chautauqua County.
- 11 Again, my effort here tonight is
- 12 not to restate what you've already heard, but to
- 13 give you perspective.
- 14 The final bit of perspective is
- 15 I've had the pleasure of attending an event with
- 16 Governor Cuomo just last week and it was an
- 17 excellent event. And he came here with his Start
- 18 Up New York Plan and certainly that's a much better
- one than originally proposed and I can support it
- 20 now because the expansion will actually assist
- 21 Chautauqua County and our economy.
- 22 And while that was important, the
- 23 most important thing I heard that day was Governor
- 24 Cuomo's direct response to the media that was
- 25 assembled there after that event. And while I

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 can't quote him today as I -- I did later moments
- 3 after he said it to the media, what he said was let
- 4 the process take fold -- unfold. Let the P.S.C.
- 5 hear from the people of Chautauqua County about
- 6 what their desires are.
- 7 Ladies and gentlemen, you've
- 8 heard it tonight overwhelmingly. You couldn't have
- 9 missed this message if you tried. The largest
- 10 investment ever.
- 11 A continued commitment from two
- 12 companies regardless of the outcome, but the only
- one that invests in us and allows us to continue to
- 14 grow and develop is the one that's proposed to
- 15 repower N.R.G.
- I can speak with a voice for all
- 17 the people of Chautauqua County. Over ninety
- 18 percent of the hundred and thirty thousand people
- 19 of Chautauqua County support the repowering of
- 20 N.R.G., the future it will provide.
- Governor Cuomo charged you with a
- 22 duty, you're doing it. It's in statute what you
- 23 have to consider. If you take what you've heard
- 24 tonight and apply it to that statutory framework,
- 25 along with what Governor Cuomo indicated as your

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 obligation and that was to hear from the people of
- 3 Chautauqua County, we'll be hearing very soon that
- 4 we'll be repowering N.R.G.
- 5 Thank you.
- A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Doreen Bumpus?
- 7 MS. BUMPUS: I'd like to thank
- 8 everyone who stayed. There's actually somebody
- 9 that I can speak to. I've lived in Dunkirk for
- 10 over twenty years. I've raised my children here.
- 11 I'm still raising children here.
- I had children that have gone to
- 13 BOCES, to the Dunkirk Public School and also the
- 14 Fredonia Public School.
- My house was built in 1900. I
- live on probably even less than a fixed income
- 17 because instead of going on social services I am
- 18 living off school loans. And I am living off
- 19 school loans because I believe that I have
- 20 something to give back to this community.
- 21 A lot of confusing data has been
- 22 presented this evening, but one thing that we all
- 23 know is we cannot afford further job losses or to
- 24 incur higher expenses, such as increased property
- 25 taxes. Therefore, in my opinion in general we

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 cannot afford to lose the Dunkirk power plant.
- I think there are still some
- 4 issues that need clarification, but overall we need
- 5 this. To put it in real terms for you, have you
- 6 gone hungry in order that your children can eat?
- 7 Have you worn plastic bags in your winter boots so
- 8 that your feet don't get wet? Have you had to make
- 9 a choice which bill you pay before one of them is
- 10 disconnected?
- I don't speak just for myself, I
- 12 speak for many other people who face these -- these
- 13 fears and these realities and I speak for others
- 14 who should this loss of a tax-paying company affect
- 15 us, where will we be? We want a hand up, not a
- 16 hand out. We want jobs for supporting our families
- 17 and we want a decent public education for our
- 18 children.
- 19 I have two more semesters of
- 20 undergraduate work here and in my time here I've
- 21 researched issues such as the literacy crisis in
- 22 America and at-risk children.
- We live in an area of
- 24 multi-cultural diversity, but we all share a common
- 25 desire to enjoy an improved quality of life for our

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 families. In order to make a decision based on
- 3 facts rather than on fear, our community needs
- 4 further information on this complicated issue.
- 5 I understand the frustration of
- 6 the senior citizen who stood here and said that she
- 7 didn't understand all these facts. They're well
- 8 presented, but many of us don't have a higher
- 9 education. For many of us we have not had to -- to
- 10 learn the full impact and data that this issue
- 11 entails.
- I believe that in repowering the
- 13 Dunkirk, New York plant it's desirable. I just
- 14 wonder if the public understand all the proposed
- 15 components to the N.R.G. plan.
- For example, the issue of
- 17 subsidies came up and shareholders. Well, when it
- 18 comes to shareholders a businesses primary
- 19 responsibility is to make a profit for
- 20 shareholders.
- 21 So when it comes to the issue of
- 22 subsidies I wonder how will that affect us in the
- 23 long run. I don't doubt that we need to keep this
- 24 plant open. I just think like with other issues,
- 25 perhaps we need to explore a little further some of

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 the ramifications.
- 3 In real terms the ripple effect
- 4 of the loss of substantial tax source will likely
- 5 cause an increase of at-risk youth and prevent them
- 6 from attaining a public education as well as
- 7 proceeding to higher education.
- 8 We need to have jobs. We need to
- 9 have education available for our children because
- 10 we need it not only now, but we need it for the
- 11 future of our society so that we don't incur
- 12 further risks because of these times.
- We're likely to see an increase
- in welfare dependency without jobs. How much more
- 15 can the welfare system provide? It's been pointed
- 16 out that with the loss of public servants we might
- 17 see an increase -- increase in crime and along with
- 18 that with the stress of trying to maintain homes
- 19 and jobs and keep our families together there will
- 20 be a stress on mental health. This may all seem to
- 21 be kind of distant and not relevant, but the cost
- 22 is not only for now, but for the future.
- I urge you to consider the
- 24 serious ramifications to an already economically
- 25 depressed city and county should N.R.G. no longer

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 remain in the city of Dunkirk. I beseech you to
- 3 consider the positive impact the N.R.G. -- I'm
- 4 sorry, reprocessing plant project will have for
- 5 Dunkirk, New York, and the rest of Chautauqua
- 6 County, enabling job retention and job growth as
- 7 well as providing an efficient and responsible
- 8 source of energies for our homes, schools and
- 9 businesses.
- 10 You have it within your power to
- 11 make a positive difference in our lives and I
- 12 sincerely hope that you will choose to keep Dunkirk
- 13 power plant open.
- 14 Thank you.
- 15 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Robert Gaus?
- 16 Mr. and Mrs. Robert Lawrie?
- James Burnett?
- MR. BURNETT: Good evening. My
- 19 name is James Burnett. I'm an unemployed
- 20 electrical engineer and I live downstream from you
- in Lackawanna, where we have wind power.
- My house has a hundred percent
- wind-generated electricity supplied by National
- 24 Grid or it's transported by National Grid. It's
- 25 not manufactured.

Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-20131 2. The low price of natural -- of 3 natural gas coupled with emissions issues from the combustion of coal has led to the local coal burner 4 5 being mothballed. And this is a job crisis that crept up slowly as we began to understand the true 6 cost of destructive coal mining, contamination of 7 rivers near extraction sites and the trace amounts 8 9 of mercury in coal, which gets exhausted from 10 smokestacks. 11 James Watt's coal fantasy of the 12 Nineteenth Century came to an abrupt end today due 13 to health and externalized costs issues. So we 14 have a job crisis. 15 Our next fantasy is gas 16 repowering. N.R.G. claims massive reductions in 17 Lake Erie water use for cooling, a reduction in 18 most combustion byproducts and jobs -- clean jobs. 19 But as with all fantasies the dream grinds to a 20 halt eventually. 21 Once the bulk liquification and overseas exports of natural gas starts, you'll have 22 23 to fight for gas in a seller's market -- in a 24 seller's market coming down the pipeline.

China will outbid you, you

25

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 understand that? China will outbid you, I promise.
- 3 And you will likely be forced into a high volume
- 4 horizontal hydro-fracking. It's a desperation move
- 5 that you'll paint your corner -- you'll paint
- 6 yourself in a corner with.
- 7 So this is the cost of repowering
- 8 with low-priced natural gas -- low-priced, high
- 9 cost natural gas. There's a difference between
- 10 price and cost. I hope all of you understand that.
- 11 What happened to your coal-fired
- 12 plant was a classic case of economic dumping and
- once the noose is around your neck by committing to
- 14 an entire future of natural gas power -- powering,
- 15 you'll feel the squeeze.
- And, in a few decades your kids
- 17 will be right here having the same discussion that
- 18 we're having right now, wondering who was to blame
- 19 for this.
- 20 Madam Senator, Mr. Assemblyman,
- 21 we set the stage tonight for their own job crisis.
- 22 Wind and solar is your future here and transmission
- 23 systems upgrades are a necessity. And I guess I
- 24 would like to conclude with that.
- Thank you very much.

```
Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013
 1
 2.
                       A.L.J. HARRIMAN: John Zebrodsky?
 3
                       Rita Yelda?
                       Matthew Hanlon?
 4
 5
                       Kathleen Riley?
 6
                       Barbara -- oops.
 7
                       MS. RILEY: Good evening. It's
     almost morning.
 8
 9
                       My name is Kathleen Riley and I'm
10
     a summer resident of Chautauqua County. And the
11
     rest of the year I'm a resident of Port Jefferson
12
     in Long Island.
13
                       I first want to commend the
14
     Public Service Commission on holding this hearing,
15
     to Senator Young for supporting this hearing and
16
     especially to the -- all the people that are here
17
     tonight to come out and speak on repowering. I say
18
     to them keep on, keep on.
19
                       I -- I know what's it like to
20
     fight for repowering as I am a member of the Grass
21
     Roots Committee on Long Island to repower the power
22
     plant of Port Jefferson, New York, same repowering
23
     issues as Dunkirk.
24
                       For the record, I am asking the
25
     Public Service Commission will you be using a
```

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 similar or same process for evaluating repowering
- 3 Port Jefferson on Long Island next year? I'm proud
- 4 to be in this room with all these concerned
- 5 citizens who have taken the time to get involved
- 6 and to speak out.
- Repower, repower, repower. And
- 8 to all of you, don't give up.
- 9 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Barbara --
- 10 Barbara Frankiewicz?
- Herman Ruhlman?
- MR. RUHLMAN: Good evening.
- 13 Thank you for this venue here to express our
- 14 feelings.
- I'm Herm Ruhlman. I'm a resident
- of Frewsburg, New York. I have two companies, one
- in Falconer, New York, Rand Machine Products, and
- 18 Spartan Tool Company.
- We -- one -- one of our main jobs
- 20 we've done for the last thirty years is railroad
- 21 components. And we specifically do parts for rail
- 22 cars that haul coal and when this whole thing came
- 23 out a year ago, the railroads put a hundred and
- 24 sixty-nine thousand coal cars on sidings because
- 25 they had no use for them anymore.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 I lost a million-dollar a year
- 3 account. I lost ten employees that lost their jobs
- 4 a year ago and haven't recalled them back and at
- 5 this point it doesn't look like much future for it.
- I am in favor of repowering and
- 7 keeping the Dunkirk power plant. I would prefer
- 8 they go back to coal personally. But natural gas
- 9 seems like an acceptable substitute for that.
- 10 The -- the problem I have with
- 11 this whole thing and what's happening in America, I
- 12 mean I -- I was born in Warren, Pennsylvania. I'm
- 13 a true American. I wasn't born in Africa or
- 14 someplace like that.
- I feel that there's a systematic
- 16 catastrophe happening in our country where we're
- 17 dismantling all of our industry. And America's the
- 18 greatest nation on earth. We don't have to say
- 19 anything to anybody. We are on top of the heap,
- 20 but we're allowing this to happen. And I disagree
- 21 terribly, strongly about this.
- 22 And I've -- I've worked
- 23 at Rand machine. I started back in '68, so I've
- 24 been there for forty-five years. I did take four
- 25 years off to serve in the Air Force during the

Page 171

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 Vietnam War. I didn't get into Vietnam. I was in
- 3 the Philippines for a while.
- And I vote in every election.
- 5 I've never missed one. And I kind of expect the
- 6 people that I vote into office will take care of
- 7 things. I've been busy with my company. I've
- 8 owned it for thirty-three years. And I don't pay
- 9 as much attention to things as I should.
- 10 One thing, and I don't know the
- 11 story, I know it wasn't all that long ago that
- 12 Niagara Mohawk sold out to Niagara -- or -- yeah,
- 13 National Grid.
- 14 And I understand they're a
- 15 British company and I have a real problem with us
- 16 turning over our power generation and power
- 17 transmission to a foreign country and allowing them
- 18 to make our decisions for us for the Chautauqua
- 19 County. That -- that should not allow -- be
- 20 allowed to happen at all ever in this country. We
- 21 don't have to get down to anybody. It comes right
- 22 back to President Obama saying that we're not a
- 23 Christian nation.
- 24 When the Declaration of
- 25 Independence was signed there were fifty-six

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 signers. Fifty-three of them were ordained
- 3 Christian ministers. There's a pretty good chance
- 4 that fifty-three out of fifty-six makes it a
- 5 Christian nation, when the founders were all that
- 6 way.
- 7 And I disagree with political
- 8 correctness in general that if it's -- we need to
- 9 say where the bear shit in the buckwheat just pure
- 10 and simple.
- It's something where I think we
- 12 have a very high tolerance and always have, that as
- other people come into our country they're welcome
- 14 to worship as they -- as they see fit. We have no
- 15 problem with that unless they try to undermine our
- 16 system. That I have a problem with, I really do.
- And I don't want somebody from
- 18 Britain making my decisions for Chautaugua County.
- We have the three plants, two in
- 20 Falconer. We're under the B.P.U. in Jamestown.
- 21 And the other one is in -- between Gary and St.
- 22 Clairsville and it's under National Grid. And the
- 23 electric costs are significant lower --
- 24 significantly lower in Jamestown than they are
- 25 under National Grid.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 And either they're extremely
- 3 inefficient or they're greedy. And I suspect greed
- 4 is a big part of it. So a lot of these costs that
- 5 they're putting in, saying that the -- the things
- 6 are going to go up five percent as time goes on, I
- 7 think are very flexible and they're being done that
- 8 way for a reason and it's not for our benefit. And
- 9 I really have a problem with that.
- I do want to see that plant
- 11 remain open for Chautauqua County. I think it's
- 12 important that we retain our own industry and
- 13 that's an industry no different than mine. I'm
- 14 machine parts and they make electricity. But other
- 15 than that we're no different.
- You need to really think long and
- 17 hard about letting our country go the way its
- 18 going. It's not just our power system. It's a lot
- 19 of things that are going on in this country that
- 20 are not right. Anybody that has a smokestack it's
- 21 cheaper to move their production to China than it
- 22 is to get through the fines and the restrictions of
- 23 trying to operate.
- I built on to Spartan Tool in
- 25 2005 and I doubled the sized of it from

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 seventy-five hundred feet to fifteen thousand
- 3 square feet.
- 4 My taxes went from just over four
- 5 thousand to twenty thousand dollars, almost a five
- 6 hundred percent increase by doubling the size of my
- 7 plant. That irritated the heck out of me. I just
- 8 put on an addition down at my Falconer plant.
- 9 I assumed that getting a building
- 10 permit would take a week or two. It took me
- 11 fifteen months to get a building permit.
- 12 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Mr. Ruhlman --
- MR. RUHLMAN: Yeah?
- 14 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: -- sorry, but
- it's eleven twenty and I really want to try to get
- 16 through everybody.
- MS. RUHLMAN: Okay. I'm sorry.
- 18 I'm sorry. I was here at seven. Goodbye.
- 19 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Thank you.
- 20 Kurt and Lucy Worombrandt?
- I'm going to ask everybody to try
- 22 and keep your comments to a minute. I know some of
- 23 you waited all night. I just want to be able to
- 24 get through everybody's, before we have to leave
- 25 and the college can close the facility.

Page 175

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 MR. WARMBRODT: This will take
- 3 two minutes. Hello.
- 4 My name is Kurt Warmbrodt. I
- 5 live at 115 Frasier Street in Dunkirk. I've lived
- 6 in Dunkirk pretty much my whole life.
- 7 Dunkirk's greatest asset is Lake
- 8 Erie. Over the past sixty-three years the Dunkirk
- 9 lakefront has been used by Niagara Mohawk and now
- 10 N.R.G. to generate electricity.
- 11 What is needed now is a new
- 12 direction in the use of this lakefront property,
- 13 which has not been talked about at all. Should a
- 14 new electric generating facility using natural gas
- 15 be built in Dunkirk, consider building the new
- 16 facility, which has never been talked about, south
- of Route 5 along the existing electric transmission
- 18 lines leaving the plant, along the railroad within
- 19 the city, behind Wheeler Trucking.
- 20 A new gas facility will only
- 21 require a small percentage of the existing plant
- 22 property. Building the new plant south of Route 5
- 23 will maintain all the taxes and jobs on city land
- 24 that is not developed now.
- The move will allow Dunkirk to

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 move forward with new lakefront development. Many
- 3 jobs will be created, removing the existing plant
- 4 and cleaning up the site for future development.
- 5 Future development of this
- 6 property needs to be in high rise apartments,
- 7 office space that pay taxes.
- 8 Dunkirk needs an entire community
- 9 to be built on this property as a way to revitalize
- 10 the city. Dunkirk needs this lakefront property to
- 11 be used by many people. A lot of press has been
- 12 given to how this plant will affect all of
- 13 Chautauqua County. Dunkirk is surrounded and has
- 14 limited areas for future development.
- I feel that this development is
- 16 for Dunkirk residents to work on. Yes, all
- 17 residents are tied together in Chautauqua County
- 18 and I have pride saying that I live in Chautaugua
- 19 County, but this is Dunkirk's decision on Dunkirk's
- 20 future.
- 21 Those other people that live
- 22 outside the community did not choose to buy a house
- 23 in Dunkirk and raise their family there. So yes, I
- like your comments, but come to Dunkirk and spend
- 25 your money first. Please help Dunkirk move forward

- Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013

 in the Twenty-first Century and develop the
- 3 lakefront into a destination. I may be asking for
- 4 something that sounds difficult and may take many
- 5 years to complete, but this -- this decision is for
- 6 the long-term ability of Dunkirk to move the
- 7 lakefront forward and the whole city and
- 8 surrounding area forward.
- 9 And I thank you very much for --
- 10 yes, eleven twenty-one, for -- for whatever, but
- 11 some people did speak for over twenty minutes.
- 12 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Harry Aitken?
- 13 Ashund M-I-L-A-Z-Z-A-V-O-M-D?
- 14 Tom Mean?
- 15 Susan Kalfas?
- 16 Lori Cornell?
- MS. CORNELL: Thank you very
- 18 much. I'm Lori Cornell, Chautauqua County
- 19 legislator.
- 20 And I have to confess I can
- 21 usually hide the fact that I tend to show up
- 22 everywhere just a touch late. I get that from my
- 23 father, Carl. Right? But tonight that was clearly
- 24 not the case.
- I proudly represent the great

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 people of the city of Jamestown where I now live.
- But, I tell you tonight I have
- 4 never been more proud than to have been born and
- 5 raised in the great city of Dunkirk. On behalf of
- 6 my Jamestown constituents from about forty-five
- 7 minutes away, make no mistake about it, we stand
- 8 with Dunkirk. We stand with Northern Chautauqua
- 9 County from Jamestown to Dunkirk, to French Creek
- 10 to Hanover; Chautauqua County stands together.
- This project not only represents
- 12 a critical move for our county's economy and tax
- 13 base, but offers critical protection for our
- 14 environment.
- N.R.G.'s new plant would be
- 16 significantly cleaner and would make use of
- 17 renewable energy. This is not the economy versus
- 18 the environment. This is a project that would
- 19 decrease harmful emissions, while enhancing our
- 20 economy.
- This is a long-term solution that
- 22 will lead to cleaner energy and more jobs. Failure
- 23 to support this half a billion dollar investment
- 24 would mean higher taxes, fewer jobs and dirtier
- 25 air, three things we cannot afford.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 And so I urge you tonight repower
- 3 Dunkirk, renew Chautauqua County, restart our local
- 4 economy. Our future is now.
- 5 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: L. T. Beahan?
- 6 And last, Michael Sullivan.
- 7 MR. SULLIVAN: Good evening. I'm
- 8 Michael Sullivan. I'm an attorney who over the
- 9 last three decades has spent about twelve years in
- 10 and out of elected office in Fredonia, at one time
- 11 being mayor of the village.
- 12 As an attorney it's always great
- 13 to get a chance to go last. I do have one guestion
- 14 before I make my comments and that is the portion
- of this evening from six o'clock until seven or
- 16 seven-thirty, is that part of the record for the
- 17 judge when you're making your decision?
- 18 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: First, I won't
- 19 be making the decision. The Commission will be
- 20 making the decision. And second, the educational
- 21 forum is not part of the transcript because it's a
- 22 presentation of facts already contained in the
- 23 record.
- MR. SULLIVAN: Is there any way
- of making the presentation from the questions and

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 answers part of that record, particularly the
- 3 portion between Mr. Goodell and the National Grid
- 4 representatives?
- 5 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: So you're
- 6 asking whether or not their Powerpoint presentation
- 7 that they presented tonight or that the discussion
- 8 that was had during the --?
- 9 MR. SULLIVAN: The discussion --
- 10 the questions and answers. There were questions
- 11 and answers where there was some maybe meetings of
- 12 minds I guess between our -- our Assemblymen and
- 13 the National Grid representatives. Can that be
- 14 made part of the record that the Commission has?
- 15 A.L.J. HARRIMAN: We have not
- 16 actively recorded that, so that is kind of -- we're
- 17 unable to incorporate that into the record, but I'm
- 18 sure Assemblyman Goodell's questions were specific
- 19 and if he wants to supplement his comments to
- 20 reflect that exchange he's -- you know, he's free
- 21 to do so and we have until August 16th that the
- 22 record will remain open.
- MR. SULLIVAN: Well, then with
- 24 that, I hope he'll do so because it was certainly
- 25 an interesting and helpful exchange.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 I'm a fifth generation resident
- 3 here and every time I hear someone introduced as
- 4 having been formerly from here or coming back home
- 5 it's a little bit of sadness because it's just
- 6 another example of the people that have had to
- 7 leave here. And that's why it's so important that
- 8 tonight this Commission was willing to listen to
- 9 the economic -- economic -- the temporary and
- 10 permanent jobs, economic development and tax
- 11 revenue issues.
- We believe in ourselves, that's
- 13 why I keep running for public office, which is why
- 14 I'm here tonight and that's why so many people were
- 15 here tonight. Mr. Sedyscyv mentioned that the
- 16 plant -- it was a national security plant.
- 17 I remember growing up and walking
- 18 around it, eight or nine years old, and really
- 19 worrying because the height of the cold war that
- 20 plant was a target because the first thing you do
- is you take out the power plant. So we knew we
- 22 were high on the list. I got to tell you though I
- 23 never suspected that the direct threat to that
- 24 plant would come from the United Kingdom. I always
- 25 expected the Soviet Union.

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- 2 We had a lot of people here this
- 3 evening and they were not here with open hands and
- 4 a cup begging for something without doing something
- 5 on their own.
- 6 There was some interesting facts,
- 7 believe it or not at this late hour, that you had
- 8 not heard about this community. People that were
- 9 sitting in this room tonight have negotiated
- 10 contracts without pay increases because they know
- 11 they have to help. They had to make concessions.
- 12 Down the road Brockton and Westfield Schools are
- 13 currently in the process of seeking consolidation.
- 14 Farther down, Ripley is now going
- 15 to be sending their high school students to
- 16 Chautauqua Lake School District. Chadwick Bay was
- 17 mentioned this evening.
- 18 Chadwick Bay is working on a
- 19 regional water plant. We're doing a lot of things
- 20 here that we have control of for our own best
- 21 interest. But we also acknowledge tonight there's
- 22 a decision that needs to be made that we can't
- 23 make, that we can't do for ourselves, that we need
- 24 you to take care of.
- We're not asking you to fix all

- 1 Case 12-E-0577 7-15-2013
- of our ills. We're working on a lot of those
- 3 things, but we need this plant. We need to have
- 4 that continued success of generating that
- 5 electricity, creating the jobs that will come with
- 6 it. We can't do that on our own.
- 7 We really do need this board to
- 8 consider all of the economics and historically the
- 9 idea that we would ultimately have a plant here
- 10 generated with and operating with natural gas, a
- 11 plant that's located less than four miles from the
- 12 site of the first industrial commercial gas well in
- 13 the United States.
- 14 At one time we lit our houses and
- 15 our streets with natural gas. I'm sure there was a
- 16 debate years ago when they were looking to switch
- 17 from the natural gas to the electricity. And now
- 18 we have the opportunity to come full circle, just
- 19 the historic irony of now having the possibility of
- 20 a plant four miles away generating electricity
- 21 using that natural gas, which has been the backbone
- of this community and this area for over a hundred
- and seventy-five years.
- 24 Please consider that and remember
- 25 that the people that were here tonight, as large of

```
1
                 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013
 2
     a crowd as it is, it was not the largest crowd
 3
     we've been able to gather. Recently we had a crowd
     a little bit larger in downtown Fredonia, but in
 4
     that crowd we had an Olympic gold medal and we were
 5
     going to have an athlete doing a pole vault
 6
 7
     demonstration for us.
 8
                       We're not asking you to pole
 9
     vault, we're not asking you to set any kind of
10
     records or get a gold medal, but we are asking you
11
     to give us the opportunity to continue to move
12
     forward with a plant operated with natural gas.
13
     Thank you.
14
                       A.L.J. HARRIMAN: Okay. So, it's
15
     now eleven thirty-five. We've taken all the public
16
     statements for the evening and I'm going to adjourn
     this case. Thank you.
17
18
                       (Off the record)
19
                       (The hearing adjourned)
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

Page 185

```
1
                 Case 12-E-0577 - 7-15-2013
 2
     STATE OF NEW YORK
     I, G. Michael France, do hereby certify that the
     foregoing was reported by me, in the cause, at the time
 3
     and place, as stated in the caption hereto, at Page 1
     hereof; that the foregoing typewritten transcription
 4
     consisting of pages 1 through 184, is a true record of
     all proceedings had at the hearing to the best of our
 5
     skill and ability.
 6
                   IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
     subscribed my name.
 7
 8
     G. Michael France, Reporter
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

```
adhered 67:17
                                  adjourn 184:16
abbreviated 60:2
                                  adjourned 184:19
abided 134:14
                                  administrative 1:13 2:13 5:17
abiding 137:15
                                  administrators 40:10 115:4
ability 11:9 12:21 24:3 45:19
                                  admission 78:24
 102:21,23 105:7 177:6 185:5
                                  admit 103:15
able 4:9 6:5 35:21 56:22 57:4,8
                                  adopted 51:6,18
 72:17 89:17 90:4,10 101:2
                                  adopting 51:25
 102:13 114:10 121:17 127:25
                                  adoption 51:5
 143:6 174:23 184:3
                                 Adult 42:8
able-bodied 128:5
                                  advantage 21:25 156:12
abrupt 166:12
                                  advantages 28:9
absolute 83:14
                                  advertises 16:8
absolutely 30:25 44:6
                                 advocating 51:4 60:8
abundant 107:15,22
                                 affect 24:23 162:14 163:22
academic 85:12
                                   176:12
accept 43:9 73:23 110:12
                                  afford 9:19 40:10 41:12 95:2
acceptable 170:9
                                   114:11,14,16,19 129:13 161:23
acceptance 85:17
                                   162:2 178:25
access 37:5 68:18
                                  affordable 139:20
accidental 152:8
                                 Africa 170:13
accidents 151:11
                                  after-school 40:20
account 170:3
                                  age 48:7
accounts 28:13
                                  aged 15:15
accurately 91:19
                                  agencies 52:20
achieve 43:23
                                 Agency 112:5
acknowledge 182:21
                                  aggressive 158:24
acknowledges 29:18
                                 aggressively 60:19
acres 125:7
                                  aging 11:2 24:4 117:25
act 72:8 109:14 150:21
                                  ago 8:3 28:17 57:18 67:3 69:15
action 55:11 108:24 146:16,21
                                   75:2,19 81:9 102:5 103:11,15
actions 23:4
                                   139:3 141:18 169:23 170:4
actively 180:16
                                   171:11 183:16
activity 87:24 121:19
                                  agree 48:6
actual 18:21 21:12
                                  agreed 12:4
add 9:9 41:10 106:8 108:23
                                  agreeing 33:14
 116:7 125:25 147:23 152:18
                                  agreement 28:20,21 103:4,6,10
 154:19,25
                                  agreements 22:23
added 7:22 15:13 86:2 115:19
                                  agriculture 71:24 130:25
addiction 117:10
                                  ahead 82:18 132:25 140:9
addition 21:14 23:5 27:17 86:15
                                  aid 40:2
 174:8
                                  aide 113:22
additional 18:17 19:4,9 39:4
                                  air7:23 11:24 19:25 32:3 73:16
 40:13,13
                                   86:7 121:22 124:15 142:21
Additionally 36:15
                                   170:25 178:25
address 2:10 55:4 88:3 118:18
                                 Aitken 177:12
addressed 68:12
                                 Albany 1:14
addressing 29:2 119:6
                                 Alff 44:16 54:25 55:2,2
adequate 67:5,14 115:14
                                 Allegany 104:23
```

```
allocate 16:6
                                  appears 23:3
allow 42:20 46:18 50:7 68:14
                                  applause 77:19
 78:15 85:15 88:8,15,18 92:22
                                  apply 160:24
 95:4 98:23 130:12 151:23
                                  appreciate 34:25 57:12 79:8
 171:19 175:25
                                   121:23 130:22
allowed 56:16 90:5 171:20
                                  appreciated 37:25
allowing 22:4 108:24 170:20
                                 approach 32:6
 171:17
                                 approve 28:11 141:3 142:21
allows 16:25 46:4 160:13
                                  approved 71:3 73:3
alternative 18:15 29:21,21
                                 approves 28:2
 39:10 46:3 116:22 117:24
                                 approximately 109:24 115:11
 118:19
                                   120:16,18 121:11
alternatives 1:5 2:7 34:23
                                 aquifers 150:15
 35:12
                                 area 15:18 16:2 34:20 63:4,10
altogether 128:18
                                   63:12,13,14 75:20,22 76:5
America 49:6,18 162:22 170:11
                                   85:24 86:2,22 88:14 91:22
American 105:18 127:21 142:6
                                   98:2 102:7,13,15 114:15
                                   128:16 131:2 136:25 145:16
 170:13
Americans 11:5
                                   150:4 162:23 177:8 183:22
America's 107:22 170:17
                                 areas 43:5 68:18 71:8 97:10
amount 78:16 129:4 130:5 135:14
                                   110:17 176:14
 135:18 155:11
                                 area's 129:2
amounts 19:17 166:8
                                  argument 22:8
analysis 19:8 24:17 29:12 119:9
                                 arising 96:4
 122:7
                                  arms 142:12,16
analysts 153:17
                                 arranged 104:10
                                 art 85:10
analyzed 83:22
ancillary 35:18
                                 article 86:4
Andrew 4:22 25:17 91:5
                                 Ashund 177:13
Andy 143:25
                                 asked 86:6
Ang 127:3
                                 asking 33:5 77:20 88:15 122:25
animation 133:6
                                   143:15 168:24 177:3 180:6
annihilation 7:11
                                   182:25 184:8,9,10
announced 50:24 112:9 154:18,22
                                 aspect 124:7
annual 8:13 72:23 122:11 146:22
                                 aspects 20:24
 147:5
                                 assembled 158:2 159:25
annually 9:18,23 40:17
                                  assembling 158:13
answer 14:17 58:10 59:23 80:5
                                  assembly 12:5 26:16 29:9
answers 93:4,5 149:4 180:2,10
                                 assemblyman 4:22 25:17,19,25
 180:11
                                   29:5,8 91:6 143:4 167:20
Anthony 4:22 33:24
                                   180:18
anybody 55:6 138:6 170:19
                                 Assemblyman's 25:23
 171:21 173:20
                                 assemblymen 104:18 180:12
anymore 33:6 89:16 114:11
                                 assertion 77:6
 169:25
                                 assessor 9:12
anyway 93:3 98:19 118:2
                                 asset 97:7,14 98:11 175:7
apartments 176:6
                                 assets 96:5 140:12
apparently 29:14 149:2
                                 assist 52:19 159:20
                                 assistance 89:19 116:11 117:2
appeal 147:8
                                   142:3
appear 157:5
```

```
associated 97:24 124:16 155:19
                                   63:4,5,8 66:2 70:3 81:4 103:3
                                   103:15 121:3,20 139:8 142:24
 155:20
Association 84:9 86:18 111:5
                                   143:8 159:4 161:20 170:4,8,23
                                   171:22 181:4
 115:5
                                 backbone 183:21
assume 43:18,20
                                 backed 75:4
assumed 174:9
assure 12:25
                                 backup 76:15
athlete 184:6
                                 backwards 117:8
athletics 94:8
                                 backyards 60:17
attaining 164:6
                                 bad 32:11,14
                                 bags 162:7
attendance 37:9 46:2
attended 63:5
                                 bait 16:15
attending 69:11 159:15
                                 Baker 82:24 84:7,7
                                 balance 7:8 21:5 120:4,4
attention 37:24 57:12 171:9
Attica 132:22
                                 Banikowski 90:21 93:13,13,14
                                 bank 58:12 119:19,20 122:11
attorney 179:8,12
attracted 43:11 122:19
                                 bankruptcy 28:25,25
attracting 90:11
                                 banned 151:20
attractive 85:22
                                 Barbara 168:6 169:9,10
at-risk 52:11 162:22 164:5
                                 Barmore 147:16
audience 25:22 27:18
                                 base 6:10 7:18 9:15 10:16 11:17
audio 3:23
                                   11:21 45:10 52:16 58:20,24,25
August 146:23 180:21
                                   72:10 83:18 102:10 103:8
Aulstrom 100:17,22,23
                                   114:9 120:23 121:19 178:13
                                 based 28:22 49:16 67:5 70:15
authority 24:5 122:10
authorize 37:2
                                   83:25 163:2
automatic 75:25 76:10,15
                                 baseline 20:3
automatically 76:2
                                 base-load42:24
availability 61:14
                                 basic 130:4
available 3:18 164:9
                                 basically 99:16,19
Avenue 1:10
                                 basis 28:7
                                 Bay 108:5,15 182:16,18
average 9:13,15 39:2 120:3,7
 153:19
                                 Beahan 179:5
aware 69:17
                                 bear 172:9
A.E.P22:23
                                 bearing 22:13
A.J34:7
                                 bears 118:14
A.L.J1:12 2:4 3:9 25:15,21
                                 beating 92:16
 33:23 44:10,23 53:23 54:24
                                 beautiful 75:15 125:12 130:24
 55:14 62:20 65:20 69:8 74:3
                                   131:2
 74:15 75:12 82:13 86:24 88:22
                                 becoming 128:9 129:6 155:5
 89:3 90:17 93:12 95:16 99:2
                                 bedtime 119:24
 100:15 109:18 113:13 126:22
                                 beg 42:2
 138:14 141:8 143:18 146:2
                                 began 10:5 23:20 166:6
 147:15 156:15 161:6 165:15
                                 begging 182:4
 168:2 169:9 174:12,14,19
                                 begs 14:10
 177:12 179:5,18 180:5,15
                                 behalf 25:12 34:10 37:21 50:3
 184:14
                                   50:14 62:9 111:7 116:18 178:5
                                 beliefs 106:2
               В
                                 believe 31:15 32:11 34:18 45:14
back 4:4 53:11 58:2 59:10,17
                                   46:2 67:2,19 69:20,22,25
```

93:23 103:11 127:18 139:24 **BOCES** 161:13 140:5,6,8 161:19 163:12 **boots** 162:7 181:12 182:7 born 4:15 121:10 138:24,25 believes 121:2 157:9 170:12,13 178:4 **belt** 130:13 Borrello 100:18 105:12,13 benchmark 20:9 **borrowed** 120:4 borrowers 120:19 benefit 4:2,3 16:5 37:3 42:15 53:2 54:8 74:11 116:20 173:8 bottleneck 68:11 benefited 158:25 **bottom** 6:25 33:13 62:14 152:21 **benefiting** 17:12 20:20 bought 13:20 103:21,21 139:3 benefits 15:24 16:4,7 17:8 Bowman 113:19 122:3,3 **boy** 38:10 69:14 20:14 23:10 35:22 53:4 54:15 89:19 117:23 Boys 146:11 147:10 Benjamin 74:20 79:5,11 branches 119:21 **Bennice** 127:3 **brand** 29:25,25 breathe 7:23 11:24 30:10 32:2 **beseech** 165:2 best 26:6 29:25 30:2 33:6,19 Brian 113:17 116:15 **bridge** 12:19 140:15 44:7 49:13 91:7 92:18,22 182:20 185:5 **brief** 2:18 119:23 **bet** 62:14 Brigham 89:7 Bethlehem 129:18,24 bright 42:4 **better** 75:7 90:10 91:3,6 102:20 bring 25:9 28:23 38:10,12 60:21 132:5 148:25 150:9 159:18 65:4 78:18 141:5 155:23 beyond 15:25 104:25 bringing 56:12 **bid**16:20 brings 37:21 120:23 **big** 58:11 77:24 94:5 122:16 **Britain** 172:18 143:11 159:8 173:4 **British** 171:15 **bigger** 58:23 **broad** 121:18 biggest 87:10 94:16 **broader** 48:22 **bill** 48:21 62:16,17 74:21 80:12 **Brockton** 182:12 106:19 117:21 162:9 **Brooks** 87:16,17 88:9 **billion** 23:20 28:3 31:17 51:19 brought 69:13 79:15 142:24 Brown 34:12 47:7 79:6 82:2,6,9 88:5 122:11,19 123:6 178:23 buckwheat 172:9 **bills** 7:14,24 128:23 154:10 **budget** 12:3 28:16 54:17 94:12 bipartisan 37:11 147:5 **bit**14:14 148:24 159:14 181:5 budgets 114:7 **Buffalo** 4:15 69:12 82:6 86:5 184:4 blackout 23:14 87:14 104:20 122:5 129:18 **blades** 126:17 build11:23 31:20 58:11,20 **blame** 167:18 61:21 78:25 94:22 107:6 **bless** 143:25 122:23 124:8 126:6 bloggers 46:20 building 19:2 63:6 72:2 115:25 **blow** 7:6 122:21 125:2 129:5 146:7 **blueprint** 12:13 15:15 68:17 174:9,11 175:15,22 board 38:6,14 99:14 111:7 **built** 7:23 29:19 96:8 122:22 120:21 121:6 139:8,13 146:10 133:18 161:15 173:24 175:15 156:10 183:7 176:9 **boasts** 140:11 Bulger 66:10 74:4,5,6 **Bob** 90:21 93:13 **bulk** 166:21

```
bulletin 99:14
                                 capacitors 58:10 59:7
Bumpus 161:6,7
                                 capital 17:3 72:22
burden 40:14 108:22,23 116:8
                                 caption 185:3
                                 car 103:21,21 125:3 127:25
 144:10
burn 112:2
                                 carbon 21:22 46:8
burned 59:14
                                 care 6:17 39:15 49:10 95:3
burner 166:4
                                  145:5,6 171:6 182:24
Burnett 165:17,18,19
                                 career 52:24 57:17,20
burning 103:23
                                 careful 133:2,2
bused 104:7
                                 carefully 42:16
buses 104:10
                                 cares 142:17
business 6:12 37:6 42:19 44:6
                                 caring 75:8
 45:21,23 47:21 63:22 64:12
                                 Carl 177:23
 67:12,12,19 69:4 70:19 71:12
                                 Carriage 63:23
 72:16 78:6 80:5,15,20 97:11
                                 cars 169:22,24
 105:23 107:12,13 113:5 121:7
                                 Carson 74:19 77:12
 121:20 134:21 139:3,4,18,20
                                 case 1:7 2:1,5,6,25 3:1,3,16,21
 140:25 145:15,24
                                  4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1
businesses 8:9 10:13 32:7 34:21
                                  11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1
 48:25 53:5 61:7 63:19 71:9
                                  16:25 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1
 74:13 79:20 85:23 88:20
                                  21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1
 108:22 111:11 140:14,19,25
                                  27:1,2,12 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1
 141:4 154:3 163:18 165:9
                                  32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1
businessman 42:7,13,18 79:13
                                  38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1
                                  44:1 45:1,5 46:1 47:1 48:1
busy 171:7
Buttermilk 132:16
                                  49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1
                                  55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1
buy 5:25 9:25 32:9 33:4,7 88:12
 88:20 176:22
                                  61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1
buying 32:8 120:13
                                  67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1
                                  73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1
buzz 106:25
Byczynski 83:4 88:24 89:2,4,6
                                  79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1
byproducts 166:18
                                  85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1
B.P.U172:20
                                  91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1
                                  97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1
               С
                                  102:1 103:1 104:1 105:1 106:1
calculated 42:16
                                  107:1 108:1 109:1 110:1 111:1
calculating 68:23
                                  112:1 113:1 114:1 115:1 116:1
call 4:6,19 8:4 100:16 141:19
                                  117:1 118:1 119:1 120:1 121:1
 156:21 158:13
                                  122:1 123:1 124:1 125:1 126:1
called 34:5 105:19 107:16 158:9
                                  127:1 128:1 129:1 130:1 131:1
calling 2:5 48:3
                                  132:1 133:1 134:1 135:1 136:1
calls 10:4 15:15
                                  137:1 138:1 139:1 140:1 141:1
Camp 75:7
                                  142:1 143:1 144:1 145:1 146:1
Campaign 86:6 116:16
                                  147:1 148:1 149:1 150:1 151:1
campus 91:13,17
                                  152:1 153:1 154:1 155:1 156:1
Canada 51:18,21 74:14 122:15
                                  157:1 158:1 159:1 160:1 161:1
Canadian 122:22
                                  162:1 163:1 164:1 165:1 166:1
cancer 132:19
                                  167:1,12 168:1 169:1 170:1
candidate 42:10
                                  171:1 172:1 173:1 174:1 175:1
capacitor 58:12
                                  176:1 177:1,24 178:1 179:1
```

```
changed 131:16
 180:1 181:1 182:1 183:1 184:1
 184:17 185:1
                                 changes 90:7
cases 23:4 150:9 151:9
                                 changing 112:24 144:14 154:4
cash 53:11 89:19
                                 charge 32:25
casing 150:7
                                 charged 160:21
Cassadaga 45:3 74:23 75:8
                                 Charley 113:19 122:3
catalyst 72:8
                                 chase 139:11
catastrophe 170:16
                                 Chautaugua 7:8 8:11 9:3 10:25
catastrophic 128:12
                                  26:5 27:23 29:7 31:17 33:14
Catherine 5:5
                                  34:19 35:6 42:7,12,21 43:7,9
Cathy 4:21 5:5 91:4 133:22
                                  43:12,17,19 44:5,8 48:9,12,19
 143:25 149:17
                                  49:23 50:12 52:19 54:11 55:10
Cattaraugus 104:22 132:17
                                  57:3 60:6 61:22 62:7 66:14,19
 147:22
                                  66:24 70:25 71:16,22 72:5,13
cause 35:25 55:11 68:6 153:3
                                  72:16,21 73:3,19,20,22,24
 164:5 185:3
                                  75:16 76:15 79:9,19 80:8,10
caused 148:13
                                  81:16 83:13 87:6 90:9 91:11
causes 76:25
                                  91:20,21,25 92:13,19 95:8,20
causing 23:22
                                  104:22 105:13 107:18 108:8,16
caution 131:22 132:25
                                  111:3,8 114:2,5,22 119:22
cautious 134:24
                                  120:15,23 121:10,12,14 127:15
Cayuga 2:8 118:24
                                  134:3 138:22,25 139:2,6,10,15
                                  140:21 141:6,10,13,20 143:14
Census 8:20
center1:10 70:24 122:5
                                  146:11 147:11,22 157:21
                                  158:12,15,18,21 159:6,10,21
Central 1:10
centuries 153:17
                                  160:5,17,19 161:3 165:5
century 40:15, 25 53:14 78:2
                                  168:10 171:18 172:18 173:11
 166:12 177:2
                                  176:13,17,18 177:18 178:8,10
Cerne 4:23 38:3,4 115:21
                                  179:3 182:16
certain 12:5 24:22 102:12
                                 cheap 123:7 148:7
certainly 35:9 78:4 81:21 89:20
                                 cheaper 117:22 119:15 155:5
 159:18 180:24
                                  173:21
certification 80:18
                                 cheaply 117:13
certify 81:11 185:2
                                 checked 76:9
cetera 121:16
                                 checking 75:21
Chadwick 108:5,15 182:16,18
                                 chemically 150:16
chair 50:10
                                 chemicals 150:5
chairman 26:7 34:12 47:7 79:6
                                 chief 104:15
                                 children 6:2 7:18 10:19 38:15
 91:11,12 92:11 95:20 121:5
 138:21 139:12
                                  39:16 40:18,21 41:17,25 63:12
chairs 110:7
                                  71:8 79:15 84:13 86:3 110:20
challenge 21:3
                                  161:10,11,12 162:6,18,22
challenges 108:20
                                  164:9
chamber 87:7 88:11 111:4 138:22
                                 China 123:7 166:25 167:2 173:21
 139:13
                                 choice 17:14 31:14 46:13 53:13
Champ 95:16,17
                                  60:15,17 62:15 149:4,6 155:25
chance 42:4 73:21 85:16 172:3
                                  162:9
 179:13
                                 choices 149:8
                                 choose 25:13 139:8 165:12
chances 104:3
change 73:14 89:23 100:8 115:7
                                  176:22
```

```
choosing 118:19
                                 clearly 3:24 18:16 20:13 141:15
                                  142:16 177:23
Chris 74:17,23
Christian 171:23 172:3,5
                                 climate 52:9,10 90:7 151:8
Christy 55:17 57:14,15
                                 climb 154:15
                                 climbing 152:22 153:22
churches 56:4
circle 183:18
                                 close 57:18 84:24 85:16 87:2
citations 147:23
                                  90:6 100:5 108:24 109:11
citizen 5:20 9:21 48:11,11
                                  112:7,10,23 119:13 129:21
 163:6
                                  134:5,9 152:25 156:5 174:25
citizens 5:24 39:8 55:9 89:24
                                 closed 55:7 71:9 87:20 109:14
 90:9 94:2,3 104:6 116:16
                                  114:8,20 129:25 132:12
 127:15 130:3 143:14 145:13
                                 closely 137:11
 157:21 169:5
                                 Closer 154:21
Citizen's 86:5
                                 closes 48:17 110:10 128:15
city 7:12,20 8:11,12 9:7 10:20
                                 closing 7:16 8:6 10:10 53:12
 15:18 23:16 28:7,14,23 30:3
                                  54:9 55:6 56:4 84:13 104:13
 33:24 34:7,11 36:8,12,14,18
                                  109:9 112:3 116:24 118:23
 36:24 37:17,22 38:5,14,20
                                  119:4 144:8
 39:4 45:24 55:9 56:3,20 58:21
                                 closings 87:22
 63:17 69:19,21,25 70:23 72:14
                                 closure 111:23
 81:3 84:17 87:9 92:14 94:7
                                 closures 128:11
 104:15 108:9 109:4 113:23
                                 Club 22:14,22 29:17 50:11,15
 114:2,5,6,9,14 127:10 129:13
                                  51:4 54:3,4 65:7 78:6 105:23
 129:13,17 130:2,23 134:3,22
                                  146:11 147:10
 140:20,21 144:3,5 145:13
                                 Club's 22:18
 146:6,8 147:12 158:21,22
                                 clutches 58:14
                                 coal 11:14 19:16 20:4 21:14
 164:25 165:2 175:19,23 176:10
 177:7 178:2,5
                                  22:25 29:23 52:5 54:9 60:15
city's 36:20 130:7
                                  65:5 81:5,6,12 103:23 112:2
Ciurczak 44:14 50:9,10
                                  112:14 119:3 125:9 154:18
                                  166:4,4,7,9,11 169:22,24
claim 118:19
claimed 153:5
                                  170:8
claims 19:24 166:16
                                 coalition 47:16
Clairsville 172:22
                                 coal-burning 112:10
clarification 162:4
                                 coal-fired112:3 118:24 167:11
class 94:13
                                 coast137:22 138:7
classic 167:12
                                 coffee 33:25
classrooms 84:23 98:13
                                 cold105:17 181:19
clean 11:19 17:11 19:18 27:6
                                 collapse 35:25
 29:16 42:21 50:19 54:16 60:18
                                 college 71:20 85:17 91:13
 90:7 103:14 107:14,22 113:7
                                  145:17 174:25
 117:3,15 147:22 148:7 150:21
                                 combat 142:21,22
                                 combinations 149:10
 166:18
                                 combined 21:6 28:17 33:3 53:8
cleaner 7:23 11:23 46:12 61:9
 116:22 118:11 119:15 144:15
                                  73:14
 178:16,22
                                 combustion 166:4,18
cleanest 29:19 31:18 86:16
                                 come 4:17 17:17 27:15,21 33:16
                                  41:17 43:8,17 52:18 65:9 70:3
cleaning 176:4
clear 3:11 26:24 31:15 35:23
                                  76:16 79:4,12,21,22,25 80:3
 47:14 53:13 111:18
                                  92:5,10 99:11 104:7,8 107:2
```

```
110:8,20 116:6 127:5,17
                                 communities 53:19 54:20 96:11
 129:17 168:17 172:13 176:24
                                  117:3 141:5
 181:24 183:5,18
                                 community 6:6 7:3,7 8:6 24:21
                                  25:6 36:16 37:11 39:9 41:14
comeback 69:24
comes 35:16 80:20 102:23 107:16
                                  42:2 43:3,21 45:9,11,13 46:18
 117:10 163:18,21 171:21
                                  47:21,22,22 51:12 53:5 61:15
coming 7:2 26:5 33:13 63:3,4
                                  62:2 65:18 69:19 71:20 74:12
 72:6 74:9 78:23 79:7 91:14
                                  75:3,4,5 84:14 85:20,22 86:21
 105:15 118:20 133:4,7,8,22
                                  88:17 89:18 94:5 95:4 96:7
 139:15 166:24 181:4
                                  97:4,24,25 100:11 101:5,9
commenced 2:2
                                  102:25 104:11 105:10 116:25
commend 168:13
                                  120:25 121:3,20 133:4,7
                                  139:19,21 142:12,14,17 144:10
comment 34:14 82:20 109:9
comments 3:11 4:11 25:23 29:18
                                  145:18,20,21 146:14,16,21
 53:21 54:5 60:2 65:25,25
                                  161:20 163:3 176:8,22 182:8
                                  183:22
 117:6 174:22 176:24 179:14
 180:19
                                 community's 60:10
Commerce 111:4 138:22
                                 community-based 119:19
commercial 124:12,12,12 183:12
                                 companies 10:10 32:23 88:13
Commission 1:2,4 2:17,24 3:19
                                  98:16 160:12 169:16
 5:19 13:14 14:7,17 19:7 24:9
                                 company 13:19,21 14:11 33:7
 27:25 28:11 29:11 31:15 34:12
                                  35:21 57:18 70:16,18 75:4
 34:17 35:2,9,15 36:25 47:7
                                  78:2 100:11 103:6 105:8
 49:15 50:7 52:4 55:5 58:5,17
                                  142:12,16 158:17 159:5 162:14
                                  169:18 171:7,15
 59:18 64:22 66:14 67:13 68:4
 77:4 82:8 86:19 90:6 99:25
                                 compared 19:23 20:2 118:10
 100:25 104:14 107:4 110:25
                                 comparison 16:21 29:23
 124:3 130:15 142:19,25 144:14
                                 compelling 14:15
 144:20 147:9 168:14,25 179:19
                                 compete 85:17
 180:14 181:8
                                 competing 13:12
commissioned 30:20
                                 competition 129:21
Commissioner 1:15 2:16,18,20
                                 competitive 67:15 106:13,14
 3:10,19 4:14 5:14 26:4,8 70:8
                                  107:10 154:7 155:5
 100:24
                                 competitiveness 12:10
                                 compiled 14:14
commissioners 101:24 104:23
Commission's 3:13 15:4,10 24:19
                                 complete 24:17 177:5
 26:18 34:20 37:4
                                 completely 69:17 109:13
commit 16:19 88:13
                                 Completion 18:10
commitment 88:16 160:11
                                 complicated 3:3 163:4
commitments 82:17
                                 component 35:5 37:15 88:6
Committee 105:15 168:21
                                 components 163:15 169:21
committing 167:13
                                 concern 5:20 52:16 75:17,18
                                  115:9 131:7 132:3 133:25
commodity 153:2
common 162:24
                                  144:7
                                 concerned 10:9 61:14 132:6
commonly 35:3 148:18
communicate 151:3
                                  138:11 169:4
communicated 60:24
                                 concerns 23:6 45:7 49:25 87:3
communications 70:12,14,20
                                 concessions 182:11
 72:17 116:16
                                 conclude 167:24
Communist 105:18
                                 conclusion 33:17 83:25
```

condition 24:4	context 157:3,7
conductor 57:22,23,24 58:17,18	continually 155:18
conductors 58:23	continuation 73:13 88:7 90:14
conference 47:13,15 61:5 95:21	continue 6:6,11 37:13 40:6 46:7
conferring 26:8	61:3 82:21 86:7 92:4 94:6
confess 177:20	106:20 111:20 121:19 139:10
confidence 14:22	153:23 160:13 184:11
confirming 26:9	continued 12:17 60:11 72:9
confusing 161:21	160:11 183:4
Congressional 50:5	continues 40:4 57:2 108:19
congressman 46:24,25 47:6 50:6	146:18
143:5	continuous 71:6
congressmen 104:18	continuously 88:11
Coniglio 90:22 93:15	contract 32:11,12,15
connect 13:7 19:14 24:2 136:19	contracts 32:7 51:14 182:10
connected 24:13	contrast 17:5 19:18
connects 21:11	contribute 13:3
conscious 84:4 145:7	contributed 69:3
consequence 32:23	contributing 36:19 52:9
consequences 7:15 8:15 32:22	contributions 56:22
73:9	contributor 35:8 109:2
Conservation 22:7	control 24:3 28:18 45:18 49:4
conservative 47:25	111:22 132:4 182:20
conservatives 101:17	controls 30:2
consider 24:22 39:17 77:5 80:15	convenient 34:15
109:13 160:23 164:23 165:3	convening 34:18
175:15 183:8,24	conventional 149:13 153:7
considerable 70:22	conversations 81:3
consideration 14:19 22:6 54:22	conversion 35:3 73:14 112:13
75:21 149:2	convert 22:24 148:21
considered 15:12 29:11 34:23	converted 152:15
75:19 155:7	converting 52:5 54:15 148:15
considering 69:2	152:12
consisting 185:4	convey 157:14 convince 155:16
consolidation 182:13 constituents 50:4 178:6	convinced 130:21
construction 6:9 7:21 15:21	cooling 135:10,14 166:17
28:4 35:17	cooperated 144:13
consultant 30:14	copy 124:3
Consultants 30:14	core 85:9 106:2
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
<pre>consumer 153:20 consumers 11:24 16:24 37:7</pre>	Cornell 177:16,17,18
51:14	corner 167:5,6
	Corporation 108:5
consumption 60:14 134:17 151:25 contact 47:6	corporations 155:12 corrections 145:11
contact 47:6	corrections 145:11
contained 179:22 contaminated 151:2	cost 12:7 16:9,11,13 17:6,18
contaminated 151:2 contamination 148:12 150:10	18:17,21 19:3 30:11 33:3 39:2
166:7	42:15 106:8 116:22 153:12
/	¬∠•⊥∪ ±∪∪•∪ ±±∪•∠∠ ±∪⊃•±∠

```
couple 64:16 101:19 146:22
 164:21 166:7 167:7,9,10
costly 52:11
                                 coupled 166:3
costs 11:24 16:6,17 17:8 19:4,9
                                 course 80:19 118:12,16
 23:18 40:6 53:5 58:21 67:21
                                 courses 85:7,15
 68:10,25 69:5 112:17 124:16
                                 court 55:12
 153:21 156:2 166:13 172:23
                                 covered 110:17
 173:4
                                 co-founder 60:5
cost-effective 6:11 31:6,12
                                 create 13:6 21:25 36:23 43:2
 32:9 51:16 60:7
                                  53:17 58:19,19 59:5 61:18
Council 78:6 91:13 105:23
                                  82:8 86:16 98:16 113:9 117:15
 133:25 144:5
                                 created 51:8,24 61:16 86:14
councils 81:22
                                  92:19 122:17 176:3
counter 152:3
                                 creating 53:6 61:2 183:5
counties 50:13 98:5 104:22
                                 creation 98:12
countries 151:20
                                 Creek 108:2 132:17,17 141:22
country 9:5 33:9 49:11 60:21
                                  178:9
 71:9 96:12,13,18 128:5 151:18
                                 crept 166:6
 170:16 171:17,20 172:13
                                 crime 129:10 164:17
 173:17,19
                                 crippling 36:13
countryside 149:24
                                 crisis 162:21 166:5,14 167:21
county 2:21 8:11,15 9:3 10:25
                                 criteria 106:9
 26:5,6 27:23,24 28:8 29:8
                                 critical 26:21 27:22 35:5 37:10
 31:17 33:14 34:19 35:6 36:9
                                  53:11 73:10 79:20 96:24 109:2
 37:18 42:7,10,12,21 43:7,12
                                  109:8 178:12,13
 43:17,19,23 44:5,8 45:5,17
                                 critically 139:18
 47:20 48:9,12,19 49:23 50:12
                                 Cropplus 60:5
                                 cross 101:4 142:6
 52:19 54:11 55:10 56:21 57:3
 60:6 61:23 62:8 63:17 64:12
                                 crossroads 117:7
 66:15,19,24 69:21 70:2,22,25
                                 crowd 184:2,2,3,5
 71:16 72:5,10,13,17,21 73:3
                                 crumble 97:8
 73:19,20,23,24 74:7,25 75:6
                                 crushed 130:9
 75:16 76:15 77:15 79:9,19
                                 culture 71:15
 80:8,11,12 81:16 83:13,19
                                 Cummings 154:23
 87:7 88:17 90:10,15 91:12,20
                                 Cuomo 12:4 26:22 56:10 90:13
 91:21,25 92:13,20 95:8,20
                                  91:17 159:16 160:21,25
 98:4 101:9 104:16 105:13
                                 Cuomo's 15:14 109:12 159:24
 107:2,18,20 108:8,16 111:3,9
                                 cup 182:4
 114:2,5,9,14,22 119:22,22
                                 current 9:22 11:7 68:7 139:21
 120:15,24 121:10,13,14 127:16
                                  146:10 156:18
 134:4,20 138:22,25 139:2,6,10
                                 currently 8:14 22:5 89:14 91:12
 139:13,15 140:22 141:6,10,13
                                  107:16 182:13
 141:20,24 143:4,14 145:13
                                 curtailed 53:21
 146:12 147:11 156:18 157:6,6
                                 customers 67:7 119:25 120:3,11
 157:7,21 158:12,15,18,21
                                  120:14 143:13
 159:6,10,21 160:5,17,19 161:3
                                 cut 40:8,10 84:19,23 85:3 94:8
 164:25 165:6 168:10 171:19
                                  94:15,24
 172:18 173:11 176:13,17,19
                                 cuts 7:11 10:21 36:12 84:22
 177:18 178:9,10 179:3
                                  85:8,10,21,24 94:11 115:23
countywide 9:9 35:25
                                  116:7
county's 7:9 43:10 69:23 178:12
                                 cutting 11:2
```

```
Cyburt 90:23 93:16,17
                                   121:24 143:11 156:3,25 163:2
                                   176:19 177:5 179:17,19,20
cycle 21:6 60:12 73:15
C.C.E 116:17,19
                                   182:22
C.E.O111:3 119:18
                                 decisions 14:11 34:17 127:14
C.S.E.A40:9 109:23
                                   141:2 157:16 171:18 172:18
C0219:20,23 21:14 22:16 119:7
                                  decision-making 14:20
                                 Declaration 171:24
               D
                                 decline 43:18 71:6 89:12
dad 133:18
                                  declining 40:6
daily 41:19
                                  decommissioned 112:22
Daly 74:21 80:7,12
                                  decorate 129:8
damaged 109:15
                                  decoupled 32:21
damaging 60:15
                                  decrease 41:9 94:12 178:19
Dan 66:9 74:3 119:18
                                  decreased 39:25
Dando 55:20 62:20,21,21
                                  decreases 112:16
danger 8:5 85:4
                                  deemed 148:11
dangerous 52:8,11 86:8 151:23
                                  deep 7:11 10:21
Daniel 113:18
                                  deepest 5:18
dark 23:15 150:24
                                  defeat 21:23
data 21:12 35:10 161:21 163:10
                                  defend 145:20
date 3:15
                                  defining 111:18
dated 17:25
                                  degree 80:17
daughter 23:17
                                  degreed 54:6
daughters 98:8
                                  delay 26:13 141:2
daughter's 121:8
                                  delegate 69:15
David 44:12,17,25
                                 deliberation 3:20
Davis 80:24
                                  deliberations 143:9
day 32:3 48:7 70:2 75:8 99:12
                                  deliver 102:18,20
 130:10 159:23
                                  delivering 77:8
days 67:7 103:19,24 154:22
                                  delivery 42:23 61:9 106:8
deal 65:13
                                 demand 21:7 27:7 43:13 52:8
dealing 10:4 120:9
                                   67:8 68:18 112:14,16 140:7
deals 75:18
                                   152:16
Dean 60:23 82:18
                                  democratic 42:10
dear 127:22
                                  democrats 47:24 101:17
deaths 124:14,17 132:19
                                  demolished 129:7
debate 122:7 141:14 183:16
                                  demonstrates 34:19
debilitating 72:6
                                  demonstration 18:20 184:7
decade 142:13
                                 Dennis 158:9,17
decades 117:9 136:20 149:15
                                 densities 19:21
 153:18 158:15 167:16 179:9
                                  deny 68:24
decent 162:17
                                  department 2:14 22:6 28:16 79:6
decide 13:14 46:19 100:3,11
                                   89:15 127:11
 147:9 156:9 159:3
                                  departments 85:9
decided 146:7
                                  depend 11:14 23:12 97:22
decides 94:21
                                  dependence 18:11
decimates 10:18
                                 dependency 124:19 164:14
decision 5:23 35:14 36:25 47:17
                                  dependent 43:4 68:3 78:12
 49:16 73:7 83:21 86:22 87:10
                                  depends 25:10
 92:17,18 109:10 110:16 111:15
                                  depletion 153:6
```

```
173:13,15
depressed 164:25
                                 difficult 3:4 48:8 116:6 177:4
deprived 48:24 49:6,7,8
deputies 5:12
                                 difficulties 98:18
deputy 101:13
                                 digested 83:22
deregulated 14:3
                                 digit 72:18
                                 dime 17:22
deregulation 67:4,10
described 18:11 20:2
                                 dioxide 20:16 21:16
deserve 6:2 7:19 10:20,23 11:5
                                 direct 35:18 47:6 159:24 181:23
 39:16 105:6,7 142:22
                                 direction 31:20 175:12
designed 42:23
                                 directly 18:13 19:14 25:3 34:16
                                   47:17 48:12 53:11 143:11
desirable 163:13
desire 34:20 88:4 162:25
desires 160:6
                                 director 46:24 80:10,11 87:6
despair 10:6
                                   108:4 111:5 116:16 122:4
desperately 116:11
                                   142:5
                                 directors 111:8 120:21 139:14
desperation 167:4
despite 107:15 117:17 155:4
                                 dirtier 178:24
destabilization 151:9
                                 dirtiest 151:8
destination 177:3
                                 dirty11:14 19:16 22:15 52:6,6
                                   107:16 118:13,20
destiny 24:3 49:4
destroyed 142:2 145:21
                                 disabled 121:16
destructive 166:7
                                 disagree 13:16 170:20 172:7
determination 30:15
                                 disappointment 94:16
determine 106:10
                                 disaster 9:11 141:19,23 142:14
                                 disasters 141:22 142:9
determined 13:10
devastate 129:3
                                 disclosure 42:9 141:11
devastating 7:6 36:4 84:17
                                 disconnected 162:10
 114:13 115:8 140:20
                                 discussion 167:17 180:7,9
develop 27:6 108:11 160:14
                                 discussions 104:17 155:7
 177:2
                                 disingenuous 106:6,22
developed 78:16 96:8 150:2
                                 dismantle 97:16
 175:24
                                 dismantled 96:12 97:8
                                 dismantling 170:17
developer's 80:19
developing 31:18
                                 disregard 46:19 54:5
development 12:9,18 13:5 31:10
                                 disrepair 96:19
 32:19 46:11 52:20 60:16 71:12
                                 disruption 36:22 52:9,10
 80:12,14,18 81:22 87:6 96:3
                                 dissolving 98:17
 97:14 105:15 108:5,11 116:21
                                 distant 164:21
 118:5,7 123:16,23 176:2,4,5
                                 distinct 96:8 156:19
 176:14,15 181:10
                                 distinguished 130:16
devote 6:7
                                 distribute 58:15 100:3
diameter 57:23
                                 distribution 14:4 58:3 151:6
Diane 44:14 50:10 55:18 59:25
                                 district 5:6 25:12 29:6 36:9
 122:18
                                   37:18 38:5,14,21 39:12,13
dias 4:5
                                   46:23 48:19 49:23 50:5 72:15
                                   84:20 109:5 115:8,22,23
dictating 14:12
DIETZAN 113:21
                                   116:11 140:21 158:22 182:16
Dietzen 113:15,22
                                 districts 8:12 85:2
difference 9:18 165:11 167:9
                                 district's 39:23
different 31:19 149:9 156:3
                                 DiTonto 66:8 70:7,10
```

```
diversified 71:23
                                  166:19
diversify 117:11
                                 drill 132:9,11 136:16
diversity 162:24
                                 drilled 153:10
divided 99:25
                                 drilling 136:25
dividends 121:2
                                 drinking 86:8 134:15 136:14
                                 drive 127:25 129:17 140:25
divine 16:4
doable 50:20
                                 driven 97:11
docket 3:14 60:4
                                 drives 88:9
doctors 151:2,4
                                 driving 104:9
documents 3:15
                                 drop 153:23
doing 56:13 59:15 64:3 101:7
                                 dropped 56:5 154:5
 142:23 160:22 182:4,19 184:6
                                 drove 29:5 87:18
Dolce 4:23 33:24,25 34:4,7
                                 dubious 151:7
 135:9,12 136:7,14,18,24 137:3
                                 due 41:8 68:8 89:25 98:7 112:4
 137:13,16,18 138:2
                                  117:25 152:6 166:12
dollar8:7 16:22 39:3 62:14
                                 dues 65:7
 81:13 103:14 159:7 178:23
                                 dug 107:19
dollars 8:14,22 9:14,17,23
                                 dump 123:7
 16:10,13,14 17:7,9,21 19:3
                                 dumped 123:6,8 150:17
 23:20 28:3 31:17 35:22 39:5,6
                                 dumping 151:12 167:12
 39:7,19,24 40:2,17,25 41:7,11
                                 Dunkirk 2:8,11 6:21 7:8 8:11,12
 41:13 51:2,19 61:18,19 72:22
                                  8:17 9:13,21 10:11,21 11:20
 72:24 80:22 81:10 82:2 84:16
                                  12:15,20 14:8 15:2,19,25
 88:3,5 120:5,6,8,12,17 121:12
                                  17:10 18:16 19:5,19,23 20:12
 122:19 123:6 159:2 174:5
                                  20:22,23 21:4 22:9 23:2 25:4
domestic 153:5
                                  25:8 27:23 28:3,8,14,24,24
domino 95:10
                                  31:4 33:24 34:7,24 35:5 37:3
Don 127:4
                                  37:17,22 38:5,14,16,20 39:4,6
Donado 55:20
                                  42:3,15,24,25 43:14 45:9,12
door 33:8
                                  45:24 46:10 47:3,9 48:9,11,13
doors 100:5 129:22
                                  48:18,19 49:22,22 50:2,8
Doreen 161:6
                                  54:11 55:3,9,23 56:9 58:21
Dorothy 156:7
                                  63:15,17,20,25 64:6,23 67:3
double 20:10 72:18
                                  67:25 68:7,25 69:6,10 70:18
doubled 173:25
                                  71:2,3 72:7,12,15,15,19 73:10
                                  74:10 75:10 76:20 77:17 79:2
doubling 174:6
                                  81:4 82:9 84:9,9,14,17 85:6
doubt 30:25 163:23
Doug 95:16
                                  86:18,21 87:11,14,17 89:7,11
downed 76:25
                                  89:11 90:9 92:14 93:21,24
downstate 12:16 13:8 15:22
                                  94:2,3,7,10 95:13,14 97:8,20
 68:11,18 78:17
                                  100:6,7 101:2,22 104:7,15,15
downstream 165:20
                                  106:8,21 108:9,14,14,15,16,17
downtown 125:12 184:4
                                  109:4,23 111:14,16,23 112:23
dozen 89:13
                                  113:10,23,24 114:2,5,11,20,21
dramatic 20:13 112:17
                                  115:2,3,4,10 117:7 118:23
dramatically 19:22
                                  119:12,20 120:2,4,9 125:9,9
drastically 89:22
                                  125:12 126:6,8 127:10,12,15
                                  130:10,12,21 131:6 133:10,16
draughts 52:13
drawn 78:7,8 157:12
                                  134:3,15,18 136:15,25 139:9
dream 80:20 127:25,25 139:7,11
                                  139:17 140:20,21 141:4 144:4
```

```
144:4 146:6,8 147:12 148:4,16
                                  164:6,7,9
 148:25 152:2,12 155:8,17
                                 educational 41:19 179:20
 157:24 158:22 159:2,8 161:9
                                 Edwards 143:5 156:16,17,17
 161:13 162:2 163:13 165:2,5
                                 effect 36:13 84:12 95:10 97:23
                                  118:25 134:25 135:6 164:3
 165:12 168:23 170:7 175:5,6,8
                                 effective 17:6 50:25 116:22
 175:15,25 176:8,10,13,16,23
 176:24,25 177:6 178:5,8,9
                                 effectively 23:9 51:7
 179:3
                                 effects 98:5
Dunkirk's 8:18 18:12 69:23
                                 efficiency 50:19 53:4 61:16
 87:18 88:9 175:7 176:19,19
                                  116:21 118:4 155:23
                                 efficient 19:18 29:24 31:7,11
Dunkirk/Fredonia 66:15,19
 126:19
                                  31:18 32:9,15 60:9 78:25 79:2
                                  79:3 86:16 165:7
duration 4:11
duty 160:22
                                 effort 82:12 120:22 121:4,23
dwarf 61:17
                                  159:11
dwindled 130:3
                                 efforts 29:4
dynamics 95:25 98:6
                                 eaas 128:8
                                 eight 8:14,22,23 18:5 23:15,19
D.F.T 70:12,14,20 72:17,20
                                  122:11 124:8 130:7 181:18
               E
                                 eighteen 36:20 50:4
earlier 26:11 30:13 104:5
                                 eighth 9:4
 122:18 124:2 153:9 156:22
                                 eighty 4:7 33:12 65:23 70:21
early 129:20
                                  116:19 135:17
earnings 97:5
                                 eighty-six 39:5
earth 170:18
                                 eighty-three 20:18
earthquake 132:21
                                 either 148:19 173:2
easier 128:21
                                 either/or158:8
eat 162:6
                                 elaborate 148:24
economic 12:8 23:18 24:21 27:9
                                 elderly 121:16 144:10
 31:10 32:18 35:17,25 36:19
                                 elders 110:6,18,22
 37:3 52:20 70:25 72:8 80:11
                                 elected 179:10
 80:14,18 81:22 84:20 87:18
                                 election 171:4
 88:10 105:14 108:11,20 140:6
                                 electives 94:8,14
 141:5 151:11 167:12 181:9,9
                                 electric 12:9 37:5 42:14 67:8
 181:10
                                  111:12 154:10 172:23 175:14
economically 164:24
                                  175:17
economics 3:3 45:9 57:5 104:25
                                 electrical 11:25 24:12 32:21
 112:15,25 183:8
                                  42:22,22 54:5 75:25 76:20
economies 44:7 52:25 53:11,18
                                  124:5,25 165:20
economy 6:13 7:24 10:9,15 12:7
                                 electricity 7:14,23 13:2 32:25
 14:9 17:12 20:20 24:15 31:3,5
                                  33:4,4 43:13 46:8 50:21 51:22
 35:8 36:3 43:9,10 45:16 52:14
                                  57:22 102:17 106:16 107:9
 52:22 54:13 61:22 71:23 72:24
                                  112:16 125:4,19 165:23 173:14
 79:17,19 86:2 95:7,11 109:8
                                  175:10 183:5,17,20
 109:15 117:4 128:7,25 139:24
                                 electronically 27:20
 140:11,18 159:21 178:12,17,20
                                 elementary 40:17,22
 179:4
                                 eleven 4:13 18:7 33:15 57:19
education 6:3 7:19 10:20 38:7
                                  65:22 119:21 174:15 177:10
 41:18 45:22 47:22 71:19 96:14
                                  184:15
 98:13 110:21 162:17 163:9
                                 eliminate 18:11 19:5 39:11
```

```
108:25
                                  125:10,20 126:12,16,17 131:18
eliminated 10:23 13:24
                                  131:19 137:24 138:5 140:4,9
eliminating 39:12
                                  140:12,12,16 153:12,14,15,23
elimination 8:13 36:2 42:25
                                  155:20 178:17,22
Ellen 66:8 70:10
                                 engaged 32:24
eloquent 44:20 91:3
                                 engine 36:19 87:19 88:10
email 82:21 148:3
                                 engineer 54:5 165:20
embrace 62:3
                                 engineering 69:12 97:14
emerged 72:3
                                 England 77:17
emission 19:25
                                 English 41:17 85:9,11 115:12
emissions 19:23 20:6,11,11,15
                                 enhance 27:9
 21:14 22:16 73:15 166:3
                                 enhancing 178:19
 178:19
                                 enjoy127:19 162:25
emitting 46:8
                                 enjoyed 63:9
emotional 41:20
                                 enormous 10:11 16:24 36:19
                                  114:6
Empire 1:13
employ 62:13
                                 enrichment 40:20
employed 102:5 126:19 127:24
                                 Enser 146:2,3,5
employee 57:15 62:8 74:7 77:15
                                 ensure 11:25 24:10 37:5 66:3
 83:10 127:19,21
                                   67:4,13 72:10
employees 10:22 36:2 62:9 81:16
                                 entails 163:11
 86:13 98:14 170:3
                                 enter 32:7 83:13 143:8
employer 70:12 81:15
                                 entered 60:3
                                 entire 9:5 19:21 27:23 28:15,16
employers 13:22
                                  36:21 37:18 124:5 167:14
employment 35:19 83:17 89:15
 128:17 139:21
                                  176:8
empty 129:8
                                 entirely 20:9 123:3
enabling 165:6
                                 entrepreneurship 71:25
enacted 26:17 27:4
                                 environment12:7 17:19 27:10
encourage 13:4 83:24
                                  80:4 86:6 116:17 117:24
encouraging 71:25
                                  118:15 145:9 178:14,18
                                 environmental 20:14 21:18 22:7
ended 26:15
endorse 120:22 121:4
                                  23:5 30:2,4 31:22 32:2 43:6
                                  53:19 88:3 101:19 112:5
ends 128:6
energies 165:8
                                  147:21 150:3,21 155:20 156:2
energy 6:11 11:10,24 12:12,18
                                 environmentalists 22:2
 12:22,25 13:10 15:14 17:11,13
                                 environmentally13:3 133:20
                                  134:11,25 135:7
 17:13 20:20 21:24 22:3,20,21
 22:24 27:6 37:15,16 42:22
                                 envision 85:8
 45:19 46:12 49:4,8,10,11,17
                                 envy 127:13
                                 equals 73:19
 49:17,19 50:10,19,22,25 51:8
 51:13,16 52:2,22 53:2,4,9,13
                                 equates 84:18
 54:16 60:9,16,18,20 61:16,22
                                 equipment 28:19
 62:3 65:15 67:15 68:17 78:2
                                 equipped 75:25
 78:15 79:23 92:8 95:20 96:14
                                 equity 17:2
 96:14 97:23 106:24,25 107:5
                                 equivalent 28:15
 107:12,22 111:17,19,20 112:25
                                 era's 88:9
 113:3,6,8 116:21,21 117:3,7
                                 Erie 47:12 87:14 119:22 125:13
 117:11,12,14,16,22 118:5,6,11
                                  132:17 134:17 135:2,7,10
                                  137:10 138:12 166:17 175:8
 122:8,8 123:24 124:6,19 125:6
```

```
excuse 120:6,18
escalate 40:7
                                 executive 42:11 108:4 111:4
escalating 36:7
escaping 136:11
                                   141:13 143:4 156:18
especially 5:13 11:12 20:24
                                  exempt 150:20
 24:15 39:13 91:21 92:13 115:9
                                 exhausted 166:9
 134:11 135:3 168:16
                                  exist 52:17
essential 7:12,20 10:21 69:18
                                 existing 7:20 11:21 20:3,5 22:9
 139:20
                                   22:24 43:10 49:12 80:20
established 12:5
                                   136:19 175:17,21 176:3
establishments 124:13
                                 exists 96:6 137:4 144:22
estate 120:12
                                  exodus 87:21
estimated 23:19 27:14 28:4
                                  expand 43:11 155:15
 112:19
                                  expanded 122:7
estimation 18:21
                                 expansion 7:24 50:24 80:16
et 121:16
                                   159:20
evaluated 27:12
                                 expect 41:7 56:21 130:19 152:24
evaluating 12:6 77:6 169:2
                                   171:5
                                  expected 181:25
evaluation 26:19
evening 5:4 37:9 38:3 42:5
                                  expecting 121:8
 44:19 45:4 46:2 50:9 55:21
                                  expedite 68:15
 56:2 57:11,14 59:24 70:7
                                 expenditures 18:22
 77:11 80:7 83:6 84:11,12 89:4
                                  expense 16:24
 107:25 110:25 116:14 119:17
                                  expenses 17:20 161:24
 127:8 138:20 141:9 147:20
                                  expensive 60:11 64:17 118:4
 156:23,25 157:8 161:22 165:18
                                   122:22 123:8,9 124:18 153:25
 168:7 169:12 179:7,15 182:3
                                   155:25
 182:17 184:16
                                  experience 67:9
event 128:12 157:12 158:3
                                  experienced 157:18
 159:15,17,25
                                 expire 56:25
events 52:12 157:5
                                 expiring 56:18
eventually 149:14 166:20
                                 explain 95:25
everybody 38:19 59:22 66:17,20
                                  exploding 9:7
 82:10 91:8 103:15 105:12
                                  explore 163:25
 122:24 124:21,22 174:16,21
                                  explosions 151:12
everybody's 125:17 174:24
                                 Expo 95:21
everyday 133:3 139:5
                                  exporter 119:11
everyone's 145:10
                                 exporting 11:16 71:7 131:18
ever-increasing 108:21
                                   152:18
evidence 18:20
                                 exports 166:22
evolved 70:16
                                 express 169:13
exactlv 58:10 144:20
                                  expressing 108:6
examine 1:4 155:22
                                  extend 5:18 16:7 57:4
example 72:22 163:16 181:6
                                 extended 92:11
exceed 17:20
                                 extensively 81:2
exceeding 17:8
                                 extent 2:24 102:12
exceeds 24:24
                                 external 23:9
excellent 159:17
                                 externalized 166:13
exceptional 71:18
                                 extra 120:11
exchange 180:20,25
                                 extracted 118:14
                                  extraction 60:13,16 118:13
exclusive 78:10,19
```

```
148:9 151:6,24 152:2 166:8
                                 fantasies 166:19
extraordinarily 27:13
                                 fantasy 166:11,15
extreme 52:11 130:3
                                 far 8:10 15:25 32:25 55:6 77:8
                                   106:4 132:10 153:25
extremely 29:24 97:3 149:25
 173:2
                                 farmers 51:11,21
E.M.S129:12
                                 farms 52:14 124:9,12 126:6,18
E.P.A112:21 134:13 137:15
                                 Farther 182:14
E.R.S 40:5
                                 fast 30:23
                                 fast-start 78:8
                                 fate 43:9
face 36:12 108:19 162:12
                                 father 79:13 129:22 177:23
faced 130:3
                                 fathers 6:3
faces 41:14 143:6,10
                                 Faulkner/Warren 18:6 19:12
facilitate 52:24
                                 fault 132:21
facilities 31:12 112:2,6,10
                                 favor 6:20 54:6 61:25 84:2
facility 20:3,5 23:2 29:25 30:9
                                   101:22 147:9 157:23 170:6
 34:9,24 35:4,19,24 36:18
                                 favors 22:14
 37:15 45:10,15,18 46:11 47:4
                                 fax 82:18
 47:9,13 48:4,16 50:8 63:3
                                 fear 163:3
 78:9 83:19 98:11 111:14
                                 fears 162:13
 112:23 113:10 117:18 139:18
                                 February 22:22
 140:12,18 141:4 174:25 175:14
                                 federal 41:8 47:19 119:6,8
 175:16,20
                                   133:24 134:13
facing 155:18
                                 feed 50:22
fact 8:19 11:18 21:22 26:20
                                 feed-in 51:5, 10, 17 122:17 123:3
 27:14 46:3 64:4 78:11 80:17
                                   123:11,15
 117:18 119:7 149:20 177:21
                                 feel 82:15 92:23 101:7 167:15
factories 89:13
                                   170:15 176:15
factors 3:4 24:22
                                 feelings 55:6 104:25 105:2
facts 34:22 83:22 84:2 91:3
                                   169:14
 163:3,7 179:22 182:6
                                 feels 29:7
fails 24:14,16 117:11
                                 fees 22:17
failure 140:17 150:7 178:22
                                 feet 103:18 162:8 174:2,3
failures 76:23 77:2
                                 fell 130:6
fair 67:18 72:25
                                 felt103:6 104:8
faith 28:20
                                 fewer 178:24
Falconer 169:17 172:20 174:8
                                 field 63:7 67:20
falling 156:11
                                 fifteen 65:23 70:17 103:12
fallout 89:24 132:6
                                   109:24 116:2 126:5 174:2,11
falls 15:3 21:8
                                 fifth 181:2
false 148:20 149:6
                                 fifty 9:13 23:14 39:3 80:22
familiar 81:23 138:2
                                   82:3 87:11 124:9 141:25 142:2
families 6:4,15 11:9 36:5 48:2
                                   154:6 159:2
 52:11 53:5 85:20 86:3,20 97:6
                                 fifty-eight 10:18 39:11,13
 108:25 128:2,22 130:24 162:16
                                   84:19 85:3,24 86:11 94:24,25
 163:2 164:19
                                   95:4 120:8 125:20
family 4:15 64:21 74:11 82:17
                                 Fifty-seventh 5:6
 121:7 176:23
                                 fifty-six 16:12 171:25 172:4
Family's 62:22
                                 fifty-three 172:2,4
famous 40:3
                                 fight 81:18 128:5 166:23 168:20
```

```
fighting 25:11 30:22,23 73:21
                                 focused 115:15,16
 81:18
                                 foggy 59:11
filed 3:15 16:11
                                 fold 160:4
                                 folks 4:3 9:19 65:21 80:9 82:12
filter 134:15
final 12:3 159:14
                                   82:15 121:16
financial 40:14 93:25 94:6
                                 follow 15:9 21:7 78:14
 128:8 142:3 147:2
                                 followed 45:17 87:21
financially 8:20 146:20
                                 following 133:19
financing 51:25
                                 follows 44:11 148:22
find 84:2 116:5 121:17 128:16
                                 food 9:25 102:14
                                 foolish 103:20
 128:23
fine 98:15 100:13
                                 foot 117:21
                                 force 40:9 57:2 116:3 142:21
fines 173:22
fire 7:12 10:22 28:16 45:20
                                   170:25
 104:15
                                 forced 9:25 10:17 28:12 112:23
firefighters 101:13 129:12
                                   128:16,23 129:4,21 167:3
 141:25
                                 forces 118:23,25 126:13
firemen 6:5
                                 forcing 23:22
fires 23:22
                                 foregoing 49:25 185:3,4
first 4:6,20,24,25 27:18 29:16
                                 foregone 48:14
 34:11 44:17 63:4 66:13 74:8
                                 foreign 13:19,19 85:11 129:21
 75:24 80:25 81:25 88:24 99:12
                                   171:17
 100:22 103:3,19,21 131:25
                                 forever 73:7 77:22 126:20
 133:21 138:23 168:13 176:25
                                 forfeit 96:2
 179:18 181:20 183:12
                                 forget 81:8 107:13
fiscal 36:17
                                 forgiving 90:25
fit 51:6,7,15 122:17 172:14
                                 forgotten 91:23
five 4:6,20,24 7:21 9:23 11:22
                                 form 22:19,20 120:24 148:15
 16:14,22 18:4,4,6 19:11 28:4
                                 formal 14:17
 35:22 39:6,7,21 40:7,16 41:9
                                 formations 150:12
 41:11 44:11 55:14 61:20 66:5
                                 former 39:20 91:10,11 95:19
 72:21 74:15 80:22 82:3,14,22
                                 formerly 181:4
 86:13 89:21 90:17 97:16,18
                                 forth 29:10 65:9 107:3
 100:16 102:6 113:13 116:2
                                 Fortunately 64:2
 119:21 122:19 123:5 124:9,10
                                 forty 8:7 62:25 63:21 91:22
 124:11 125:24 126:22 127:5
                                   152:19
 138:14 146:12 154:6,25 159:7
                                 forty-five 170:24 178:6
 173:6 174:5
                                 forty-four 120:5,6
five-minute 60:3
                                 forty-nine 8:22
fix 182:25
                                 forty-one 58:7
fixed 5:24 9:24 114:18 144:11
                                 forty-seven 9:7 62:16
 145:4,5 161:16
                                 forty-three 39:6
flaw 21:19 23:7
                                 forty-two 9:8 28:13 38:25 58:8
                                   92:6 94:23 123:19 126:2
fleets 152:15
flexible 173:7
                                 forum 34:15 37:25 179:21
                                 forward 3:8 31:2,16 42:13 90:3
flooding 52:12 141:22
floor 27:18,19 29:9 99:13
                                   120:22 121:24 176:2,25 177:7
flows 119:10
                                   177:8 184:12
                                 fossil 46:4 54:15 60:11 86:8
fluff 85:5,6
fluid150:11
                                   117:9 124:20 151:8 153:25
```

G

```
154:13,14 155:6
                                 functioning 37:15 109:3
found 23:13 41:5 63:9
                                 fund 36:21
foundation 9:3
                                 funding 40:16,23 41:2,6 52:18
foundational 149:21
                                 funds 41:8
founders 172:5
                                 further 10:15 36:16 37:13
four 39:4,18,21 40:7 41:11,12
                                  161:23 163:4,25 164:12
 41:21 63:12 64:13 72:24 84:15
                                 Furthermore 36:10
 102:6 103:11 107:17 120:5
                                 future 6:18 7:9 11:12 13:4 14:8
 124:15,17 126:7 131:10,11,13
                                  14:12 17:13 20:6,21 24:21
 131:14 139:5,9 141:17 150:4
                                  25:10 27:22 37:21 42:4 43:19
 170:24 174:4 183:11,20
                                  43:21 46:19 49:3 54:9,9 56:20
fourteen 103:12 115:12
                                  65:11,13 73:6 77:25 79:14,18
frack 150:11
                                  79:18 86:20 90:12 102:24
fracked 149:13,16
                                  103:9,13 107:20,21 111:17
fracking 52:8 118:16 131:8,8,15
                                  113:25 117:14 139:22 140:6,8
                                  140:10,15 141:6,14 145:11
 131:20 132:4 136:10,21 149:12
 149:18,22 150:15 151:13,18
                                  153:22 156:13 160:20 164:11
                                  164:22 167:14,22 170:5 176:4
fracking-related 151:4
fracturing 22:4 107:19
                                  176:5,14,20 179:4
framework 160:24
France 185:2,8
                                 G185:2,8
Frank 90:19
Frankiewicz 169:10
                                 gag 151:2
                                 gaining 5:20
frantic8:4
                                 gallon 132:15
Frasier 175:5
Fredonia 1:9,11 5:9 31:4 42:6
                                 gallons 150:12
                                 gangbusters 123:14
 63:5 66:24 70:13,16,18,23
                                 gap 84:24 85:16
 71:21 83:8 91:10 125:5 126:6
                                 garbage 150:18
 126:8 161:14 179:10 184:4
                                 Gary 4:23 38:4 172:21
Fredonia/Stockton 62:23
free 41:16 154:16 180:20
                                 gas 11:20 19:18 21:21 22:5,10
                                  22:11,25 29:24 31:19,25 46:8
freedoms 11:5
French 178:9
                                  52:7,21 60:13,16 61:17,20
                                  68:8 73:14 78:8 90:7 94:22
frequent 76:13
                                  107:14,16,17,23 112:14 118:10
Frewsburg 169:16
                                  118:13 131:21 132:2,11 135:6
Friday 47:11
                                  135:24 136:11 140:14 144:14
friend 110:10
friendly 80:4 145:15,24
                                  144:16 148:5,7,10,11,16,18,21
                                  149:5,10,11,16 150:19,23
friends 6:16
                                  151:7 152:3,5,10,13,17,20,21
frustration 163:5
                                  153:2,7,9,17,19,21 154:7,8,14
fuel 46:4 52:6,6 117:9 118:13
                                  155:11,18 156:4 166:3,15,22
 144:15 151:8 154:13,14,15,16
                                  166:23 167:8,9,14 170:8
 155:18
fuels 54:15 60:12 86:8 124:20
                                  175:14,20 183:10,12,15,17,21
                                  184:12
 153:25 155:6
                                 gases 20:19 21:17 119:7
full 15:13 42:9 53:22 60:3
 83:14 141:11 163:10 183:18
                                 gas-fired 53:16
                                 gather 184:3
fully 14:22 36:20 42:13 147:4
                                 gathering 133:6
 155:15
fumes 64:24
                                 Gaus 165:15
```

```
general 36:21 77:16 161:25
                                  40:5 59:17 62:17 64:7,11
 172:8
                                  74:10 75:6,9 80:17 82:2,18
generate 19:17 51:12 107:10
                                  85:14 87:12 95:24 99:10
                                  101:21 103:20 110:23 112:20
 124:5,25 125:6,15 137:24
 140:3 175:10
                                  117:8 126:4,9 132:10,25 135:4
generated 11:15 19:16 21:15
                                  139:8 143:8 144:24 145:22
 43:4 51:18 122:13 139:25
                                  152:3 170:8 173:6,17 179:13
 140:7 183:10
                                 goal 37:4 49:11 84:11,11
generates 81:7 147:4
                                 goals 12:25
generating 11:10 20:24 50:20
                                 God 87:16 142:7 143:24
 51:22 67:11 71:2,3 72:7,12,19
                                 goes 3:5 40:5,5,17 48:22 58:21
 73:11 76:19 125:4,10,18
                                  58:24,25 76:16 104:20,25
 175:14 183:4,20
                                  106:5 124:24 173:6
generation 12:6,18 13:5 18:12
                                 going 2:4,17 3:12,24 4:6,10,19
 27:6 29:17 32:21 42:14,24
                                  4:21,25 8:5 29:13 38:11 41:6
                                  44:11 47:18 54:4,16,21 63:17
 45:9,15 46:5 58:3 67:6,16
 95:23,25 121:6 122:23 128:9
                                  63:20 64:9,12,13,15,18,19
 171:16 181:2
                                  65:3,17,20 79:4,16,18,21,22
generations 90:12 121:9
                                  79:25 80:3,4,21 82:13 83:3
                                  88:23 91:25 92:5 94:2 95:24
generator 76:2
generators 67:19 68:20 76:10,16
                                  96:21 97:21 98:22 99:2,19
gentleman 106:4 141:11
                                  100:4,6,15 102:10,18,22,24
gentlemen 107:4 113:11 143:13
                                  103:3,15 106:8,10 110:2,4,12
 146:4,15 147:6 158:7 160:7
                                  110:23 122:15,15,16 123:11,14
                                  133:15 135:22 136:4 137:23
George 100:18 105:13
Georgia 154:17
                                  138:10,11 139:6 142:8,9
                                  143:10 158:16 161:17 173:6,18
Gerald 147:18
Germany 51:23
                                  173:19 174:21 182:14 184:6,16
getting 26:21 48:5 60:14 64:3
                                 gold122:8 184:5,10
 64:17 82:17 150:8 153:7,15
                                 golf 146:22,25
                                 good 5:4 8:6 28:20 30:12 32:16
 174:9
giants 130:6
                                  33:18 38:3 42:5 44:19 45:18
gigawatts 112:20
                                  50:9 55:21 57:14 59:22,24
                                  70:7 77:11 80:7 81:18 83:6
Giglio 29:5,8
girl 63:10
                                  88:15 89:4 93:5,11 105:9
                                  107:25 110:10,25 116:14
Girls 146:11 147:10
give 11:23 39:20 62:14 88:19
                                  119:17 127:8 129:25 134:19
 100:2 131:21 132:24 159:13
                                  138:20 141:9 147:20 148:21
 161:20 169:8 184:11
                                  165:18 168:7 169:12 172:3
given 17:24 34:2 38:20 60:15
                                  179:7
 96:13 149:2 155:11,12 176:12
                                 Goodbye 174:18
gives 73:20
                                 Goodell 4:22 25:18,19,25 91:5
                                  143:4,25 180:3
giving 26:2 93:5 121:3,19 151:7
                                 Goodell's 180:18
glad 148:3
glaring 23:7
                                 goods 8:8
                                 good-paying 61:15
Glenn 147:19
Glinda 156:6
                                 government 23:18 36:14 47:19,19
global 131:17 151:8
                                  47:20,20 104:17 105:5 107:12
glow 59:12
                                  129:3 141:25
qo 2:5 4:25 9:25 15:25 39:19
                                 governments 109:3
```

```
governor 12:4,11 15:14 26:22
                                  21:9,19 22:15 23:8,25 30:14
 56:10 68:12 81:23 82:5 90:13
                                  33:17 50:16 54:7 58:10 75:17
 91:17 109:11 145:14 159:16,23
                                  77:6 96:4 105:24 106:5
 160:21,25
                                 grinds 166:19
governors 104:19
                                 groceries 5:25 9:25
governor's 12:25 68:16
                                 Gross 75:7
Gowanda 141:23
                                 grossly 18:21
go-around 81:25
                                 ground 132:16 148:12
go-to 90:8
                                 groundwater 132:14
graduate 69:10
                                 group 30:15 45:25 50:11,12 51:4
                                  101:4 158:2
grandchild 121:9
grandchildren 63:13
                                 groups 48:6,10 101:19 147:22
                                  157:21
grandfather 93:6,7
granted 58:6
                                 Group's 50:14
grants 52:21
                                 grow 6:13 43:10 45:13 79:16,19
                                  139:22 140:13 160:14
grass 63:7 168:20
gratitude 5:19
                                 growing 12:15 71:8 181:17
grave 8:5 45:7
                                 growth 11:12 43:12,16,20 73:25
great 12:11 75:3 82:12 90:8
                                  79:20 113:4 165:6
 130:25 132:19 133:24 137:9
                                 Gruber 126:24 127:8,9 129:23
 146:13 148:5 177:25 178:5
                                 guarantee 17:20 62:17 98:24
 179:12
                                 guaranteed 17:11
greater15:11 53:15 118:11
                                 guaranteeing 103:12
                                 quess 132:23 167:23 180:12
greatest 80:13 170:18 175:7
greatly 20:19 34:25 153:13
                                 quests 130:16
greed 173:3
                                 guide 84:4
                                 Gus 66:5,11,22
greedy 173:3
green 49:19 53:6,6 54:16 106:24
                                 guy 93:2
 106:25 107:5,12
                                 guys 62:12 66:20 87:7
greenhouse 20:18 21:17,21 31:24
                                                 Η
 52:21 119:7
                                 Haase 147:17,18
Greg 2:21 82:25 86:25 143:4
 156:17
                                 half 18:8 28:3 29:22 31:16
                                   39:25 66:18 82:9 88:4 178:23
GREGG 1:15
                                 halt 166:20
Gregory 156:15
                                 hand 20:12 28:10 33:21 53:22
grew 70:2 157:9
                                   64:25 93:23 147:6 162:15,16
grid 13:13,18 14:3 15:3,12,24
 16:8,16,20,23 17:20 18:3,10
                                 handle 89:17 142:8
                                 handouts 10:4
 19:8,24 20:8 21:4,6,11 23:6
                                 hands 6:22 17:14 20:21 24:3
 24:7,12,16 30:7,21 32:10 33:3
                                  182:3
 33:5 57:6,16,24 58:13,22,24
                                 hangs 7:7
 60:8 65:2 78:22 92:24 95:22
 96:20,22,23 98:15,19,22 100:3
                                 Hanlon 168:4
                                 Hanover 178:10
 100:5,12 130:19 131:3 133:13
                                 happen 48:15 62:11 65:6 88:12
 135:21 145:2 147:6 158:10
 165:24,24 171:13 172:22,25
                                  88:15 129:10,16 130:10 170:20
                                  171:20
 180:3,13
                                 happened 23:16 103:17 141:17
grids 96:17,18
                                  152:11 167:11
Grid's 13:16,23 14:6,22 15:8
                                 happening 79:8 119:3 170:11,16
 16:2 17:15 18:15,20 19:6,11
```

```
happens 34:8 66:13 67:24 82:9
                                 heating 96:7 152:16
 97:25 108:13,14,15,16,16,17
                                 heavily 9:2 72:20
 108:17 118:16 133:25 134:24
                                 heavy 76:24 150:10
                                 heck 174:7
happy 4:17 66:2
harbor 133:16
                                 height 181:19
hard 10:3 67:2 69:5 82:20 98:5
                                 held 14:5 47:13 69:5
 127:14 173:17
                                 hell 125:3
hardship 14:9
                                 Hello 74:5 93:19 114:25 175:3
harmful 60:11 118:13 178:19
                                 help 7:3 21:4 41:3 57:12 61:6
Harriman 1:12 2:4,12 3:9 5:18
                                  70:3 73:15 84:24 92:21 104:23
 25:15,21 33:23 34:6 44:10,23
                                  105:3,6 130:23 131:4 141:4,5
 53:23 54:24 55:14 62:20 65:20
                                  146:20 155:16 156:9 157:22
 69:8 70:8 74:3,15 75:12 82:13
                                  176:25 182:11
 86:24 88:22 89:3 90:17 93:12
                                 helper 134:3
 95:16 99:2 100:15 109:18
                                 helpful 180:25
 113:13 126:22 130:16 138:14
                                 helping 6:7
 141:8 143:18 146:2 147:15
                                 hereof 185:4
 156:15 161:6 165:15 168:2
                                 hereto 185:3
 169:9 174:12,14,19 177:12
                                 hereunto 185:6
 179:5,18 180:5,15 184:14
                                 Herm 169:15
Harry 177:12
                                 Herman 169:11
hastened 119:6
                                 herring 22:8 149:18
hate 123:24
                                 hey 80:21 139:7
hat's 81:17
                                 he'll 180:24
                                 Hi 2:20 105:12 109:21 113:21
haul 169:22
haven 129:6
                                  133:9
hazardous 150:19,23
                                 hide 177:21
head 135:16
                                 high 19:17 22:4,16 39:15 41:2
headquarters 13:25
                                  41:14 67:8 69:11 71:7,11,17
health 40:5 41:20 52:13 89:14
                                  71:18 93:21 94:10 95:13
 117:23 118:15 145:5 150:3
                                  107:19 113:3 114:16 132:19
 151:10 155:19 156:2 164:20
                                  148:10 149:25 150:7 151:5,14
 166:13
                                  153:7 156:12 167:3,8 172:12
                                  176:6 181:22 182:15
healthy 53:18
heap 170:19
                                 higher 7:13 16:12 30:11 71:19
                                  114:19 153:7 161:24 163:8
hear 3:7 4:14 5:22 33:14 34:22
 35:20 81:20 101:20,24 139:15
                                  164:7 178:24
 143:6,12,12 148:6 160:5 161:2
                                 higher-performing 85:2
 181:3
                                 highest 9:4 19:20 81:15
heard 3:2 4:10 13:12 38:8,9
                                 highlights 29:15
 46:13 99:23 101:19 110:4
                                 highly 132:15
                                 highway 12:13,14,19,23,25 15:14
 115:6 130:20 144:11 155:6
 157:11,18 158:2 159:12,23
                                  68:17 78:15
 160:8,23 182:8
                                 high-paying 28:6 52:23
hearing1:4 2:2,10 5:21 26:23
                                 high-wage 51:24
 45:8 83:9 161:3 168:14,15
                                 hikes 7:10 10:11,12
 184:19 185:5
                                 Hill 18:4 19:12 50:22
heart 6:25 33:13 110:5
                                 hire 122:22
hearts 82:11
                                 hired 95:9
heat 52:12 81:7
                                 hiring 141:2
```

historic 20:3 183:19 household150:18historically 76:21 153:24 183:8 households 8:21 85:25 history 39:21 87:8 130:11 houses 64:19 183:14 hit 29:15 76:11,13 92:14 132:19 housing 71:12 121:15 141:22 how's 139:6 **hobble** 110:7 huge 18:23 36:23 106:25 107:10 **Hofner** 55:18 59:24,25 human 89:15 151:9 hold 127:22 humans 150:6 holding 5:21 168:14 Humphrey 19:3 Hollins 100:20 109:18,21,22 hundred 7:21 8:22 9:17 11:22 home 4:18 9:13,16 26:9 34:8 16:12,14,22 17:8 20:15 27:14 39:3 71:21 75:16,24 78:18 28:4,18 33:11 35:22 39:4,6,7 90:4 110:23 120:4 127:25 40:16,25 50:3 51:23 64:14 139:11 146:8 152:15 154:21 70:16 80:22 81:10,13,14 82:3 156:21 181:4 86:13 87:11,19 88:10 97:16,18 99:9 102:6,7 103:13 109:24 homebuyers 85:22 homeowner 89:8 111:11 120:2,10,16,18,19 homeowners 51:11 150:25 154:3 122:12 123:18 124:8,11 125:23 **Homer** 30:3 125:25 126:7,7,18 131:10 homes 9:5 42:8 49:2 75:22 76:14 132:15 140:3 142:2 149:9 120:7 128:22 141:25 145:4 150:4 151:21 154:19,25 155:2 164:18 165:8 156:20 158:25 159:7 160:18 hometown 6:17165:22 169:23 174:2,6 183:22 homework 41:3 hundreds 13:24 19:3 25:2,2 40:21 81:2 83:18 150:9 151:9 home-grown 53:10 67:14 honest 26:10 158:23 hundred-vear 148:8 honor 46:17 79:5 84:8 99:8 hungry 162:6 110:24 127:11 142:19 151:7 **Huntley** 77:17 honorable 5:17 34:6 84:3 130:15 hurt 140:19 **hook** 90:6 husband 9:22 10:3 hope 25:9 65:14 75:9 139:7 hydraulic 22:4 107:19 141:5 146:17 155:9,15 165:12 hydro 122:13 hydrofrack 22:12 167:10 180:24 hopefully 65:18 121:6 hydro-fracking 167:4 **hopes** 64:5 hydro-fracturing 148:10 151:14 hoping 64:22 Ι **Horatio** 87:16 horizontal 167:4 icon 133:16 icons 129:19 **horrible** 143:20 idea 105:20 106:24 127:20 148:5 horrific 30:4 148:16,21 183:9 Horrigan 141:8,9,10 **ideally** 15:20 Horvath 5:9 ideas 46:3 98:14 155:15 hospitality 5:11 identified 68:16 hostage 14:5 identifies 20:13 **hot** 101:6 idiots 105:19,24 **hotter** 125:3 hour 182:7 **idle** 129:6 hours 81:3 101:7 **ignore** 35:23 ignored 65:3 house 63:23 76:8 103:20 161:15 165:22 176:22 ignores 24:20

illegal 151:12,15 incorporate 180:17 illness 151:4incorrect 155:10 increase 28:7 52:8,24 53:10 **ills** 183:2 imagine 9:6 39:12 80:19 120:10 58:5 59:20,21 62:15,16 63:21 immediate 35:17 36:7 142:3 72:18 78:15 84:23 89:21 90:2 118:4 126:5 129:10,11 152:18 immediately 36:3 impact 8:6 18:23 19:10 24:14,17 153:4 164:5,13,17,17 174:6 31:3 35:13 36:8,17,17 45:8,15 increased 48:20,24 89:17 161:24 95:7 106:12,14 116:24 120:13 increases 23:8 92:5 112:17,17 120:20 127:15 140:19 163:10 114:12 130:4 140:24 182:10 increasing112:4 152:17 153:13 165:3 impacted 25:3 48:20 143:11 increasingly 149:11 impacts 24:20 36:24 149:23 incredible 6:9 7:25 73:21 95:7 151:10,11 incredibly 152:6 impinging 126:17 incur 161:24 164:11 implemented 119:8independence 49:8,18 67:15 imploring 143:15 107:22 171:25 import 29:21 30:9 31:20 independent11:10 17:24 42:10 importance 72:11 156:25 49:11 119:9 126:13 important 32:5 43:24 44:5 52:15 independents 101:18 52:16 79:9 84:23 87:9 97:3 indicated 124:2 160:25 101:3,8,23 104:8 106:13 individual 123:22 124:10 109:10 113:25 134:2,18 139:16 individually 66:17 industrial 43:12 107:7 183:12 139:18 157:8,14,14 159:9,22 159:23 173:12 181:7 industrialization 149:24 importantly 36:25 72:9 industries 43:10,11 90:9 101:16 imported 21:24 112:2 102:5,15 103:9 importing19:22 21:20 30:3 industry 6:10 56:8,12,14 61:9 67:22 68:20 111:24 80:5 87:22 92:5 98:22 125:21 **imports** 67:24 125:24 126:3 132:4 134:21 impossible 41:22 148:6,11,19 150:20,23 152:7 153:5 156:4 170:17 173:12,13 impressed 75:24 **improve** 73:15 inefficient 32:13 173:3 **improved** 162:25 inevitable 129:10 improvement 72:23 inexpensive 102:17 152:6 improvements 17:3 information 14:19 18:19 142:24 inadequate 59:9,9 148:2 150:24 155:16 159:4 incentive 61:2,7 64:7 163:4 incentives 61:12 infrastructure 48:24 49:3,7 include 18:22 19:9 21:12 54:18 72:23 included 18:15 infrastructures 49:13 includes 5:7 108:9 140:16 ingredient 96:2 including 5:9 12:6,8 18:3 20:15 **initial** 154:2 initiative 15:3 21:21 31:25 21:13,15 52:19 71:7 82:20 101:10 145:10 150:21 154:13 52:21 90:14 92:3 income 8:21 9:24 36:22 51:13,22 initiatives 112:9 97:6 122:12 144:11 145:5 injects 72:24 161:16 input 5:15,21 153:11 incomes 5:24 114:18 inserted 66:3 install 154:23 inconsistent 23:3

```
installed 53:2 154:9
                                 I.B.D.W83:11
                                 I.D.A57:4 80:11 91:11 92:11
Institution 71:22
institutions 71:19
                                 I.S.O17:25 19:13 21:10
instrumental 62:11
                                                J
insulators 59:12
                                 J4:22
insurance 40:5
                                 Jacobson 123:25
integrated 96:17
                                 Jakulric 138:16
intent 26:25
intentional 151:12  152:9
                                 James 44:15 53:23 54:2 55:17
                                  57:15 165:17,19 166:11
interest 3:2,5,6 5:15 27:5 33:6
                                 Jamestown 70:11,23 71:19 91:18
 44:7 49:17,19,20,24 50:2 84:5
                                  96:9 154:23 172:20,24 178:2,6
 182:21
interested 147:25
                                  178:9
                                 January 22:21
interesting180:25 182:6
                                 Jay 147:15
interim 122:4
                                 Jeff 66:10 74:4,6
intermittent 21:2
                                 Jefferson 168:11,22 169:3
international 137:10
                                 jeopardizes 87:25
intervention 85:13
interview 69:14,14
                                 Jersey 123:17
                                 Jim 146:2,5
introduced 181:3
                                 Joanne 147:17
invalid 148:22
                                 job 6:7 7:13,18 10:10 11:12
invest 28:2 35:22 58:23 88:4,13
                                  75:2 89:16 90:14 97:21 98:9
 88:18 113:7 122:25 144:15
                                  98:11,12 99:12 108:21 114:13
invested 28:17 60:20 61:18,20
                                  127:20,24 161:23 165:6,6
 72:20 87:17
                                  166:5,14 167:21
investing 53:19 154:4 158:14
investment17:7 31:16 35:23
                                 jobs 6:4,12 7:20,21 10:14 11:7
                                  11:16,21 12:8 13:6,24 23:10
 51:7 52:23 68:15 81:14 88:2
                                  28:6 35:18 39:16 45:18,24
 103:14 113:9 121:12 122:19
                                  48:14,16 49:25,25 51:8,20,24
 154:2 158:18,25 159:6,7,9
 160:10 178:23
                                  52:23 53:6,6,10 55:8 56:14
                                  59:5,22,23 61:15,15,19 63:16
investments 50:18 51:3,19 53:8
                                  64:4,10,11 68:24 70:21 73:6
 53:10 60:9 141:3
                                  83:18 86:7,10,12,13,14,15
invests 160:13
                                  90:11 92:19 94:8 95:5 97:23
involved 81:21 104:16 105:8
                                  108:25 109:12 113:4,10 114:8
 107:5 169:5
                                  114:15 117:15 118:11 125:16
involvement 36:16
                                  125:17,20,25 126:2,5,8,9
in-state 12:13
                                  128:4,6,16,23 144:9 145:3
irony 183:19
                                  162:16 164:8,14,19 166:18,18
irresponsible 109:14
                                  169:19 170:3 175:23 176:3
irritated 174:7
                                  178:22,24 181:10 183:5
irritating 94:19
Island 50:23 168:12,21 169:3
                                 Joe 29:5 44:13
                                 John 44:16 54:25 55:2 99:2,6
issue 22:3 25:8 26:19 28:25
                                  100:20 109:18,20,22 168:2
 29:16 30:18 37:10 69:13 93:22
                                 Johnson 4:23 42:5,6,8
 96:24 101:21 104:24 139:16
157:15 163:4,10,16,21
                                 Joseph 46:23 105:17
                                 Jr 69:10
issues 84:21 136:8 145:9 155:20
                                 judge 1:13 2:13 5:17 34:6 70:7
 158:8 162:4,21 163:24 166:3
 166:13 168:23 181:11
                                  179:17
```

```
Julian 55:16,21,22 57:10
                                  94:19 95:21,21 99:22 102:23
                                  104:6,19 110:11 115:18 131:2
July1:8 60:23
jump-started 51:7
                                  131:25 132:6,12,18,20 135:3
                                  135:23,24 136:6,10 137:5,11
jurisdiction 23:24 24:8
                                  138:10 142:11,24 154:10
J-A-K-U-L-R-I-C 138:16
J.C.C 91:17
                                  157:15 158:8,17,17 161:23
                                  168:19 171:10,11 174:22
               K
                                  180:20 182:10
K18:4,6
                                 knowing 130:18
Kabob 59:13
                                 known 51:5 54:2
Kalfas 177:15
                                 knows 145:21
Kathleen 168:5,9
                                 Krouza 82:25 86:25 87:2
Kathy 100:19 108:2
                                 Kurt 174:20 175:4
Kavanaugh 66:9 74:3
keep 6:3 11:5 44:21 63:16,16,21
 64:18,21,23 65:17,24 73:24
                                 L179:5
 81:3 92:18 99:20 103:22
                                 labor 47:22 62:24 122:23 123:7
 110:22 113:5 130:4 151:18
                                  123:8
 153:11,14 157:22 163:23
                                 lack 71:11 73:9
 164:19 165:12 168:18,18
                                 Lackawanna 50:21 129:18 130:5,8
 174:22 181:13
                                  165:21
keeping 86:7 170:7
                                 Lackawanna's 130:2
Keith 100:17,22
                                 ladies 107:4 113:11 143:13
Ken 138:19,21 139:6
                                  146:3 160:7
Kentucky 64:10,13
                                 laid 129:22
kept 7:18 154:3
                                 lake 47:12 81:14 119:19 121:2
Kevin 55:19 62:6
                                  125:13 130:25 132:17 134:17
key 14:24 22:22 88:6 96:11 97:4
                                  135:2,2,7,10 137:10 138:12
kids 39:15 40:22 41:2 42:4
                                  166:17 175:7 182:16
 64:16 110:22 139:5,9,10
                                 lakefront 129:8 175:9,12 176:2
 147:12 167:16
                                  176:10 177:3,7
                                 Lakes 90:8 133:25 137:10
kill 88:24
killing 110:21
                                 Lakewood 154:24
kilowatt 124:10 154:25
                                 lambs 54:12
                                 land 130:25 175:23
Kim 5:17 130:16
Kimberly 1:12 2:12
                                 landfills 150:18
kind 37:24 51:25 106:6 116:7
                                 landscape 35:6
 137:6 164:21 171:5 180:16
                                 language 12:4 26:20 85:11,12
 184:9
                                  115:13
king 129:20
                                 Lansing 47:9
Kingdom 13:20 14:12 181:24
                                 large 19:15 41:19 45:23 83:18
Kinner 138:17
                                  118:8 130:3 135:18 183:25
kneecap 11:12
                                 larger 58:18 123:22 184:4
knew 152:10 181:21
                                 largest 8:10 72:13,14 73:4
know 4:20 6:24 10:6 13:13 26:6
                                  114:4 158:2 159:5,9 160:9
 26:14 29:13,20 31:9,23 32:6
                                  184:2
                                 Larry 147:16
 32:20 33:20 38:13 40:2,4
 41:24 48:5 56:10,18 57:11
                                 lastly 78:20 118:18
 60:25 63:20 64:3,21 66:18
                                 late 4:8 177:22 182:7
 75:3 78:23 79:3 89:22 92:2
                                 law1:13 2:13 5:17 26:22 55:12
```

Lawrence 157:7 **liable** 69:5 **liberals** 101:17 **Lawrie** 165:16 laws 137:15 150:21 lieu 8:13 28:21 36:6 38:20 **lay** 10:17 52:17 life 35:13 45:20 60:12 89:11,22 laying 129:25 90:11 145:8 150:6 154:11 layoffs 114:13 128:11 **leached** 132:16 157:11 162:25 175:6 lifelong 55:22 56:3 62:7 74:6 leaching 132:13 **lead** 46:11 53:14 85:24 178:22 83:11 87:5 100:25 **leader** 61:8 101:9 lifetime 53:3 56:6 light 84:12 **leaders** 6:9 8:4 56:11 101:11 **leadership** 12:12 117:2 143:3 lights 26:11 **leads** 14:15 36:13 112:17 limit 4:10 **league** 6:13 104:5 limited 14:23 176:14 leaking 59:12 line 18:7,25 19:12,12 37:4 58:7 **leaks** 151:5 58:8 59:8 106:11 120:25 **learn** 6:7 163:10 124:24 lines 18:5,13 23:21,22 24:5 **learned** 40:14 learning 115:13 31:20 59:8 68:2,5 77:9 78:7 **leave** 82:16,18 128:16,17 144:25 124:23 125:15 137:21 175:18 174:24 181:7 **linkage** 18:16 **leaves** 121:14 linking 23:7 **leaving** 175:18 links 148:3 **led** 51:2 166:4 **LIPA** 50:23 **Lee** 80:24 158:19 159:5 lipstick 93:8 **left** 9:24 10:13 23:14 63:18 liquification 166:21 87:23 104:3 114:20 128:8 list 48:6 181:22 132:14 150:13 listed 19:6 legal 151:12 listen 91:16 99:5 181:8 legislation 61:2 listened 13:15 legislative 26:15,25 listening 27:20 87:3 133:11 legislator 104:16 105:13 141:11 lit.183:14 **literacy** 162:21 177:19 legislators 130:17 literally 156:11 legislature 27:3 little 6:13 104:5 123:19 163:25 181:5 184:4 **Leikam** 74:19 77:11,12 Lemming 55:3 live 2:21 8:17 42:6 55:3 62:23 **lent** 120:17 63:12,13 73:8 74:23 83:7 89:7 **lessens** 125:14 97:5 98:6,8 105:5 108:2 **lesson** 39:21 114:11 115:2 121:18 127:24 **letting** 74:9 89:5 100:10 173:17 146:6,9 161:16 162:23 165:20 **let's** 38:25 39:17 43:18,20 46:6 175:5 176:18,21 178:2 lived 66:24 89:11 102:2 103:19 78:25 107:13 113:4,7,8,9,9,10 103:23 161:9 175:5 134:7 **level** 56:21 57:5,8 67:20 89:20 livelihoods 11:9 110:5 114:14 119:8 141:23 lives 6:7 102:3 114:24 128:21 153:11 165:11 **levels** 41:15 57:9 71:7 139:22 living 5:24 71:10 90:5 103:18 139:7 161:18,18 151:5 **load** 21:7 leveraging 147:3

```
115:7 129:2 145:3 162:14
loads 125:14
loans 161:18,19
                                  164:4,16
lobbyist 45:25 46:19
                                 losses 7:13 10:10 89:16 161:23
local 8:4,8 17:11,12 20:20 25:2
                                 lost 38:23 39:23,25 40:15,24
 27:8 30:8 35:8 36:3 45:16
                                  41:10 48:16 54:19 68:24 86:11
                                  97:22 98:7 102:5 109:12
 47:20 48:13 52:14,23,25 53:3
 53:9,11,18 54:10,19 63:10
                                  115:25 134:7 144:9 170:2,3,3
 70:21 72:18,24 74:12 83:11
                                 lot 3:3 38:8 56:2 58:19,22
 88:12,12,20 109:3,15 128:25
                                  59:14 75:8 81:22 91:2 93:4
 129:3 147:21 149:12 155:12
                                  97:19,20 98:23 105:2 110:5,16
 166:4 179:3
                                  121:15 122:12 125:2,5 129:8
locally 30:17 81:21 124:25
                                  134:9 142:25 146:20 149:7
                                  161:21 173:4,18 176:11 182:2
 125:15 128:7
locally-produced 33:9
                                  182:19 183:2
locate 85:23
                                 loudly 4:2
located 119:20 183:11
                                 love 6:17 133:4
location 34:15
                                 low 81:5,12 84:21 96:23 154:7
Locomotive 87:18 88:9
                                  166:2
logger 62:23
                                 lower 7:23 153:4 172:23,24
logical 92:7
                                 low-cost 79:22
long 50:23 67:3 68:10 72:6
                                 low-priced 167:8,8
 103:22 126:10 136:20 143:24
                                 luck 93:11
 157:13 163:23 168:12,21 169:3
                                 Lucy 174:20
                                 lunch 41:16
 171:11 173:16
longer 29:7 67:11 81:19 99:24
                                 L.E.P115:13
 102:9,9 164:25
                                                M
longtime 77:14
                                 M138:16
long-term 12:25 15:5 24:20 32:6
                                 machine 169:17 170:23 173:14
 32:7,11,12,15,17 35:17,19
                                 Madam 167:20
 37:3 51:14 88:19 154:2 155:24
 177:6 178:21
                                 magic 140:2
                                 magnificent 63:6
look 3:7 11:2 33:2 64:9 65:7,16
 77:25 86:9 98:17 101:24
                                 magnitude 135:17
                                 mail 82:21
 110:18,19 120:22 121:24 170:5
                                 main 65:15 131:7 169:19
looked 75:24
                                 maintain 53:3 90:4,10 113:8
looking 6:8 38:19 39:18 64:14
                                  164:18 175:23
 85:23 90:3 149:8 183:16
                                 maintained 13:3 67:5
looks 59:10
                                 maintaining 37:14 90:11 96:4
loop 96:4,6
Lori 177:16,18
                                 maintains 16:16
                                 major 20:15 22:19 23:14 102:14
lose 10:14 11:9 41:12,21 56:8
                                  121:14 129:2 141:19,22 150:20
 73:3,4,6 89:23 94:4,7 95:4
 98:23 114:8,14,23 127:19
                                 majoring 69:12
 128:15 162:2
                                 majority 24:25
                                 Makach 143:18
losing 36:15 39:18 55:7 140:19
                                 making 33:25 58:25 62:2,11
 145:4
loss 7:5 8:7 9:9 10:16 35:25
                                  94:13 125:11 172:18 179:17,19
                                  179:20,25
 36:6 45:14,16,17,18,19,21,21
                                 Makuch 143:22 144:2
 45:22,22,23,23,24 49:24 52:15
 84:15,18 94:23 108:21,21
                                 man 59:10 92:24
```

154:24 managed 97:4management 13:24 **Melissa** 93:18,20 member 54:3 62:22,24 83:11 86:5 manager 77:16 95:19 105:14 133:24 144:4 168:20 mandates 40:3 115:19 mantra 80:13 members 3:18 31:24 40:9 46:17 manufactured 165:25 47:25,25 77:4 84:3 108:6,7 manufacturers 10:12 110:24 116:19 142:18 Manufacturer's 111:5 men 36:4 128:20,21 manufacturing 11:13 48:25 52:25 mental 164:20 71:24 111:12 113:6 mention 38:10 mentioned 29:3 39:18 122:18 Marcellus 22:11 margin 27:4 149:20 181:15 182:17 mark 126:24 127:9 149:19 mentions 26:23 market 12:9 24:23 67:16 112:25 mercury 20:15 21:15 119:6 137:8 118:22,25 126:13 166:23,24 166:9 markets 23:9 106:13,14 111:21 message 158:3 160:9 married 63:10 139:3 146:7 met 24:11 63:10 115:16 146:6 Massachusetts 14:2 123:18 metals 150:10 massive 7:10 114:12 166:16 methane 150:10 151:5 match 12:22 15:20 method 148:9 151:24 material 14:15 32:8 132:14,16 methods 150:23 materials 150:11 Michael 74:18 75:12,13 179:6,8 math 85:9,12 157:25 185:2,8 matter 16:17 42:9 78:11 101:21 microphone 3:25 **Matthew** 168:4 middle 115:3, 10, 10 158:10 mature 72:3 Mid-American 22:24 mayor 33:24 34:7 87:8 91:10 migrate 150:14 179:11 Mile 18:4 19:11 Mayville 75:14 miles 18:5, 7, 8 132:8 183:11, 20 ma'am 56:17 137:13 Miller 44:15 53:24,25 54:2 McCoy 74:18 75:12,13,14 90:20 93:12 million 8:7,14 16:10,13,14,22 mean 43:12 46:16 63:24 73:12 17:9,21 23:15 28:18 35:22 170:12 177:14 178:24 means 8:19 95:9 97:20 110:5 39:18,24,25 41:11,13,21 61:18 115:15,16 144:20 61:19 72:22,24 80:22 81:10,13 82:3 84:15 103:14 120:17 mechanism 51:25 medal 184:5,10 121:12 122:12 124:9 150:12 media 159:24 160:3 159:2,7 median 8:21 millions 17:7 19:3 51:2 126:11 Medicaid 89:19 151:17 million-dollar 170:2 medical 124:16 meet 12:15 14:23 15:13 17:18 mind 97:9,13 99:11 131:16 27:7 31:21 32:2,3 41:19 145:10 mindful 33:10 117:12,22 128:6 meetings 180:11 minds 180:12 meets 12:24 24:24 mine 110:10 122:8 155:3 173:13 megawatt 78:23,25 79:4 97:21 minimum 15:4 106:12,14 123:12,22 124:9 mining 125:25 166:7 megawatts 15:17 97:16,18,19 ministers 172:3 minute 11:16 174:22 123:16,19 125:10 126:7 154:19

```
minutes 4:11 44:22 65:25 148:24
                                 municipality 123:13
 175:3 177:11 178:7
                                 Murphy 82:23 83:6,7
misleading 20:8
                                 music 85:10
                                 must-take 80:19
missed 160:9 171:5
mission 108:10
                                 mutually 78:9
missions 80:14
                                 mythology 94:17
mistake 46:6 178:7
                                 M-A143:21
mobilized 141:23
                                 M-A-K-A-C-H 143:19
                                 M-I-L-A-Z-Z-A-V-O-M-D 177:13
model 3:4
modern 31:11
                                                N
Mohawk 13:20 57:16 58:2 67:3,10
 103:5,25 144:8,12 171:12
                                 name 2:12 3:25 38:4 42:6 44:25
                                  46:23 50:10 55:2,22 59:25
 175:9
                                  62:6 66:22 69:9 70:10 74:23
moment 6:24 35:13
                                  75:13 77:12 79:11 80:12 83:7
moments 160:2
                                  89:6 93:19 99:3,6 108:2
Monday 1:8
                                  109:21 111:2 113:21 114:25
money 9:24 40:19 41:2 58:8
                                  116:15 119:18 127:6,9 138:21
 59:15 78:17 81:6 82:4 86:2
 94:19 107:5,8 116:8 130:22
                                  144:2 146:5 165:19 168:9
                                  175:4 185:6
 134:10,22 144:15 145:19
                                 names 4:7 82:14,22 100:16
 153:15 154:12 155:11,25
                                 name's 57:15 74:5 84:7
 176:25
                                 Nancy 82:24 84:7
monopoly 14:3
                                 Nassau 157:6
Monroe 2:21
                                 nation 19:21 107:21 170:18
months 8:3 158:20 174:11
                                   171:23 172:5
Morabito 55:19 62:6,7
                                 national 13:13, 15, 18, 23 14:3, 6
morning 86:4 141:18 142:9 168:8
                                  14:22 15:3,8,11 16:2,8,16,20
mortgage 120:3
                                  16:23 17:15,19 18:2,10,15,20
mothballed 8:5 72:19 166:5
                                  19:6,8,11,24 20:8 21:9,11,19
Mothballing 35:24
mothers 6:3
                                  22:15 23:6,6,8,25 24:7,16
                                  30:7,14,21 32:10 33:3,5,17
MOTION 1:4
                                  45:25 46:8 50:16 54:7 57:6,16
move 12:14 15:21 31:15,19 64:9
                                  57:24 58:10,13,22,24 60:8
 64:12,19 98:16 114:22 167:4
                                  64:25 75:17,17 77:6 78:22
 173:21 175:25 176:2,25 177:6
                                  92:24 95:22 96:4,20 98:15,19
 178:12 184:11
                                  98:22 99:17 100:3,5,12 105:24
moved 13:25 64:10 74:25 75:2
 87:13 103:19
                                  106:5 130:19 131:3 133:13
                                  135:21 145:2 147:6 155:13
movies 136:9
                                  158:10 165:23,24 171:13
moving 15:16 31:2 110:11
                                  172:22,25 180:3,13 181:16
much-needed 73:4
                                 nationally 128:7
mud 63:8
Muller 66:7 69:8,9,10
                                 natural 11:19 19:18 22:5,10,25
                                  29:24 31:19 60:13,15 61:17,20
Multipurpose 1:10
                                  68:8 94:22 107:14,16,23
multitude 36:24
                                  112:14 131:21 140:14 148:5,6
multi-cultural 162:24
multi-faceted 70:19
                                  148:16,18,21 149:5,10,11
                                  151:6 152:3,5,10,13,17,20
Mumford 62:24
                                  153:2,17,19,21 154:7,8,13
municipal 108:6,7 152:11,14
                                  155:17 166:2,3,22 167:8,9,14
municipalities 154:3
```

44:5,7 45:19,24 46:12,14,14 170:8 175:14 183:10,15,17,21 46:16 48:23 49:3,20,25 50:4 184:12 **nature** 21:2 73:10 50:13 51:3,6,19,20 52:7,7,25 53:6,17 54:7,18 55:3 56:12 naysayers 25:5 near 27:6 28:25 37:2 54:9 58:12,25 59:3,4,19 60:22,25 150:14 166:8 61:3,7,22,23,24 62:3,13 64:2 **nearly** 16:14 107:17 142:13 64:17 65:10 67:5,7,12,14,16 necessarily 67:25 67:20 68:2,4,6,19,22 69:3,4 necessary 117:19 118:2 69:21 70:11 71:11,20 72:2 necessity 37:14 69:19 167:23 74:13,23 77:16,17 78:7,14,18 79:9,14 80:9 86:17 87:13 **neck** 167:13 need 6:2,3,10 7:19 10:19 13:11 88:19 89:7 91:20 92:3,3 96:9 15:12 26:12 31:10 32:18 34:14 96:24 97:20 98:4,14 103:21 37:18,19 43:7 53:16 56:7 104:19 105:4,6,23 108:17 65:17 69:21 70:4 76:17 78:8 111:13,18,19,20,24 112:9,23 79:17 80:2 89:18 99:15 103:8 113:4,5 114:2 115:2,17,18 104:23 105:3,4 116:12 134:21 116:25 117:8 118:5,17 119:8 139:24 140:13,14 162:4,4 119:10,20,21 122:5,5,10 123:2 163:23,25 164:8,8,10,10 172:8 123:2,3,9,11,14,17,23,24 173:16 182:23 183:3,3,7 124:4,15 125:18,22 127:16 **needed** 7:3 19:5 40:21 134:11 128:17 129:18 130:8,23 132:18 142:2 175:11 132:20 134:4 137:22,24 138:7 needs 12:16 14:23 24:11 27:7 139:23 140:5,7 141:7 142:6 41:20,23 49:10 77:7 88:3,19 144:3,13 145:16,23 149:14 151:15,22 153:8 157:5 159:18 92:21 116:11 117:12,22 124:5 163:13 165:5 168:22 169:16,17 163:3 176:6,8,10 182:22 **negative** 18:23 36:8,24 45:15 175:11,14,15,20,22 176:2 149:22 151:10 178:15 185:2 negatively 36:17 newest 31:7 49:14 neglected 68:5,11 **newly** 68:3 **negotiated** 28:20 182:9 **News** 86:5 negotiation 158:20,24 Niagara 13:20 50:11,11,14 51:4 neighborhood 103:22 120:8 57:16 58:2 67:3,10 103:5,24 neighboring 118:17 144:8,12 171:12,12 175:9 neighbors 6:16 nice 76:7 80:8 nest 128:8 nickname 34:3 net119:11 **night** 59:11 101:6 110:4 158:10 network 59:19 174:23 **never** 7:7 102:10 126:9,9,9 nightmare 129:15 131:9 133:5 157:10 171:5 nine 17:2 108:6,7 181:18 175:16 178:4 181:23 Nineteenth 166:12 new1:2,11,14 2:13,23 7:21,22 **ninety** 135:17 160:17 10:10 11:11,22 12:12,22 13:4 ninety-eight 20:17 13:6,7,11,25 14:2,12 15:15,17 ninety-nine 20:16 15:18,25 17:14,18,24,25 18:7 nine-and-a-half 127:9 19:13 20:25 21:3,10,23 22:5 nine-page 29:12 22:11,13 23:3,16,23 24:5,11 **nitrogen** 20:17 21:16 24:15 26:15,16 29:20,25 31:4 nominated 4:17 31:5,8 32:16,19 33:20 34:2 nondisclosure 150:25 35:20 40:2 42:6 43:11,20,24 non-mandated 11:2

```
non-RGGI 67:22 68:20
                                  175:10 178:15
non-transmission 35:12
                                 N.Y.P.A122:10
noose 167:13
                                                0
north 156:6
northern 27:23 34:19 108:8
                                 Obama 112:8 171:22
 146:11 147:11 178:8
                                 object 144:24 145:6,10
                                 obligation 67:4 161:2
notably 112:12
                                 obtained 149:11
notch 130:12
                                 obvious 55:25 128:10
note 138:24
                                 occur 159:6
noteworthy 22:25
                                 occurred 76:22
not-so-distant 153:22
                                 October 17:25 129:24
not-so-in-favor 157:23
                                 odds 73:21
nuclear 54:10 132:6,13
                                 odor 135:25
number 18:6 22:24 26:23 28:6
                                 offer 148:24
 29:10,14 45:5 102:16,25
 135:15 157:5 158:9
                                 offering 61:25 82:3
                                 offers 98:11 178:13
numbers 38:8,11,12,18
                                 office 89:17 171:6 176:7 179:10
numerous 102:3
nurse 132:5
                                  181:13
                                 officer 127:10
nutritional 41:20
                                 officers 6:5 129:11
N.R.G6:21 7:5,15,25 8:4,10,13
                                 officials 56:17
 9:9,15 10:17 11:19 12:24
                                 offline 112:20
 13:12 15:24 16:19 17:5 20:2
                                 oh 66:12 88:23
 22:14 24:23 25:13 27:16 28:2
                                 Ohio 19:15 23:21 30:10 31:24
 28:2,12,17 30:14,16,19,21
 31:2,13 33:18,18 34:9,23 35:3
                                  59:5 64:24 111:25 112:6
                                  123:15
 35:4 36:15,19 37:19,23 38:16
                                 oil 106:3
 38:21 41:13,22 42:3,14,16,19
                                 okay 4:19 34:4 56:17 88:23
 43:8,13,22 45:12,18 47:3,13
 50:7 55:25 56:8,18,22,24
                                  93:14 100:13 113:20 123:9
 57:16 58:13,19,25 60:19 62:8
                                  134:7,8 136:23 137:19 174:17
 66:23 69:18,22 70:5 74:7 75:2
                                  184:14
                                 old 93:7 94:18 181:18
 75:5 76:19 77:15,25 79:19
                                 older 133:17
 80:5 81:17 82:12 83:10,14
                                 Olympic 184:5
 84:2,13,16 86:13,15,22 88:2,8
                                 once 24:4 70:3 92:21 117:8
 88:16,18 89:10,23 90:5,14
                                  152:25 166:21 167:13
 92:8,12,15,18,21 93:11,23,25
 94:4,5,6,21 95:6,13,21 96:22
                                 ones 10:9
                                 online 30:24 31:12 75:21,25
 98:15,21 99:7 100:13 102:21
 103:25 105:8 108:24 109:7,11
                                 Ontario 43:5 51:18 122:15,16
 109:14,16 111:14,16,23 112:23
                                  123:6,8,21
 113:10,25 114:4,7,8 115:7
                                 oops 168:6
 116:10 117:17 120:23 127:20
                                 open 158:23 163:24 165:13
                                  173:11 180:22 182:3
 128:15 130:13 133:13,15 134:2
                                 opened 142:3
 134:5,8,8,9,16,24 135:5
 137:20,21 139:17,25 140:17,20
                                 operate 173:23
 141:4,16 142:13,17,19 143:16
                                 operated 184:12
                                 operating 20:3 38:22 40:2 147:5
 143:25 146:13,24 147:9,13
                                  183:10
 157:23 159:8 160:15,20 161:4
 163:15 164:25 165:3 166:16
                                 operation 72:9 129:5 130:5
```

```
over-produced 152:9
operations 36:14 112:11
operator 17:25 42:8 119:9
                                 over-production 152:6
operators 21:6
                                 owned13:19 67:3 103:4 171:8
opinion 148:15,20 161:25
                                  owner 42:8 87:6
                                  owners 6:12 64:2 67:21
opportunities 45:13,22 52:24
                                  oxides 20:17 21:16
 71:10 72:2
opportunity 6:8 25:9 26:2 27:9
                                  o'clock 4:13 179:15
 34:13,22,24 46:11 58:11 82:7
 86:3 87:4 88:20 90:25 91:16
                                 Pagano 90:19,24
 117:6 146:4 157:4 159:3
                                 page 18:9 185:3
 183:18 184:11
                                 pages 185:4
oppose 144:6
                                 paid 81:15 130:5
opposed 22:19
opposition 23:2
                                 painful 7:11
                                 paint 71:5 167:5,5
optimistic 71:5
option 15:3 16:16,21 30:12
                                 panel 122:24
                                 panels 122:23 124:10,11,11
 73:18 83:16,20 119:15
                                   125:4 154:9,10,24
ordained 172:2
order 12:14 24:19 92:18 162:6
                                 panic 94:4
                                 pantry 10:2
 163:2
orders 151:2
                                 Paper 123:25
organization 51:12 111:10
                                 parameters 27:11
                                 parents 84:14
organizations 51:12 139:23,25
organization's 108:10
                                 park 125:11
                                 parked 125:2
original 148:2
                                 parking 125:2,5
originally 159:19
                                 part 29:6 31:25 34:20 68:8,25
Oswego 137:23
                                   71:15 75:21 77:25 78:4 88:5
outages 68:6 76:13,22
                                   89:12 92:2 101:18 102:9,10
outbid 166:25 167:2
                                   106:9 173:4 179:16,21 180:2
outcome 121:25 160:12
outcomes 7:25
                                   180:14
                                 partially 148:20
outline 124:3
                                 particular 47:17 48:6,7
outlined 18:3 19:13 21:10
                                 particularly 8:16 157:8 158:5
output 153:12
                                   180:2
outright 15:9
                                 particulates 20:18 21:16
outside 25:6 111:21 176:22
                                 partner 105:9 146:14
out-migration 98:7
                                 parts 96:12 169:21 173:14
out-of-state 7:14 24:13
                                 party 47:25 48:2 62:22
overall 19:23 33:3 54:8,17
 162:4
                                 pass 43:17
                                 passed 61:2 63:11
overburdened 9:2
overflow 27:20
                                 passion 157:13
overhead 125:4
                                 path 73:24
                                 patient 133:11
overlooked 72:11
                                 patients 151:3
overnight 140:4
                                 Paul 90:23 93:16
overseas 152:20 166:22
overstated 36:18
                                 paving 117:13
overwhelming 24:25 27:4 157:25
                                 Pawlak 127:2 137:14,17,19 138:4
                                 pay 5:25 17:22 22:17 65:6 72:25
 158:4
                                   114:17,19 124:17 128:23
overwhelmingly 26:17 160:8
```

```
129:13 142:21,22 144:6 154:9
                                  181:10
 154:11 162:9 171:8 176:7
                                 permit 174:10,11
 182:10
                                 persevered 87:24
paying 59:22 106:18
                                 person 4:9 39:3 155:9
payment 8:13 28:21 38:19 39:19
                                 personal 25:8 47:6 55:5 82:16
 39:24 52:17 68:23
                                  138:24
payments 28:21, 23 36:7 41:13
                                 personally 44:2 47:11 65:6
 48:20 49:21 57:5,7 120:24
                                  170:8
payroll 72:23
                                 personnel 129:12
pays 9:3 70:21 144:21 152:23
                                 perspective 159:13,14
Peace 122:5
                                 Phil 55:16,22
peers 84:25
                                 Philippines 171:3
Pennsylvania 11:15 18:8,14
                                 Phillips 83:2 88:22
 19:15 21:24 24:2,10,13 30:10
                                 phone 141:21
 31:23 43:5 59:5 64:20,24
                                 phonetic 5:10
 67:23 74:14 111:25 112:6
                                 photons 126:14
                                 physically 83:21
 118:21 119:2,11 123:17 136:22
                                 pick 128:23
 144:24 170:12
Pennsylvania's 24:4
                                 picture 71:5 128:13
people 4:20 5:8,23 6:23 8:19
                                 pig 93:8,9
 10:23 23:15 25:12 27:19,21
                                 PILOT 28:20 39:19,24 41:13
 29:14 33:11 44:8,20 47:16
                                  56:18,20,25 81:11 92:12 103:4
 48:13,23 49:5 62:13 64:14
                                  103:10 114:7 158:21
 65:8 71:7 73:6,8,9 76:6 81:8
                                 pipe 79:23
 91:7 95:3,4,9 97:22,22 98:5
                                 pipeline 123:12 136:19,19 137:4
 101:4 105:2,5 106:18,19 107:2
                                  166:24
 107:5,11 109:25 114:18 125:23
                                 pipelines 52:7
                                 place 14:8 49:3,13 90:8 97:15
 126:18 128:13 130:2 131:20
 133:5 139:6 142:2 144:24
                                  98:23 112:9 121:17 147:11,13
 145:4 151:17 154:8 156:8,20
                                  156:21 185:3
                                 places 51:6 64:20 98:8 131:19
 157:12,15 158:12 160:5,17,18
 161:2 162:12 168:16 171:6
                                 plan 21:10 22:15 23:8,25 37:16
 172:13 176:11,21 177:11 178:2
                                  42:13 46:3,7 61:2 92:8,9
 181:6,14 182:2,8 183:25
                                  109:12 124:3 138:3 159:18
percent 8:24 9:7,8 17:2 20:16
                                  163:15
 20:16,17,18,19 28:13 36:20
                                 planned 20:6
 38:21,22,25 41:9,15 62:15,16
                                 planning 80:11 94:17 105:14
 62:18 63:21 89:21 92:6 94:23
                                  116:4 123:17,23
 115:11,12 116:3 130:6,7
                                 plant2:11 6:21 7:6,16,22 8:2,4
 135:17 140:3 147:5 149:9
                                  11:8,20,23 14:8 17:5 19:6
 152:19 154:6 160:18 165:22
                                  21:4 28:12,13,19 29:18 30:8
 173:6 174:6
                                  31:8,19 32:15 38:16 42:3,25
                                  43:8,13 55:6,7 58:20 63:16,25
percentage 175:21
perfect 12:22 127:23 128:4
                                  64:6 65:17 67:3 68:7 69:4
perfectly 47:14
                                  72:7,10,12,19 73:15 79:2
                                  80:23 83:17 86:17 87:20,22
performance 84:21
performing 71:17,18
                                  89:10 92:9 93:24 94:22 95:6,9
                                  99:13,16,17,21 100:9 102:6
period 14:24 15:13 28:5 45:24
 86:14
                                  103:16,18,23 106:8,11,21
                                  108:24 109:7,11,14 110:10
permanent12:8 28:6 42:21
```

```
114:8,20 116:10,24 117:19,21
                                 pollutants 21:15
 125:9 133:15,17,19 134:2,10
                                 pollute 86:7
 134:16,16,24 135:3,9,22 136:4
                                 pollution 19:17 28:18 117:11
 137:23 138:8 139:25 144:9,12
                                  124:15 137:12 144:24,25
 144:19 145:6,11,12 146:9
                                 ponder 69:17
 148:5,16 152:2,12 154:23
                                 poorest 98:5
 155:8,17 156:3 162:2 163:13
                                 poorly 150:17
 163:24 165:4,13 167:12 168:22
                                 popular 92:24 136:9,21
 170:7 173:10 174:7,8 175:18
                                 population 41:18 43:16 45:23
 175:21,22 176:3,12 178:15
                                  56:5 71:6 108:21 115:13,13
 181:16,16,20,21,24 182:19
                                  130:2
                                 Port 168:11,22 169:3
 183:3,9,11,20 184:12
plants 12:15 19:16 29:19 30:5
                                 portfolio 117:12
 52:5,7 53:16 54:9,10 68:19
                                 portion 179:14 180:3
 102:15 107:6 112:3 118:25
                                 Posing 69:16
 119:3 122:22 152:12 154:19
                                 position 75:18 92:25 96:22
                                  127:13
 172:19
plastic 162:7
                                 positions 39:11,13 84:19 85:4
play 43:24 121:13
                                  86:11
                                 positive 28:9 31:3 36:16 37:20
playing 67:20
plays 94:5
                                  87:24 147:11,13 165:3,11
Plaza1:13
                                 possibilities 37:20
please 3:24 5:2 6:21 25:22
                                 possibility 75:20 96:3,8 183:19
 38:17 40:13 41:24 42:2 65:24
                                 possible 7:5 32:25 36:13 51:11
 74:10 88:8 108:23 109:6,16
                                  56:13 64:24 83:9 141:24
 114:21 116:9 130:10 143:8,9
                                 post 47:23
 147:12 176:25 183:24
                                 posted 3:13 72:22
pleased 2:22 29:13,15 60:24
                                 postpone 141:2
                                 potential 43:23 61:17 67:7
 158:5,19
pleasure 103:17 156:19,22
                                  85:22 98:12 118:6
 157:10 158:6 159:15
                                 Potkovich 66:6,12,22
pledged 91:24
                                 pounds 150:5
pledging 158:11
                                 poverty 8:23 41:15 89:20 115:12
                                 power 7:14 11:8,11,15 12:6,14
plummet 152:11
plus 17:4 120:12
                                  12:16 13:7 15:17,21 17:16,17
                                  19:5,16,22 20:9,24 21:13,20
podium 5:3 57:25
point 8:14,23 14:24 17:2 23:19
                                  21:20 23:12,20 27:6 29:16,22
 29:4 36:20 38:25 41:10 47:5
                                  29:23 30:3,9,11 31:6,7,21
 87:9 89:21 104:2 111:19
                                  33:9 42:20 43:2,4,7,22 48:24
 114:10 122:11 170:5
                                  48:25 49:2 53:16 58:19,20,22
                                  65:4,15 67:6,11,14,16,18,22
pointed 164:15
pole 184:6,8
                                  68:2,6,17,20,20 73:13 76:2,11
                                  76:13,15,16,20 77:7,8 78:16
poles 76:25
police 5:11 6:4 7:13 28:16
                                  79:22 86:16 95:25 100:2,2,4,7
 45:20 101:14 105:21 127:10,11
                                  100:7,10 107:6 111:13,24,25
 129:11 141:25
                                  112:20,21 116:24 117:19,21
policemen 101:13
                                  118:20,24,25 119:10 120:13
                                  122:10,13 124:25 125:15
policy 111:19 156:10
political 172:7
                                  139:20,24 140:7,13 143:25
politician 79:12
                                  144:8 148:4 152:11 156:7,9,11
```

```
101:8 102:7 161:16
 157:15 162:2 165:10,13,21
 167:14 168:21 170:7 171:16,16
                                 problem 23:20 59:6 66:12 105:25
 173:18 181:21
                                   124:24 144:17,17 170:10
                                   171:15 172:15,16 173:9
powered 34:9
powering 61:23 111:16 167:14
                                 problems 57:21 99:20 150:3
Powerpoint 17:23 180:6
                                 proceed 2:19 3:20 93:24
Powlak 133:9,10 135:11,20
                                 proceeding1:4 16:11 164:7
 136:13,17,23 137:2,5
                                 proceedings 185:5
predictability 32:18
                                 process 14:20 37:13 51:9 95:17
prefer 74:13 170:7
                                   95:22 105:22 149:23 160:4
preferred 117:24
                                   169:2 182:13
                                 processes 96:15 118:14
premium 128:4
                                 processing 102:14
preparation 60:3
prepare 85:17
                                 produce 17:16 30:11 36:23 88:14
                                   111:20 126:7
prepared 4:21
                                 produced 19:5 21:13 22:11 29:23
presence 35:6
present 37:12 65:13
                                   31:7
                                 producer 32:13
presentation 13:16 17:23 26:11
 106:5 179:22,25 180:6
                                 produces 61:20 153:9
presented 53:12 57:6 83:15
                                 producing 51:13
 155:16 161:22 163:8 180:7
                                 product 78:13 88:14 151:25
presently 63:20
                                 production 22:20 28:22,22 59:21
                                   62:4 111:17 153:11 173:21
preserve 56:13
                                 Products 169:17
preserves 83:16
                                 profit 163:19
president 5:9 47:16 84:10
 109:22 111:3 112:8,12 115:4
                                 profitable 60:17
 119:18 127:12 146:10 171:22
                                 profits 16:24
press 47:13,15 176:11
                                 program 50:23 51:5,17 56:18,20
                                   56:25 61:3 84:24 92:12 102:18
pressure 112:10
pressures 112:5
                                   104:5 114:7 116:15 122:17
pretty 91:19 103:16 172:3 175:6
                                   123:4 137:20
prevent 164:5
                                 programs 11:2 40:20, 20, 21 51:2
previously 103:4
                                   52:17 53:7 61:7,25 85:3,7,15
                                   85:21
pre-organizing 55:7
price 16:22 17:11 106:16 117:10
                                 progress 87:25 88:6,7 115:15
 118:11 126:14,15 152:5,10,18
                                 project 6:9 12:24 15:25 16:5,6
 154:5 166:2 167:10
                                   27:16,22 28:2,11 30:16,19
                                   31:2,13 63:3 71:2 73:2,12,24
prices 68:8 113:2,3 152:21,25
 153:4,19,23 154:8,15,15
                                   75:9 98:21 109:7 111:18
 155:19
                                   113:24 123:12 157:24 165:4
pride 176:18
                                   178:11,18
primary 163:18
                                 projections 24:23
principal 57:4 115:3
                                 projects 13:6, 7, 12 18:3, 14, 18
                                   22:21 60:20 61:17 108:12
principle 96:10
principles 106:2
                                   118:9 123:22
private 7:13 17:7 31:16 42:17
                                 promise 167:2
 88:3 101:12,16 113:9 152:14
                                 promised 65:22
 159:5
                                 promises 90:15
private-sector 113:4
                                 promote 12:17 27:8 52:2 88:12
probably 64:12 66:17 67:8 80:13
                                   108:11
```

```
10:24 13:13 14:7,16 15:4,9
promoting 90:13
pronouncing 99:4
                                  19:7 24:9,19 26:18 27:5,25
properly 23:22 83:23
                                  28:10 29:11 31:14 34:13 45:22
properties 120:17
                                  49:15,17,19,20,24 50:2,6 52:4
property 7:10 8:16,25 9:6,8,10
                                  52:13 55:4 58:5,16 59:17
 9:22 45:21 57:7,9 83:12 87:5
                                  66:14 67:13 68:4 77:4 79:6
 114:16 161:24 175:12,22 176:6
                                  82:7 83:9 84:5 86:19 99:25
 176:9,10
                                  100:24 101:12 104:14 110:25
proposal 14:7 15:8,20 20:2,13
                                  117:23 120:9 124:2 125:11
 21:12 33:18,19 35:3 37:24
                                  130:15 144:14,19,20,21 147:8
                                  156:9 161:13,14 162:17 163:14
 44:6 50:16 54:7 60:8 83:15
                                  164:6,16 168:14,25 181:13
propose 16:6 22:10 122:6 159:5
                                  184:15
proposed 18:25 113:25 159:7,19
                                 pulled 140:3
 160:14 163:14
                                 purchase 46:4
proposing 55:10 117:18 136:15
                                 pure 172:9
 136:18
                                 purpose 21:23
prospect 124:18
                                 pursuit 56:11
prosper 70:3
                                 push 58:22
prosperity 25:9 43:21 53:15
                                 pushing 65:9 156:4
prosperous 71:8
                                 put11:21 37:17 38:25 42:13
                                  49:3,13 53:10 57:24 58:9 59:7
protect 86:20
protected 7:20 145:23
                                  59:13 80:21 81:13 93:8 99:17
                                  99:18 142:12 153:14 162:5
protecting 6:6
                                  169:23 174:8
protection 10:24 112:5 178:13
                                 Putnam 45:2 59:10
protections 43:6
                                 puts 52:10 142:16
protector 43:25
protects 117:23
                                 putting17:13 20:20 28:18 58:6
proud 27:13 34:7,8 102:14 133:3
                                  58:8 69:4 173:5
 169:3 178:4
                                 P.A30:14,20
proudest 6:24
                                 P.D.A127:12
proudly 177:25
                                 P.J.M19:14,20,22 20:10 21:11
proven 51:15
                                  21:13 22:15 23:7 24:8 29:22
provide 6:12 13:6 17:10 20:23
                                  29:22
 24:17 30:11 34:14,20 37:20
                                 p.m2:3 33:15
 41:22 52:17 73:5 77:7 78:12
                                 P.S.C16:3,5,25 24:24 43:24
 79:21 80:3 82:19 97:5 117:6
                                  45:5 46:18 47:10 57:7 68:14
 118:11 128:2 157:2 160:20
                                  73:18,23 83:24 84:3 89:9
 164:15
                                  144:22 145:2 160:4
provided 9:15 146:16
                                                Q
provider 70:15 94:6
                                 quality 6:2 10:20 39:15 73:16
provides 32:17 45:10,12 70:20
                                  78:12 88:14 89:22 90:11 98:21
 83:17,19 84:16 96:7
                                  131:22 162:25
providing 5:12 34:13 37:25
                                 question 2:10 14:10 15:19 17:15
 117:2,2 165:7
                                  18:25 21:9,22 24:7 56:17
province 122:16
provision 27:4 109:3
                                  59:23 68:22 69:16 77:5,20
                                  97:9 109:10 135:5 144:16,23
provisions 26:17 29:10
                                  149:21 158:8 179:13
public 1:2,4 2:9,14,16,23 3:2,5
                                 questions 14:16, 17 15:7 16:3
 3:6,6,13,14,18 5:15,15,19,21
```

93:4 133:12,20 149:3 179:25 realistic 77:23 180:10,10,18 realities 162:13 quick 39:21 83:8 reality 20:9 65:8,16 quickly 21:7 87:21 realize 65:12 101:4 104:6,21 132:2 quiet 25:22 realized 43:16 94:14 131:9 quite 14:14 44:20 65:3 92:16,25 149:19 really 64:17 65:14 66:20,21 quote 18:10 27:5 46:14 60:24 76:5,5 79:7 82:11 93:5,5 61:10 91:19 160:2 110:14 123:10 172:16 173:9,16 **quoting** 106:12 174:15 181:18 183:7 rearranging 128:21 R reason 43:15 76:12,12,17 79:16 **radioactive** 132:15 150:16 99:18,18 134:15 173:8 reasonable 34:21 37:7 121:17 rail 169:21 railroad 87:14 169:20 175:18 reasons 82:16 97:11 151:16 railroads 169:23 reassess 96:21 raise 6:21 19:22 33:20 38:24 rebuild 59:8 95:2 129:4 176:23 recalled 170:4 raised 4:15 10:16 23:6 55:8 **receive** 114:6 145:19 94:9,23 114:10,16 121:10 received 3:12 8:3 35:10 141:19 136:8 138:25 139:2 161:10 receiving 7:19 51:22 178:5 recession 72:4,6 91:22 raising 161:11 recipe 9:10 ramifications 164:2,24 recognize 116:23 **ramp** 21:7 recognized 88:17 145:17 **Rand** 169:17 170:23 recognizing 34:14 **Randolph** 138:17 reconductering 18:3,5 58:9 rang 141:21 59:18 Raphael 66:7 69:9 record 2:5 22:18 30:4 47:10 rapidly-changing 111:21 54:3 60:4 66:4 82:20 83:13 **rare** 76:5 127:7 168:24 179:16,23 180:2 rarely 35:20 180:14,17,22 184:18 185:4 rate 8:23 16:25 26:23 58:4 recorded 25:23 180:16 115:12 recording 3:23 ratepayer 12:7 15:24 16:4 17:8 records 184:10 ratepayers 14:4,9 16:4,18 17:6 recourse 24:9 68:3 17:21 18:24 19:10 27:7 30:17 recover 7:7 16:16 130:9 32:12,14,16 33:6,19 112:18 red 22:8 142:6 149:18 117:20,23 143:12 reduce 11:24 73:15 124:14 rates 36:11 37:7 71:11 150:7 135:13 151:25 153:6 reduced 41:16 71:9 ratios 153:12 reducing 20:14 53:5 **reach** 153:19 **reduction** 135:18 166:17 read 29:13 30:20 82:14 86:4 reductions 19:25 166:16 133:14,20 143:23 Reed 46:24,25 50:6 143:5 reading 85:12 referred 35:4 105:18 **ready** 35:21 referring 138:3 real 7:15 16:21 35:13 38:11,12 refining 151:6 38:18 39:2 69:6 120:12 162:5 **reflect** 180:20 164:3 171:15 reflected 30:13

```
refuse 49:13
                                 remain 56:8 93:23 154:15 165:2
regard 103:2
                                  173:11 180:22
regarding 2:6 14:7 35:11 45:5,7
                                 remains 117:19
                                 remarks 2:18 3:8 54:22 70:24
 47:8 111:16
regardless 160:12
                                  156:22
                                 remedial 85:12,12
regards 55:5
regenerate 64:5
                                 remember 63:3 75:23 76:4 77:12
Regents 41:3
                                  98:12 127:6 135:15 181:17
region 4:16 5:7 12:18 24:21
                                  183:24
 25:10 36:17 43:2,3 68:24 69:6
                                 remind 65:21 82:15
 71:5 73:11 76:21 77:7 90:8
                                 remove 98:10,11 109:2
 108:8,15,19 109:8 128:13
                                 removing 124:19 176:3
 129:3 139:19 140:11 141:6
                                 renew 179:3
 148:25 151:14
                                 renewable 13:5 20:23 22:21
regional 21:21 31:24 35:8 52:19
                                  50:19,25 51:8,13,16 52:2,22
 52:21,25 70:15 81:22 108:5,12
                                  53:2 60:9,16,18,20 61:21
 109:7 134:19 140:18 182:19
                                  65:15 96:15 116:21 118:5,6
                                  122:8,8,15,16 124:5 125:19
region's 13:22
                                  140:4,9,11,16 149:9 153:22
regrowth 69:23
                                  154:15 178:17
reas 119:8
regulate 132:5
                                 renewables 50:19 77:24 78:3,9
regulation 144:25
                                  117:14 118:10,12 126:4 149:10
regulations 119:6
                                  155:6,23
                                 renewal 56:19 87:22
regulators 43:25
regulatory 112:4
                                 renown 71:21
reimburse 68:23
                                 rep 66:23 99:9,11,15
reinforce 35:13
                                 repeatedly 158:15
reinforcements 1:5 2:7
                                 repeating 130:11
Reininga 113:18 119:17,18
                                 replace 109:12
reinvent 102:13
                                 replaced 67:25
                                 replacing 54:19
reinvest 96:21,23
reinvigorating 72:3
                                 report 14:21 16:11 18:9 19:25
                                  30:20,21
reject 52:5
rejected 15:8
                                 reported 185:3
related 22:3 76:23
                                 Reporter 185:8
relates 27:2
                                 reports 15:23
relating 26:18
                                 repower 11:19 15:2 26:12 42:14
                                  46:10 56:23 63:15 69:6 70:4
relation 9:4
relevant 164:21
                                  74:10 86:22 95:6,13 101:22
reliability 13:2, 11 14:23 15:11
                                  109:16 110:11 113:10 120:22
 24:11 67:6 75:18 77:5 102:21
                                  121:4,23 130:13,21 135:6,12
 124:22
                                  139:9 140:12,17 141:16 143:16
reliable 6:10 12:2 17:11 37:5
                                  155:17 160:15 168:21 169:7,7
 42:25 73:13 76:21 79:22 83:20
                                  169:7 179:2
 102:17 113:8 139:19 148:11
                                 repowered 12:20 21:4
reliance 7:14 23:9 60:11
                                 repowering 1:5 2:6,11 6:20 7:25
relief 142:14
                                  11:20 17:10 18:16 19:19 20:13
                                  20:22,22 22:3,9,13 23:2 24:23
relocate 89:25
relocating 75:20
                                  25:4,7,8,13 27:2 35:4,7,11,16
                                  37:2,4,19,23 38:16 42:3,15
rely 102:16
```

```
47:3,8,14 48:3,15 50:7 63:2
                                  158:13,14
 64:23 68:25 69:22 71:2 72:7
                                 respond 158:13
 73:2,12,17,19,23 75:9 83:14
                                 response 14:18 112:21 159:24
 83:20 86:15 89:10 93:24 98:21
                                 responsibility 104:9 143:2,12
 106:7 109:6 110:15 111:13
                                  145:3,12 163:19
 113:24 116:10,23 119:12
                                 responsible 25:11 77:18 83:21
 139:17 141:3 148:4 149:4,5
                                  165:7
 152:2 157:23 160:19 161:4
                                 responsiveness 5:20
 163:12 166:16 167:7 168:17,20
                                 rest 41:7 44:20 49:9 65:18
 168:22 169:2 170:6
                                  100:24 139:9 145:7 152:23
represent 5:6 38:6 84:8 99:8
                                  159:4 165:5 168:11
 109:24 139:13 177:25
                                 restart 179:3
representation 101:5
                                 restate 159:12
representative 56:24 93:20
                                 restrictions 67:22 173:22
representatives 47:18,21 101:10
                                 result 30:16 109:16 111:24
 101:15 155:13 180:4,13
                                  118:20 129:20 152:16
represented 6:25 104:11 157:20
                                 resulted 108:20
representing 2:23 41:25 70:11
                                 results 128:12,14
 91:5 108:7 127:12 147:21
                                 retail 87:22
 156:20 157:20 158:10
                                 retain 139:21 173:12
represents 38:21 50:12 111:10
                                 retention 80:15 165:6
 178:11
                                 retire 154:18
                                 retired 20:6 57:19 113:22
reprocessing 165:4
Republic 129:19
                                 retiring 90:3
                                 return 4:17 17:2 61:24 159:3
Republican 61:5
republicans 47:24 101:17
                                 Reva 83:4 88:23 89:6
request 77:3 84:3
                                 revenue 8:7 12:9 27:8 28:14
requested 58:4
                                  36:21 38:22,23 41:11,21 45:17
require 52:7 118:12 175:21
                                  73:5 84:16,18 94:24 109:13
required 19:8 21:12 24:18
                                  115:7 130:7 181:11
                                 revenues 40:6 54:19
requirement 15:5,10
requirements 12:5 24:24
                                 reverse 67:7 119:10
researched 162:21
                                 review 41:3 71:4
                                 reviewed 35:10
reserves 152:19
reside 45:2 70:11
                                 revise 19:8
resident 45:5 55:22 56:3 60:6
                                 revitalization 73:20,25
 62:7 74:6 75:14 77:14 83:11
                                 revitalize 176:9
 87:5 100:25 104:14 131:5
                                 reworked 18:22
 133:10 144:3 168:10,11 169:15
                                 Reynolds 74:17,22,23
                                 re-tool 92:23
                                 RGGI 21:23 22:17 31:25 67:21
residential 10:8 37:6 76:14
residents 8:18 25:3 27:15 34:10
                                  68:10
 34:21 37:22 46:18 54:10,11,17
                                 Richard 143:18 144:2
 55:9 70:21 71:10 73:5 88:19
                                 richer 131:17
 92:12,13 108:22 176:16,17
                                 rid 60:14 64:3
resides 75:7
                                 right 11:11 17:14 30:6 33:25,25
resilience 71:15
                                  38:13 43:22 46:13 54:11 73:22
                                  77:13 78:18 79:2,14 82:4 83:5
resolution 3:20
resource 141:24
                                  88:24,25 89:3 93:16 97:11
resources 21:3,5 45:19 80:2
                                  100:3 112:22 116:12 120:5
```

```
121:24 125:22 131:24 133:2
                                  sacrifice 106:18,19
 134:16,21 135:9,11 136:9,13
                                  sacrificed 92:15 105:25
 136:17 139:11 149:3,4 167:17
                                  sacrifices 11:4
 167:18 171:21 173:20 177:23
                                  sacrificial 54:12
rightfully 49:16
                                  sadness 181:5
Riley 168:5,7,9
                                 safe 11:25 37:5 60:17 134:17,19
Ripley 182:14
                                   148:7,11
ripple 164:3
                                 safequard 11:4
rise 36:11 176:6
                                 sagged 23:21
rises 21:7
                                 sake 110:22
                                  sale 75:22
rising 155:18
risk 118:14
                                  salvation 11:19
risks 164:12
                                  Sam 54:2
risky 23:12 52:6,6
                                  Samsung 122:20,25 123:5
Rita 168:3
                                 sand 150:2
rivers 150:17 166:8
                                 Sandra 126:25
road 45:2 58:12 59:10 62:23
                                  sat 99:23 134:13
                                  save 11:21 28:5 30:19 114:21
 89:7 108:3 115:2 116:5 182:12
roads 151:13
                                   130:23 133:6
Road/Homer 18:4 19:12
                                  savings 30:16,22,24 119:19
Robert 55:20 62:20,21 74:20
                                  saw 133:5
 79:11 165:15,16
                                 saying 49:9 93:7 100:6 106:15
Rochester 2:21
                                   106:17 119:13 171:22 173:5
rock 66:20 113:16 115:2 152:21
                                   176:18
                                 Sayre 1:15 2:16, 18, 20, 21 3:10
rodents 129:7
Rodriguez 93:18,19,20
                                   3:19 4:14 5:14 26:4
role 43:24 62:3 94:5
                                 says 9:12 16:10,19 80:21 99:14
Ron 4:23 42:6
                                   100:13 110:10 145:23
roof 155:2
                                 scale 13:5 118:8,8
rooftop 124:9
                                 scenario 129:16
rooftops 156:12
                                  schedule 68:23 94:13
room 1:10 4:4 6:19 27:20 29:14
                                  scheduled 112:20
 127:19 156:8 169:4 182:9
                                  scheduling 112:7
roots 128:24 168:21
                                  school 6:2 7:11 8:11 9:6 10:17
roughly 122:10
                                   10:18 28:8,24 36:8 37:18 38:5
                                   38:13,14,20 39:12 40:22 41:2
Route 129:17 132:21 175:17,22
                                   48:19 49:23 56:21 69:11 72:15
Ruhlman 169:11, 12, 15 174:12, 13
                                   84:17 85:2 90:12 93:21 94:11
 174:17
rules 134:14
                                   94:13 95:13 101:12 109:4,23
ruling 87:25 88:6
                                   113:23 114:9,15 115:3,10,10
rulings 112:21
                                   115:15,16 116:11 140:21
run 50:23 137:21 153:16 163:23
                                   158:22 161:13,14,18,19 182:15
running141:12 181:13
                                   182:16
                                 schools 38:5 51:11 56:4 71:18
rural 149:24
rust 130:12
                                   114:6,13 165:8 182:12
                                  science 85:10
               S
                                  Scientific 60:12
s8:13 20:2 24:23,24 30:21
                                  scores 115:16
 33:18 36:15 77:25 84:2 88:2
                                 Scott 82:18
 92:8,12 116:19 134:8 178:15
                                  screaming 55:11
```

```
serve 84:4 92:10 111:4 170:25
scripted 46:20
                                 service1:2 2:14,16,23 3:13,18
sea 63:8
Sean 82:23 83:7
                                   5:19 13:2,13 14:7,16 15:4,10
second 27:19 39:10 50:24 76:8
                                   16:2 19:7 23:23 24:9,19 26:18
 82:4 85:11 99:13 122:14
                                   27:25 28:11 29:11 31:14 44:3
 141:21 179:20
                                   49:15 50:6 52:4 55:5 58:5,16
secondary 47:23,23
                                   59:18 66:14 67:13 68:4 75:19
sector 7:13 42:18
                                   77:4,5 79:6 82:8 86:19 99:25
sectors 71:13
                                   100:24 104:14 110:25 120:25
secure 37:5
                                   124:3 130:15 136:20 144:14,19
                                   147:8 168:14,25
secured 7:21
security 5:12 49:19 53:15,20
                                 services 7:12,20 8:8 10:22 11:6
 99:17 137:11 181:16
                                   36:12,24 37:6 45:20 70:15,19
Sedyscyv 99:6,7 181:15
                                   71:25 73:5 85:13 89:15,18
see 5:22 12:20 24:25 25:5 26:7
                                   109:4 130:4 161:17
 37:8 48:8 56:19 66:4 79:13
                                 session 26:15
 87:24 99:5,15 101:24 103:9
                                 set 115:17 150:2 167:21 184:9
 108:13 121:18 134:7 143:6
                                 sets 29:10
 146:9 153:23 164:13,17 172:14
                                 settle 99:20
                                 seven 18:6 41:9 50:3 74:25
 173:10
seeing 127:19 147:25
                                   123:20 125:25 150:20 154:19
seekers 6:8
                                   174:18 179:15
seeking 71:10 182:13
                                 seventeen 40:16 102:6 124:4
seen 10:11 56:3 89:12 96:11
                                 seventy 39:7 86:12 115:11 131:5
 97:10 154:8 157:11
                                 seventy-five 174:2 183:23
segment 104:11
                                 seventy-one 123:21
self-sufficient 45:14
                                 seventy-three 20:19
sell 59:4 99:24
                                 seven-thirty 179:16
seller's 166:23,24
                                 severe 108:20
selling 42:19 131:18
                                 severely 109:15
semesters 162:19
                                 shackle 117:9
Sempolinski 44:13 46:22,23
                                 shadow 47:12
senate 5:6 12:4 26:16 60:25
                                 shaking 10:6
 61:5
                                 Shale 22:11
senator 4:21,25 5:2,4,5 25:11
                                 share 19:16 40:12,13 72:25
 25:16 26:21 29:4 60:23 61:11
                                   114:6 119:24 156:21 162:24
 62:10 91:4 143:3 167:20
                                 shared 54:16 117:24
 168:15
                                 shareholders 163:17,18,20
senators 104:18
                                 sharp 19:17
sending 182:15
                                 Shearer 138:19,20,21
senior 5:24 9:21 94:10,18 104:6
                                 shed 84:12
 163:6
                                 sheet 82:18
seniors 11:3 145:4
                                 Sheila 90:20 93:12
sense 56:15,15 138:5 151:23
                                 shell 120:11 150:12
sensible 83:20
                                 shelters 142:4
sensitivity 124:23,24
                                 Sheridan 39:7
sent 78:17
                                 sheriffs 101:13,13
serious 8:15 14:19 21:18 31:9
                                 sheriff's 5:12
 31:10 49:12 164:24
                                 shine 7:4
servants 164:16
                                 shines 126:10
```

```
sixty-eight 123:16
shit 172:9
shore 47:12 81:14 118:7,8
                                 sixty-five 41:15 81:15
 119:19 121:2
                                 sixty-nine 169:24
short 15:3 35:16 129:16
                                 sixty-one 58:6
Short-term 52:16
                                 sixty-seven 41:7 51:23
shoulders 10:5
                                 sixty-six16:10 17:21 130:6
show 60:12 145:15 153:17 177:21
                                 sixty-three 125:7 175:8
showed 6:13 99:14
                                 sixty-two 58:7
showing 15:10 145:12 158:11
                                 size 39:14 57:21,23 58:17 155:3
shown 12:11 84:5 105:9 150:14
                                   174:6
shows 22:19 119:9
                                 sized 173:25
shut 28:12 30:7 49:12
                                 Skelos 60:24
side 64:23 121:5 139:12 150:24
                                 skill 185:5
sides 105:3
                                 skirted 93:3
sidings 169:24
                                 skyrocketing 9:8 112:25
Sierra 22:14,18,18,22 29:17
                                 slash 57:16
 50:11,15 51:4 54:3,4 65:7
                                 slight 64:25
 78:6 105:23
                                 slowed 63:24
signed 4:8 26:22 33:12 103:5,11
                                 slowly 3:25 166:6
 150:25 171:25
                                 small 6:12 10:13 45:21 70:19
                                   72:16 118:8 175:21
signed-on 22:23
signers 172:2
                                 smart 53:8
significance 108:12
                                 smell 135:25
significant 20:14 35:7 36:12
                                 Smith 113:17 116:14,15
 37:9 88:5 112:15 140:24
                                 smokestack 173:20
 172:23
                                 smokestacks 133:18  166:10
significantly 172:24 178:16
                                 snake 106:3
Silver 108:2 141:22
                                 SNAP 89:18
similar 121:2 169:2
                                 snow 76:24
simple 69:6 112:15 172:10
                                 sob 10:5
simply 9:19 22:13 37:17 42:18
                                 social 39:20 85:9 161:17
 77:8 84:2 129:5,13
                                 societal 151:10
simultaneously 53:18 112:13
                                 society 164:11
                                 solar 20:24 50:22 61:2,8,12,16
sincerely 5:16 165:12
single 4:9 48:3 87:10 128:20
                                   107:3 117:15 118:9 122:23
                                   123:12,24 124:7,9,10,10,11
 159:9
sir106:15,22 142:22
                                   125:4,6,10,19 126:6,12,17,18
                                   153:24 154:4,5,9,20,24 155:4
sit 129:6
site 3:13 176:4 183:12
                                   167:22
sites 166:8
                                 sold 51:13 153:2 171:12
                                 solution 11:18 14:22 57:20 59:6
sits 134:16
sitting 182:9
                                   178:21
situation 24:14 41:8 43:3 65:8
                                 solutions 15:5 53:14
 112:15
                                 somebody 38:10 105:4 161:8
six14:25 18:7 40:14 51:21
                                   172:17
 63:13 81:10,13 119:22 120:19
                                 someday 65:14
 121:9 129:25 132:14 152:24
                                 someplace 170:14
 179:15
                                 Somerset 118:24
sixth 121:6
                                 soon 90:4 121:6 154:23 155:5
sixty 151:22
                                   161:3
```

```
St157:6 172:21
sooner 33:21
                                 stability 27:8 32:17 37:19
soot 30:10
sorry 9:17 34:2,3 55:19 66:11
                                  70:25 72:8 102:22 103:7
 92:23 165:4 174:14,17,18
                                  118:12
                                 stabilize 11:21 28:7
sound 83:25
                                 stable 6:10 7:17 9:14 42:21
sounds 177:4
source 32:8 46:12 65:15 73:13
                                  45:10 51:24 61:14 72:10
 147:23 155:21 164:4 165:8
                                 staff 38:15 84:22 85:21
sources 52:18 140:16 148:2
                                 stage 149:23 167:21
 153:23
                                 stages 123:23 151:5
south 129:18 175:16,22
                                 staggering 23:19 69:5 85:4
southern 98:3 111:6
                                 stagnation 43:19
southwestern 142:6
                                 stake 25:8
Soviet 181:25
                                 stakeholders 37:10
space 176:7
                                 Stalin 105:17
Spartan 169:18 173:24
                                 stall 110:21
speak 3:25 4:8 33:12 41:17 74:9
                                 stand 38:6 110:2 117:7 178:7,8
 87:4 89:5 90:25 91:17 93:22
                                 standard 2:25 90:5 115:17
 100:25 112:22 133:5 146:4
                                 standards 17:19 31:22 32:2,4
 160:16 161:9 162:11,12,13
                                 standing 48:2
 168:17 169:6 177:11
                                 standing-room-only 27:18
SPEAKER 131:11
                                 stands 16:23 178:10
speakers 4:7 38:9 44:11 55:15
                                 start 4:8 44:17 69:23 76:17
 65:23 66:5 74:16 90:18 91:2
                                  77:19 92:3 95:10 116:4 128:24
 102:3 113:14 126:23 138:15
                                  149:12 152:20,22 159:17
speaking 9:20 45:4 54:4 149:18
                                 started 57:17 87:17 152:12
special 41:18,18
                                  170:23
specific 45:8 180:18
                                 starting 137:22 138:8
specifically2:10 24:20 26:23
                                 starts 166:22
 77:16 169:21
                                 starving 145:5
spectrum 97:19
                                 state1:2,13 2:14 3:24 5:11
speeches 96:13
                                  11:15 12:3,12 13:21 14:2
spell 99:3
                                  15:15 16:7 17:24 18:7 19:13
                                  21:10,20,23 22:5 23:11 24:6
spelling 5:10
spend 101:6 176:24
                                  24:11 25:10 26:6,16,16 27:3,8
                                  29:20 30:17 31:5,8 32:16,19
spending 36:2
spent 8:8 81:5,9 134:9 179:9
                                  32:20 33:20 35:21 40:2,3 43:4
                                  43:16 44:6 47:19 48:23 49:4
spike 9:16
spills 151:11
                                  49:20 50:21 53:17 54:8,18
spinning 67:6
                                  56:11,12 59:19 60:25 61:8,22
                                  61:23,24 62:13 63:5 64:18
spin-offs 35:18
spoke 44:21 157:22 158:7
                                  65:10,16,19 67:5,12,14 68:4
spoken 82:11 115:22
                                  68:22 69:3,4,15 70:22 71:20
sponsor 146:25
                                  74:13 76:22 78:6 79:2,10,14
spots 153:8
                                  79:24 82:2 86:17 88:17 91:23
spring 59:11
                                  94:4 96:24 101:10,14 104:17
spur 52:23
                                  105:5,21 111:13,18,20 113:5
square 174:3
                                  114:3 115:16,17,18 116:25
squeeze 167:15
                                  117:8 118:17 119:11 123:9,11
                                  123:14,23,24 124:4,15 125:16
squelch 150:24
```

```
125:18,22 127:6 128:10,17
                                 strategy 141:16
 134:4 137:22 138:7 140:10
                                 stream 36:21
 141:2,7 144:3,13 145:16,23
                                 Street 55:3 70:13 175:5
 148:7 151:19,22,24 154:17
                                 streets 64:14 183:15
 155:12 157:6 185:2
                                 stress 164:18,20
stated 14:21 15:4 91:3 148:18
                                 strict 43:6
 185:3
                                 strictly 67:16
statement1:4 2:9 20:8 26:25
                                 strong 34:19 140:6,11
 46:14,15 47:8 53:22 111:17
                                 strongly 29:7 77:4 83:24 86:19
statements 46:20 148:15,17
                                   116:9 119:14 170:21
 150:25 184:16
                                 struggle 8:19 41:19 130:9
states 18:10 23:13,15 27:5
                                 struggles 84:20 128:7
 31:21 46:24 49:5,18 50:5
                                 struggling 5:25 68:8,9
 67:23 68:2,5,21 111:24 118:17
                                 stuck 110:18
 119:2 136:21 151:21 183:13
                                 student 84:21 93:20
statewide 54:16 82:5
                                 students 6:7 41:16,21,23 71:17
state's 23:24 27:9 31:18 37:6
                                   84:23,24 85:8,16,19 86:20
 37:16 111:19,22 117:11
                                   95:12 182:15
state-imposed 68:10
                                 studies 39:20 60:12 85:10
state-of 113:7
                                   150:13
state-of-the-art 29:24 30:8
                                 subject 21:21 43:5 67:20 111:21
 92:9 117:18 140:14
                                 subjected 112:24
station 11:20 42:14 71:3 73:11
                                 submission 19:7 21:19
 76:20 103:2
                                 submit 54:6
stations 77:18
                                 submitted 29:18 47:10
statistics 71:4,14 119:25
                                 subscribed 185:6
statute 29:10 80:15 160:22
                                 subsidies 107:10 163:17,22
statutory 26:17, 20 27:11 160:24
                                 subsidized 32:14
stay 40:22 63:14 80:21 81:19
                                 subsidy 107:13
 92:16 108:14 129:5 134:6
                                 substantial 120:20 164:4
 152:25
                                 substantially 135:13
stayed 81:18 157:13 161:8
                                 substation 19:2
                                 substitute 170:9
stays 106:17
                                 success 85:8 183:4
steam 103:2
steel 87:21 102:6 129:19,19,20
                                 successful 50:22
                                 suffer 69:20 85:19,20 94:2
 129:25 130:6
steelworkers 102:8
                                 suffered 10:9 71:6 91:21
Stegar 127:4
                                 suggest 140:2
step 49:7,8
                                 suggestion 148:25
steps 61:6
                                 suitable 156:9
Steve 129:22
                                 sulfur 20:16 21:15 81:5,12
stick 110:20
                                   137:7
                                 Sullivan 179:6,7,8,24 180:9,23
sticking 93:2
stood 47:11 163:6
                                 summary 24:16
stop 130:11 158:16
                                 summer 101:6 168:10
stories 143:9
                                 sun 61:3 126:10
storms 52:13
                                 sunset 125:13
story 59:15 130:20 141:17
                                 SUNY 1:9 5:9 125:5
 171:11
                                 super 12:14
stranded 15:17
                                 superintendent 38:4 41:24 99:13
```

```
23:7 24:8,14 28:8,24 42:23
 115:21
                                  50:16 61:9 76:23 84:17 90:12
supplement 180:19
supplied 137:4 165:23
                                  109:23 113:23 118:2 119:9
supplier 134:19
                                  155:2 164:15 172:16 173:18
supplies 22:10
                                 systematic 170:15
supply 42:22 67:14 76:20 112:14
                                 systems 15:16 152:16 167:23
 112:16 148:8 150:9 152:5
                                 S-E-D-Y-S-C-Y-V 99:3
 153:5
support 6:4 20:23 22:23 25:4
                                 T 179:5
 27:7,15 35:3 37:12,23 38:16
                                 table 155:23
 42:2,13 44:4 46:4 47:3,14
                                 tag 16:22
 50:15,18 56:2 60:7,10 74:13
                                 tainted 73:7
 83:14 93:25 98:20 106:11
                                 take 5:2 14:18 32:5 35:13 49:9
 108:11 109:6 110:14 111:12
                                  61:6 63:21 66:2,16 94:17
 113:9,12 116:10,20,25 118:4
                                  98:23 145:3 147:24 148:23
 119:14 121:19 143:15 145:18
                                  156:12 160:4,23 170:24 171:6
 146:15 147:2,3 148:19 158:11
                                  174:10 175:2 177:4 181:21
 158:12 159:19 160:19 178:23
supported 29:8 112:13 142:13
                                  182:24
                                 taken 94:19 99:12 101:5 132:19
 146:19 147:7
                                  169:5 184:15
supporting 73:17,18 105:21
                                 talent 72:3
 162:16 168:15
                                 talk 106:7 110:3 149:21
supports 75:5
                                 talked 10:5 57:3 175:13,16
sure 24:22 53:23 81:24 82:8
                                 talking 77:23 85:5 107:3 128:11
 101:20 106:16 110:16 144:21
                                  128:19 142:15
 180:18 183:15
                                 Tampio 100:19 107:25 108:2
surely 76:11 121:18
                                 tank 132:15
surface 148:12 150:15
surprised 75:23 155:11
                                 Tapasto 126:25
                                 target 181:20
surprising 22:14
                                 tariff 50:23 51:5,10,17 122:18
surrounded 176:13
                                  123:11,15
surrounding 34:22 86:22 97:25
                                 taste 136:2
                                 tax 6:10 7:10,17 8:7 9:2,10,14
survive 10:2 73:21 134:22
                                  9:14 10:11,11,16 11:17,21
Susan 113:15 177:15
                                  12:9 21:22 23:10 27:8 28:7,14
Susie 90:22 93:15
                                  28:21 36:6 45:10,17 48:21
suspect 43:2 173:3
                                  52:15,16 54:19 57:7,9 58:20
suspected 181:23
                                  58:24,24 63:21 72:10,18 83:18
sustain 45:20 57:8 72:18
sustainability 77:24 78:4
                                  102:9 108:22 109:2 114:8,12
                                  120:23,24 121:18 130:3 134:2
sustainable 13:4 119:15
                                  140:19,24 144:10 164:4 178:12
sustained 120:23
                                  181:10
sustaining 108:25
                                 taxes 6:2 8:14 9:4,6,8,15,23
Suzanne 113:20,22
                                  10:15 36:10 38:20,25 45:11
Swamp 59:13
                                  52:17 55:8 62:17 64:7,11,18
sweet 153:8
switch 16:15 140:2 183:16
                                  68:24 70:22,23 72:18,25 89:23
                                  90:2 92:6,14 94:9,20,22 95:3
sympathizers 105:18
                                  114:9,16,19 120:12 129:4,9
system 11:25 13:2 17:24 18:12
                                  130:5 144:7,21 161:25 174:4
 19:14 20:10 21:8,13,24 22:16
```

```
175:23 176:7 178:24
                                  80:6,24 82:10,12 83:8 84:6
taxpayer 8:11,16 42:17 72:14
                                  86:23,24 87:2,3,16 88:20 89:5
                                  90:16,24 91:4,13 93:10 95:15
 83:12 89:8 107:7 114:4 129:2
 131:6 144:3
                                  98:25 100:23 105:11,15 107:24
taxpayers 8:25 10:8 14:9 34:11
                                  109:17 113:12 114:24 116:13
 37:22 48:18 49:22 72:13 73:4
                                  117:5 119:16 121:22 122:2
 107:11 114:10 116:8 121:14
                                  126:21 130:13 131:3 133:7,8,8
 145:19
                                  133:11,21,22 138:13,13 139:14
tax-paying 162:14
                                  141:7 142:17,18,19,22 143:17
teacher 39:20 87:8,8 91:7
                                  145:25 146:3,14 147:14 156:14
                                  161:5,7 165:14 167:25 169:13
 113:22
teachers 6:6 7:18 10:18 38:15
                                  174:19 177:9,17 184:13,17
 39:14,15 40:8 84:8,9,14 85:24
                                 thanking 66:17
 86:18,21 94:7,24 101:12
                                 thanks 44:23 143:3
 109:25 116:2 129:12
                                 thermal 96:3,6,7
teaching 39:11 84:19,22 85:21
                                 the-art 113:8
 86:11 98:13 116:3
                                 thing 48:7 56:7 78:22 110:17
team 5:10 146:16,21 159:4
                                  122:14 128:9 133:3 143:2
technical 35:10 54:22
                                  153:3 159:23 161:22 169:22
                                  170:11 171:10 181:20
technically 153:16
technology 49:14 70:15 85:11
                                 things 41:3 57:2 64:17 65:10
 113:8 140:15
                                  75:7 78:13 81:20 97:19 98:16
telephone 70:17,18 82:20
                                  98:17 99:11 102:16 110:3
tell 71:14 91:9 125:16 126:9
                                  153:24 171:7,9 173:5,19
                                  178:25 182:19 183:3
 132:10 141:13,17 143:9 178:3
                                 think 3:6 4:16 34:2 55:10,25
 181:22
                                  58:17 59:18 63:7 79:17 81:12
telling 99:19
Temple 70:12
                                  85:2 91:6,19 92:8,22 93:3
                                  101:3 109:20 121:23 129:15
temporary 12:8 181:9
tempted 131:20
                                  135:16 136:7 145:15 149:5,7
ten 15:5, 11 38:21, 22 62:13
                                  149:19,20 152:8,9 157:7 162:3
 72:22 170:3
                                  163:24 172:11 173:7,11,16
tend 152:18 177:21
                                 thinking 26:12 76:4 131:16,17
ten-year 15:13
                                 third 76:9 153:3
                                 thirteen 18:9 56:7 61:19 99:9
term 105:19 106:13
terminus 87:13
                                  125:10
terms 38:11,12 39:2 97:13,21,22
                                 thirty 17:3 99:7,22 102:5
 111:19 151:8 162:5 164:3
                                  103:15 123:17 132:8 154:19
terribly 170:21
                                  156:20 160:18 169:20
testament 37:14
                                 thirty-eight 40:8 66:25
testify 26:2 50:15
                                 thirty-five 57:18 120:3,11
testimony 33:15 54:6
                                  121:11 184:15
thank 3:9 5:8,14,16 7:2 25:14
                                 thirty-four 112:19
 25:15,19,24,25 26:4 33:13,21
                                 thirty-nine 55:23,24
 34:12 37:24 38:2 42:4 44:2,9
                                 thirty-seven 63:11 125:23
 44:10 46:21,22 53:20,25 54:22
                                 thirty-six 154:25
 54:24 55:13 57:11,12 59:16
                                 thirty-three 8:21 66:23 171:8
                                 thirty-two 40:9
 61:11 62:5,10,19 65:19 66:15
 66:18 69:7 70:6,8 74:2,8,14
                                 thirty-year 83:12
 74:22 75:11 77:10,19 79:6
                                 thorough 78:21 122:7
```

```
thought 75:3 92:17 102:24
                                  155:9 156:7
 130:19 131:19 134:8 142:7
                                 tolerance 172:12
                                 Tom 46:24 50:6 83:2 88:22 143:5
 157:14
thoughtful 32:6
                                  177:14
thousand 8:22 9:14,17,23 15:17
                                 tomorrow 33:15 82:17
 39:3 40:16,25 41:7 50:4 51:20
                                 tonight 2:15 3:7,12,23 4:8,13
 51:23 56:6,7 62:13 102:8
                                  6:20,23 7:3 9:21 13:9 14:18
 103:18 107:17 111:11 116:19
                                  20:7 27:16 35:2 37:13 38:6,9
 120:5,6,8,12,19 124:11,16,17
                                  47:2 62:11 65:22 70:9,12,24
 125:20,23,24 126:2,5 129:25
                                  82:11 83:9,15 84:5 90:25
 131:12,13,14 132:15 156:20
                                  92:25 93:4,11 95:24 99:11
 160:18 169:24 174:2,5,5
                                  100:25 101:3,8,16,20 104:12
                                  105:16 115:6 130:18 131:9
thousands 51:8 129:22
threat 181:23
                                  141:14,15 142:22 143:14
threaten 10:12 52:13 68:19
                                  147:20 149:18 157:17,17,20
three 1:13 7:22 11:22 17:2,8
                                  159:11 160:8,24 167:21 168:17
 40:9,24 51:23 62:15,18 96:18
                                  177:23 178:3 179:2 180:7
 98:7 102:8,14 103:11 120:2,10
                                  181:8,14,15 182:9,21 183:25
 141:23 142:8 172:19 178:25
                                 tons 150:4,5
 179:9
                                 Tool 169:18 173:24
three-year 28:5 86:14
                                 top 9:10 13:22 106:23 135:16
throw 65:2
                                  170:19
throws 24:2
                                 TOPASTO 130:14 131:13
tie 18:13 22:15
                                 topic 69:18
tied 83:18 176:17
                                 Torain 138:18
tier 111:6
                                 tornado-related 76:24
ties 24:7
                                 total 16:13
till 4:13 65:21,22
                                 totalitarian 105:21
time 4:12 6:24 7:4 10:3 13:23
                                 touch 177:22
 23:16 26:13 28:19 57:25 58:3
                                 tough 83:3 102:4
 58:9 59:17 60:21 61:21,24
                                 tourism 71:24
 65:11 66:13,16 70:8 80:25
                                 tournament 146:23,25
                                 town 39:5,7 62:24 151:19
 84:6 88:25 90:16 91:18 92:11
 92:17 97:12 99:9,10 101:6
                                 towns 151:22
 103:5 112:2 115:24 119:7
                                 toxic 150:6,13,16 151:13
 121:22 122:17 128:11,21
                                 trace 166:8
 129:19 141:21 142:5 145:16,25
                                 track 157:22
 147:24,25 150:14 155:14
                                 tradeoff 131:23
 156:12 162:20 169:5 173:6
                                 traditional 70:17
 179:10 181:3 183:14 185:3
                                 train 134:8
times 102:4,25 143:23 152:24
                                 training 52:20 142:14
 155:2 158:9 164:12
                                 transcribed 3:12
                                 transcript 3:17,22 4:2 25:24
timing 18:17
Tiny 123:19
                                  179:21
title 41:6 146:24
                                 transcription 185:4
today 2:9 44:4 57:8 58:11 66:20
                                 transfer 144:16
 79:7,15 100:12 116:18 117:6,6
                                 transferred 97:2
 160:2 166:12
                                 transferring 23:10 124:18
Todd 100:21 109:19 111:2
                                 transformer 76:25
told10:6 66:6 67:10 137:20,24
                                 transiency 84:21
```

```
transients 129:6
                                 twenty-eight 89:21 116:3 124:8
transition 53:16 117:3 119:2,5
                                  142:20
transmission 1:5 2:7 12:14 14:4
                                 Twenty-first 40:15,25 53:14
 15:16,20 16:9,21 17:16 18:12
                                   78:2 177:2
 19:14 24:2,10,18 31:20 32:21
                                 twenty-five 8:23 27:14 33:11
 32:24 35:11 50:16 59:19,20
                                  120:16 147:4
 60:7 62:3 67:21 68:5,11,15,16
                                 twenty-nine 123:18
 68:19 76:23 77:9 95:23 98:18
                                 twenty-one 177:10
 106:11 116:20 117:13,25 118:2
                                 twenty-one-year-old 128:20
 118:3,19 119:14 124:23,24
                                 Twenty-three 139:2
 167:22 171:17 175:17
                                 twenty-year 158:21
transmit 53:9
                                 two 4:11 8:14 13:14 23:20 28:18
                                   36:20 38:25 41:10 44:22 51:20
transmitted 20:10 57:22
transport 17:17 32:24 59:4
                                  63:8 65:25 71:18 81:10,13
transportation 60:13 81:6
                                  82:2 99:9 103:13 122:10,12
                                  141:22 142:2,9 150:12 151:21
transported 165:24
transports 33:4
                                  152:24 154:23 158:25 160:11
Tranum 100:21 109:19 110:24
                                  162:19 169:16 172:19 174:10
 111:2
                                  175:3
traveled 25:5
                                 two-thirty 141:18
treat 135:22 136:6
                                 typewritten 185:4
treated 135:23 150:17,22
                                 T.R.S 40:4
                                 T.V33:7 145:14
treatment 135:3,22 136:4
trees 23:21
                                                 U
tremendous 28:9 30:16 31:3
 89:25 97:24 118:6 120:13
                                 U143:21
                                 ultimately 183:9
 146:14
                                 unable 180:17
trickle 97:23
                                 unacceptable 118:14
tried 55:11 160:9
                                 unanimous 61:12
trimmed 23:22
                                 unanimously 60:25
troopers 5:11
                                 unavailable 67:25
trucking 33:7 175:19
true 19:10 32:12 133:16 134:12
                                 unbelievable 129:4
                                 underestimated 18:21
 137:17 155:10 166:6 170:13
                                 undergraduate 162:20
 185:4
                                 undermine 113:3 140:18 172:15
truly 7:4 84:4 109:7
                                 understand 80:9 106:25 110:8
truth 118:22
try 4:10 22:2 65:24 157:13
                                  163:5,7,14 166:6 167:2,10
                                  171:14
 172:15 174:15,21
                                 understanding 73:10
trying 65:2 96:20 164:18 173:23
                                 understands 61:6
Tua 50:21
                                 undoubtedly 36:11 140:23
turbines 50:20 81:8 107:7
turn 2:17 10:7 54:21 91:25
                                 unemployed 95:10 129:9 165:19
                                 unemployment 71:11
 126:16
                                 unequivocal 26:25 47:2
turning 171:16
turns 81:7
                                 unequivocally 111:12
                                 unfair 21:25 68:3
twelve 51:24 179:9
                                 unfold 160:4
twenty 16:13 51:19,20 56:6
                                 unfortunately14:6 23:13 85:14
 126:8,18 152:19 161:10 174:5
 174:15 177:11
                                  128:3 139:22 140:24
```

```
unfulfilled 87:23
                                 Valerie 127:2 133:9
unfunded 40:3 115:20
                                 Valley 132:7, 11, 13, 21
UNIDENTIFIED 131:11
                                 Vallone 113:16 114:25 115:2
                                 value 9:4,13,15 97:24 120:7
unintended 32:22,23
                                   153:16
union 52:24 66:23 99:9,11,15
 101:11 181:25
                                 values 45:21
                                 variability 21:5
unique 157:18
unison 12:21
                                 variety 52:18 82:19
unit 89:16 109:22
                                 various 120:17 149:22
United 13:19 14:11 46:24 49:5
                                 vault 184:6,9
 49:18 50:5 181:24 183:13
                                 vehicle 152:14
units 21:6 22:25 131:18 135:13
                                 vehicles 46:9
university 5:11 69:11 71:20
                                 vendors 36:2 147:3
unknown 24:5
                                 venue 169:13
unnecessary 117:21
                                 verge 72:5
upcoming 5:23 94:13 116:5
                                 Vermont 123:19
upgrade 12:13 134:10 144:16
                                 versus 30:2 153:11 178:17
upgrades 15:12,21 16:9 19:2
                                 veteran 127:10
 24:18 35:11 50:17 77:9 116:20
                                 veterans 11:3
 117:25 118:3 167:23
                                 viability 10:12 24:21 73:18
upgrading 15:15 117:13
                                 vibrancy 35:17
                                 vibrant 140:8
upset 131:8
                                 Vietnam 171:2,2
upstairs 4:4
upstate 12:15 15:22 68:17 123:2
                                 view 111:15 125:12
                                 village 70:23 83:7 91:10 179:11
 123:2
upwind 30:5
                                 villages 2:8 151:22
up-front 16:9,20
                                 Vince 141:8,10
urban 87:22
                                 Virginia 5:9
urge 25:13 30:19 35:2 37:23
                                 virtually 149:23 157:19
 38:15 42:18 50:6 53:17 58:16
                                 vision 78:3
                                 vital 45:10 69:18 85:7 101:25
 116:9 164:23 179:2
urges 86:19
                                 vocal 56:11
                                 voice 48:3 60:6 95:12 116:19
urging 89:9 90:6
                                   157:19 160:16
use 22:9 46:7 97:14 100:6
 135:14,19 166:17 169:25
                                 voices 143:6,10
 175:12 178:16
                                 void 36:23
useful 105:19,24 154:11
                                 volatile 112:24
uses 135:10
                                 volatility 117:10
usually 147:23 177:21
                                 volt 96:23
utilities 44:2 59:20 96:10,11
                                 volume 22:4 107:19 148:10
                                   151:14 167:3
 97:10 98:12
utility 1:5 2:7 13:5 95:19 97:3
                                 volumes 35:10 149:25
 97:15,16 98:18 125:21,24
                                 volunteer 97:5 146:20
 126:3
                                 vote 61:12 73:23 89:9 171:4,6
U.S8:20 13:21,25 148:8 151:21
                                                 W
 152:19
                                 wage 71:10
U.S.A46:21
                                 wages 8:8
               v
                                 wage-earner 85:25
V18:4,7
                                 Wahl 147:19,20
```

```
week 41:5 67:9 159:16 174:10
waited 174:23
waiting 143:24
                                 weeks 40:15 112:8 146:22
walk 110:6
                                 Wegmans 154:24
                                 welcome 5:13 26:9 66:14 80:7
walking 181:17
want 4:9,13 6:5,12,23 7:2 32:24
                                  111:8 130:14,14 139:14 172:13
 33:9,12 38:13 55:4 63:13
                                 welfare 89:16 164:14,15
 66:16 70:2 74:8 76:17 79:13
                                 wells 107:17 131:10,14 136:16
 80:21 82:15 93:22 98:10 104:9
                                  136:25 149:12,13 153:9,10
 106:16 110:20 116:23 117:5
                                 went 26:11 76:3,11 81:12 87:15
 118:18 119:13 139:13,14
                                  103:11 174:4
 141:17 145:3,7 146:14 162:15
                                 weren't101:2 155:6
 162:16,17 168:13 172:17
                                 West 132:7,10,12
 173:10 174:15,23
                                 western 2:23 10:10 11:11 12:22
wanted 29:4 47:2 57:10 106:7
                                  13:7,11 14:12 15:17,25 20:25
 119:24 132:24
                                  21:3 24:15 31:4 43:20 46:12
                                  46:16 50:13 51:6 60:21 69:21
wanting 98:6 127:24
wants 12:19 30:7 32:10 68:14
                                  78:14,18 80:9 87:13 91:20
                                  104:19 105:6 108:17 118:5
 180:19
war 105:17 171:2 181:19
                                  119:21 122:5 127:16 130:8,23
                                  132:18,20 139:23 140:5,7
Warmbrodt 175:2,4
Warren 147:15 157:6 170:12
                                 Westfield 182:12
wasn't131:24 137:20 149:2
                                 wet162:8
 170:13 171:11
                                 we'll 44:17 67:8 79:3 82:21
waste 60:14 135:3,4,8,21,22
                                  99:20 114:22 126:4,7 161:3,4
                                 we're 2:4 3:11 4:12,21,25 29:2
 136:4 137:6 150:13,15,19,22
 151:13
                                  31:9 39:18 41:14 58:25 64:13
                                  65:21 80:21 92:5 99:19 100:6
watch 137:9,11
watchdog 43:25
                                  100:13,13,14 102:22 110:21
watched 105:22 110:6
                                  120:9 128:19 132:25 133:2
water 19:25 86:8 131:23 134:15
                                  136:15,18 137:9 142:15 153:15
 134:16,20 135:2,10,14,19
                                  164:13 167:18 170:16,20
 136:5,11,15 138:11,12 147:22
                                  171:22 172:20 173:15 180:16
 148:12 149:25 150:9,21 151:2
                                  182:19,25 183:2 184:8,9
 166:17 182:19
                                 we've 39:25 40:7,14,15,24 41:10
waterfront 125:8
                                  57:3,6 81:2 103:23,24,25
                                  107:2 114:23 154:8 169:20
waters 135:2,2 137:10
Watt's 166:11
                                  184:3,15
waves 52:12
                                 Wheeler 175:19
way 3:22 30:5 38:24 42:19,20
                                 wheeling 58:21
 51:16 53:9 54:14,18 72:2 75:6
                                 WHEREOF 185:6
 75:6 92:22 99:4 101:6 102:19
                                 white 103:21
 117:14,22 119:24 128:2 134:6
                                 wholeheartedly 121:3
 137:21 142:7 149:14 172:6
                                 wholly 148:20
 173:8,17 176:9 179:24
                                 widespread 37:11
ways 82:19 116:6
                                 wife 75:15 138:25 146:5
weak 43:9
                                 wild 13:14
wealthy 8:19
                                 Wilkinson 44:12, 18, 19, 25 45:2
weather 52:12
                                 Williams 1:10
web 3:13 66:4
                                 willing 35:21 181:8
                                 wind12:21 20:24 21:2,5 50:20
Wednesday 91:16
```

```
52:12 61:16,18 78:16 107:3,5
                                  132:5 138:6
 107:6,7 117:15 118:8 122:23
                                 worrying 181:19
 126:15,16 155:4 165:21 167:22
                                 worse 34:5 145:5 150:8
windmills 107:6
                                 worsening 52:9
window 59:10
                                 worship 172:14
windstorm 76:24
                                 worth 121:12
wind-generated 165:23
                                 worthless 90:15
                                 wouldn't 76:6 77:21 131:15
winning 141:16
winter 162:7
                                  138:4,6 155:10
wiped 11:8
                                 wow 76:4
wires 59:14 76:25
                                 write 147:24
Wisconsin 150:3
                                 writing 44:24 143:20
wisdom 64:22
                                 written 47:8 66:2 139:23
wise 156:5
                                 wrong 20:9
                                 wrote 143:22,23
wish 38:10
witch 156:6
                                 Wyoming 81:5
WITNESS 185:6
                                                Y
women 36:4 128:20,22
wonder 46:15 163:14,22
                                 yards 156:11
                                 yeah 65:9 136:7 171:12 174:13
wondered 131:25 142:23
wonderful 57:18,20 77:21 92:9
                                 year 8:15 14:23 17:9 65:7 69:15
                                  82:4 84:10 94:14,18 116:5
 148:16
                                  120:12 127:9 152:21 168:11
wondering 167:18
                                  169:3,23 170:2,4
word 106:25 131:7,8,22 132:24
words 57:23 106:9,12 156:6
                                 yearly 115:14
                                 years 7:22 11:22 14:25 15:6,11
work 6:8 11:22 12:21 18:11 64:6
                                  16:13 17:4 28:17 39:22 40:7
 64:15,15 65:13 68:12,16 75:5
                                  41:12 43:8 51:20,24 55:23,24
 75:8,16 81:2 82:17 85:18
                                  57:18 59:9 62:25 63:9,11,24
 88:16 89:14 91:25 94:19 95:22
                                  66:24,25 70:17 72:21 75:2,19
 98:6 106:20,20,20 127:21
 128:6 133:23 139:5 145:18
                                  81:9 82:2 87:11,19 88:10
                                  89:13 91:22 92:10 99:7,22
 151:25 158:19 162:20 176:16
                                  102:5 103:11,12,15 104:16
worked 63:23 99:7 103:24,25
                                  116:2,5 124:4 126:11 127:16
 114:24 139:4 170:22
                                  131:4,5 134:9 139:3 141:18
workers 28:5 49:24 50:2 53:3,19
                                  142:20 146:12,17,25 149:14
 62:2 95:8 97:3 99:8
                                  150:8 154:6 161:10 169:20
workforce 52:20 128:5
                                  170:24,25 171:8 175:8 177:5
working 39:16 48:2 52:10 62:22
                                  179:9 181:18 183:16,23
 89:24 99:20 102:8 121:9
                                 year's 12:3 53:13
 125:23,25 126:3 151:17 157:10
                                 Yelda 168:3
 158:6 182:18 183:2
                                 yelling 124:21,22
Works 87:18 88:9
                                 York 1:2, 11, 14 2:13, 23 10:10
workshop 87:15
                                  11:11 12:12,22 13:4,7,11 14:2
world 49:9 51:3 71:21 85:18
                                  14:13 15:15,18,18,25 17:14,19
 126:14,15 127:23 128:4 151:17
                                  17:24,25 18:7 19:13 20:25
 152:23 153:2
                                  21:4,10,23 22:5,13 23:3,16,23
worn 162:7
                                  24:6,11,15 26:15,16 29:20
Worombrandt 174:20
                                  31:4,5,8 32:16,19 33:20 35:21
worried 125:17 131:22,24
                                  40:3 42:7 43:20 44:6,7 45:19
worry 106:24 110:8 126:14,15
```

```
45:24 46:12,14,15,16 48:23
                                  53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1
                                  59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1
 49:4,20 50:13 51:3,6 53:7,17
 54:8,18 55:3 59:2,3,4,19
                                  65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1
                                  71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1
 60:22,25 61:3,7,22,23,24
 62:13 64:18 65:10 67:5,12,14
                                  77:1 78:1 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1
 67:16,20 68:2,4,19,22 69:3,4
                                  83:1 84:1 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1
 69:21 70:11 71:21 74:13,24
                                  89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1
 77:16 78:7,14,18 79:10,14
                                  95:1 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1
 80:9 86:17 87:14 88:19 89:7
                                  100:1 101:1 102:1 103:1 104:1
 91:20 92:3 96:9,25 97:20 98:4
                                  105:1 106:1 107:1 108:1 109:1
 104:19 105:4,6,24 108:18
                                  110:1 111:1 112:1 113:1 114:1
 111:13,18,19,20,24 112:24
                                  115:1 116:1 117:1 118:1 119:1
 113:4,5 114:3 115:17,18
                                  120:1 121:1 122:1 123:1 124:1
 116:25 117:8 118:5,17 119:9
                                  125:1 126:1 127:1 128:1 129:1
 119:10,20,21 122:5,5,10 123:2
                                  130:1 131:1 132:1 133:1 134:1
 123:2,3,9,11,14,23,24 124:4
                                  135:1 136:1 137:1 138:1 139:1
 124:15 125:18,22 127:16
                                  140:1 141:1 142:1 143:1 144:1
 128:17 129:18 130:8,23 132:18
                                  145:1 146:1 147:1 148:1 149:1
 132:20 134:4 137:22 138:7
                                  150:1 151:1 152:1 153:1 154:1
 139:23 140:5,8 141:7 142:6
                                  155:1 156:1 157:1 158:1 159:1
 144:3,13 145:16,23 151:15,22
                                  160:1 161:1 162:1 163:1 164:1
 157:5 159:18 163:13 165:5
                                  165:1 166:1 167:1 168:1 169:1
                                  170:1 171:1 172:1 173:1 174:1
 168:22 169:16,17 185:2
Yorkers 11:22 13:6,25 68:6
                                  175:1 176:1 177:1 178:1 179:1
York's 22:11 43:24 50:4
                                  180:1 181:1 182:1 183:1 184:1
young 4:22,25 5:4,5 25:16 26:21
                                  185:1
 29:4 61:11 62:10 71:7 91:4
                                 12223-1350 1:14
 92:23 143:3,25 149:17 168:15
                                 15 1 : 8
youth 72:2 104:4 164:5
                                 16th 180:21
                                 184 185:4
                                 19 55:3
Zachary 138:18
                                 1900 161:15
Zebrodsky 168:2
                                 1905 121:10
zero 20:7,11 123:24 154:9,15
                                 1950s 61:24
Zoar 132:21
                                 1962 87:20
                                 1972 132:12
               1
                                 1975 146:7
1185:3,4
                                 1977 103:20
11th 60:23
                                 1980s 129:20
115 175:5
                                 1982 129:24
12E0577 2:5
                                 1986 58:2
12-E-0577 1:7 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1
                                 1990 58:2
 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1
                                 1999 99:23
 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1
                                                2
 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1
 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1
                                 2nd 146:23
 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1
                                 20 132:21
 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1
                                 2000 13:18
 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1,6 46:1
                                 2000s81:4
 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1
                                 200323:14
```

Page 239

```
2005 173:25
                                  142:1 143:1 144:1 145:1 146:1
                                  147:1 148:1 149:1 150:1 151:1
2009 51:18
2010 8:20
                                  152:1 153:1 154:1 155:1 156:1
2012 18:2
                                  157:1 158:1 159:1 160:1 161:1
20131:8 22:22 42:9 60:23
                                  162:1 163:1 164:1 165:1 166:1
2014 56:19
                                  167:1 168:1 169:1 170:1 171:1
2021 14:23
                                  172:1 173:1 174:1 175:1 176:1
2023 61:4
                                  177:1 178:1 179:1 180:1 181:1
23rd 50:4
                                  182:1 183:1 184:1 185:1
24th 17:25
                                 7:001:9
                                 7:362:2
280 1:10
                                 7499 45:2
               4
                                                9
4070:12
                                 97 83:11
               5
5129:17 175:17,22
               6
61689:7
67 63:4
68 170:23
               7
7 58:2
7-15-2013 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1
 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1
 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1
 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1
 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1
 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1
 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1
 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1
 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1
 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1
 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1
 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1
 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1
 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1
 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1
 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1
 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1
 102:1 103:1 104:1 105:1 106:1
 107:1 108:1 109:1 110:1 111:1
 112:1 113:1 114:1 115:1 116:1
 117:1 118:1 119:1 120:1 121:1
 122:1 123:1 124:1 125:1 126:1
 127:1 128:1 129:1 130:1 131:1
 132:1 133:1 134:1 135:1 136:1
 137:1 138:1 139:1 140:1 141:1
```